OIDEION

The performing arts world-wide

edited by

WIM VAN ZANTEN
CNWS PUBLICATIONS NO. 14

CENTRE OF NON-WESTERN STUDIES
LEIDEN UNIVERSITY, THE NETHERLANDS

CNWS PUBLICATIONS is produced by the Centre of Non-Western Studies of Leiden University, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Editorial board: M. E. van den Berg; R. T. J. Buve; R. Kruk; G. van Loon; W. van der Molen; J. D. M. Platenkamp (chief-editor); W. J. Vogelsang; W. van Zanten.

All correspondence should be addressed to: Dr. J. D. M. Platenkamp, chief-editor CNWS Publications, c/o The Centre of Non-Western Studies, Leiden University, PO Box 9515, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands.

This volume was published in cooperation with the Nederlandse Vereniging voor Etnomusicologie, Arnold Bake
OIDEION
The performing arts world-wide

edited by

WIM VAN ZANTEN

1993
CENTRE OF NON-WESTERN STUDIES
LEIDEN UNIVERSITY
PO BOX 9515
2300 RA LEIDEN
THE NETHERLANDS
Oideion

Oideion: the performing arts world-wide / ed. by Wim van Zanten. - Leiden: Centre of Non-Western Studies, Leiden University. - Ill. - (CNWS publications, ISSN 0925-3084 ; no. 14)
Met lit. opg.
ISBN 90-73782-17-1
Trefw.: volksmuziek

Printing: Haveka, Alblaserdam

© Copyright 1993 The Centre of Non-Western Studies, Leiden University, The Netherlands.

Copyright reserved. Subject to the exceptions provided for by law, no part of this publication may be reproduced and/or published in print, by photocopying, on microfilm or in any other way without the written consent of the copyright-holder(s); the same applies to whole or partial adaptations. The publisher retains the sole right to collect from third parties fees in respect of copying and/or take legal or other action for this purpose.
CONTENTS

Editors’ preface vii

HANNE M. DE BRUIN
‘Texts’ and the authors of an oral tradition 1

MARJOLIJN VAN ROON
From Bandung to Berlin: The correspondence between Jaap Kunst and Erich Moritz von Hornbostel, 1923 to 1936 19

BOUDEWIJN WALRAVEN
Stirring sounds: Music in Korean shaman rituals 37

SIMON COOK
Parallel versions of tembang Sunda melodies in different tunings 55

CLARA BRAKEL-PAPENHUYZEN
Historical visual documents of Javanese theatre and dance; An evaluation of their usefulness 85

Book Reviews
Claartje Gieben and Jan Jizemans (eds), Music and dance in Surinam (RONALD F. SNIJDERS); Ad Linkels, Geluiden van verandering in Tonga (ELISABETH DEN OTTER); Gijs Schneemann, Kirêkat; Brieven uit Siberut (HENRICE M. VONCK); Rokus de Groot, Compositie en intentie van Ton de Leeuws muziek (GERARD VAN WOLFEREN); Ann Briegleb Schuursma, Ethnomusicology research; A select annotated bibliography (HEIN CALIS); Clara Brakel-Papenhuyzen, The bedhaya court dances of central Java (WIM VAN ZANTEN)

Record Reviews
Čalgija, Music from the Balkans and Anatolia #2 (HANS VAN STRATEN) 113
Reports

Jaap Kunst Foundation (GEURT BRINKGREVE); MA theses ethnomusicology (HENRICE M. VONCK); Ethnomusicology and world music in the Netherlands 1990-1992 (WIM VAN ZANTEN)

About the authors

Information for authors
in 1984 a group of Dutch ethnomusicologists and performing artists joined forces to establish a society, the Nederlandse Vereniging voor Etnomusicologie 'Arnold Bake'. Since 1986 it has functioned as the Netherlands Committee for the International Council for Traditional Music (ICTM). The members of this society meet on a regular basis, and a modest newsletter, Etnomusicologen Nieuwsbrief, containing short papers and reports, keeps them informed about the various activities that take place.

Much has happened in our field since 1984, and not only in Holland. The rise of world music may be considered one of the major developments in the musical life of today’s multi-cultural cities. Should the present-day ethnomusicologist remain a passive observer of these developments or should he participate, play an active role? Like many of our colleagues abroad we often wonder whether we should simply replace the term ethnomusicology by musicology, and world music by music.

By choosing the title Oideion; The performing arts world-wide, we obviously avoid the issue of terminology and wish to emphasize that the scope of Oideion is broader than music alone. It also includes dance and theatre from different parts of the world. Although Oideion aims at making the work of Dutch scholars accessible to a readership outside the Netherlands, it is by no means restricted to Dutch scholars. Others are also invited to submit articles, book and record reviews, and reports. See the 'Information for Authors'.

Without the support of the Centre of Non-Western Studies (CNWS), University of Leiden, Oideion would not have appeared so soon. We hope that their cooperation will continue for many years to come.

The Editorial Board:

Joep Bor
Saskia Kersenboom
Rembrandt Wolpert
Wim van Zanten
Abstract

Kattaikkattu is a folk theatre, which is performed in the northern parts of Tamil Nadu (South India). In this article the written expressions of the tradition consisting of palm-leaf manuscripts and printed chapbooks, their authorship and possible contribution to the dissemination of tradition, as well as the relationship between these written and oral Kattaikkattu texts will be discussed. The latter consist not only of words, but also of music. These two aspects of the oral texts will be analysed in greater detail in order to bring out the flexible handling of the oral material in the process of the production of an oral Kattaikkattu text.

Introduction

In this article I shall focus on texts and their oral and written production in a Tamil folk theatre called Kattaikkattu. In a literate society the word 'text' is almost always associated with something written. Literary (written) texts were, until recently, more important objects for the study of Indian civilization and languages (Indology) than the richly represented oral creations. One reason for the academic bias in favour of the study of written texts may be that these are more easily available and accessible than 'volatile', oral expressions, the study of which almost always requires elaborate fieldwork and knowledge of the spoken language. Besides, written texts have for a long time commanded a higher respectability, authority and 'truthfulness' than oral traditions. Fortunately, this trend has changed and oral texts have become the focus of serious academic attention.

An oral text has to be verbalized, that is, spoken or sung, to come into being and by its very nature this normally involves some amount of performance. Hence, studying oral texts requires one to look into the context in which these are produced and take into account the ways in which the context influences the text when being performed.

---

1 'Performance' is taken here in a broad sense and includes different degrees of verbal and physical involvement ranging from the telling of a joke in informal company to fully-fledged theatre performances, such as kattaikkattu, enacted in a (previously) arranged dramatic setting.
In the 1970s performance studies flourished in which the performance, conceived as a communicative event, occupied a central place, rather than the text and its linguistic features abstracted from the communicative process (see, for instance, Bauman 1977). Recently, this approach has been reversed and attention has shifted back to a more text-centered approach. In his book on Villuppâṭṭu or Bow song, another important Tamil performance tradition, Stuart Blackburn poses the question of how texts affect their performance. He rejects the claim that the meaning of a text lies only in its performance and turns the focus upon the existence and cultural value of the text outside its performance context (Blackburn 1988: Introduction). Blackburn’s description of the nature and production of Bow song performances will be taken here as a paradigm for comparison with several aspects of the Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu tradition.

In the following analysis the stand I take lies in between the two approaches. While Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu texts acquire their unique, audible form and meaning only when enacted, the texts in performance are not unexpectedly new, original products. The stories are known and their narrative content helps shape the structure of a performance. Moreover, audiences have ideas about and expectations of what a ‘proper’ Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu performance and its ‘text’ should include. If performers deviate (too much) from these ideas and expectations the performance will usually be a failure (Flueckiger 1988). I assume, therefore, that there is a kind of ‘blueprint’ of texts (and of performances) prior to their enactment. These texts are non-material, in contrast to those inscribed on palm-leaves or copied in notebooks. They are hypothetical, oral constructs which presumably exist in the minds of performers and, probably in a less elaborate and cohesive form, in the minds of the members of audiences which have traditionally been exposed to Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu. They form part of what I have called the ‘oral reservoir’ of the Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu tradition (de Bruin 1991:98).

The oral reservoir is a hypothetical construct as well. It forms the source of the tradition and contains the following elements which exist outside a performance context:

* verbal- and non-verbal material (the latter includes music, dance, mime, gestures, make-up and costuming);
* performance conventions and devices (strategies);

---

2 Assuming that ‘every text creates a community’ A.K. Ramanujan suggested to refer to such a group as the ‘textual community’. (International workshop series on folkloristics, Kodaikanal, June 18-July 7, 1990). This term would fit also the traditional kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu audiences which are created by and come to possess the kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu tradition to which the kaṭṭaiṅkūṭṭu texts belong.
* emotions or stimuli triggering emotions (such as possession or trance-like states) which fit into the culturally defined pattern of emotional reactions evoked during *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* performances.

Analogous to the Saussurean distinction in linguistics between *langue* and *parole*, the oral reservoir represents the system (*langue*) in which actual performances (*parole*) are based. The *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* tradition (Tā. *campiratāyam* < Skt. *sampradāya*) comprises the oral reservoir and its individual expressions in the form of plays enacted in and influenced by a live setting. See the scheme below.

### Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu campiratāyam

**Source:**

**Contextualized expression:**

From the audience's side influenced by:
- setting/occasion
- audience demands, expectations, moods
- demands of sponsors
- social changes

Empirical performance ('Live text')

From the performers' side influenced by:
- unity of company
- competence and authority of individual performers
- training
- remuneration, gifts

Though the oral reservoir includes all aspects of performance, I will limit the discussion here to the level of the text. I will be concerned with the process of how a sustained, 'live' text in performance is produced from the material stored in the oral reservoir.
Following from the treatment of 'text' as an oral expression Kaṭṭaikkuttu texts should be thought of as consisting not only of narrative, but also of music, which, like the verbal material, has to be made audible to acquire shape and meaning. On purpose I have tried, therefore, not to separate the verbal and musical elements of a text in performance, as unavoidably happens in the study of written texts. Both are important building materials used in the memorization and production of oral texts. While the verbal expression in Kaṭṭaikkuttu contributes to the creation and conveyance of the karuttu, that is, the 'meaning' or 'essence' of a play, the music is essential to invoke the appropriate mood or emotion (Skt. rasa) in which the karuttu of the play lies embedded (de Bruin 1991:99). This is clearly a simplification of a complex situation, because the contribution of dance, mime and gestures to the creation of meaning and mood of a text are not included. However, I think that the active involvement of the Kaṭṭaikkuttu actors in the production of narrative and (vocal) music - as compared to that of actors in other South Indian performing traditions, such as Kathakali, Kutiyattam, Yakshagana and Bhagavata Mela, in which the production of the narrative and/or songs is left to a background singer - justifies our focus on these two elements in the process of the creation of a live text in performance. Before turning our attention to this process we will take a closer look at written Kaṭṭaikkuttu texts, in order to get an idea of the relation between written and oral texts in the Kaṭṭaikkuttu tradition.

Palm-leaf manuscripts
Apart from oral texts contained in the oral reservoir, the Kaṭṭaikkuttu tradition also possesses material texts. I prefer to refer to the latter as 'scripts', because all of them are in written or printed form. The oldest of these scripts are probably texts inscribed on palm-leaves.

Tiru P. Rājakōpāl, an important exponent of the Kaṭṭaikkuttu tradition and leader of the Peruṅkaṭṭur Ponucāmi Nāṭaka Manṭram3, a professional theatre company whose history and performance tradition I studied in detail, owns about twenty palm-leaf manuscripts which, he thinks, belonged to his grandfather. An expert of the Madras Government Museum estimated these manuscripts to be no older than a 150 to 200 years. The manuscript collection was much greater, but many documents disappeared - eaten by vermin or taken away by other actors - or were lost when the family moved. The remaining manuscripts are not used (any longer) in the transmission of the tradition. Though I do not know if this attitude of indifference towards the palm-leaf manuscripts, which were tucked away in a smoky corner in the nook of the kitchen-roof, matches that of performers of other

3 The village of Peruṅkaṭṭur lies in the Cheyyar taluk of Tiruvannamalai-Sambuvarayar District in the north of Tamil Nadu.
groups, it differs markedly from the situation encountered in the Bow song tradition. Blackburn explains that in Villuppāṭṭu palm-leaf manuscripts are considered ritual objects, and that they can form the basis for performances (Blackburn 1988).

One of the reasons which performers of the Perunkaṭṭūr Ponṇucāmi Nāṭaka Manṛam, who are literate or semi-literate, gave for the fact that they did not use the palm-leaf manuscripts any longer was that they cannot read them. However, large parts of the texts can, with some difficulty, be deciphered. It seems more likely that the function of the palm-leaf manuscripts has been taken over by notebooks into which many of these palm-leaf texts have been copied. These handwritten notebooks are used as sources of reference and sometimes lent or sold to other actors who want to add a new play to their repertoire.

**Printed versions**

Another variety of material texts are the printed chapbooks. They constitute an enormous corpus of folk drama literature, estimated by Frasca to include between two to three hundred plays (Frasca 1984:150). Hiltebeitel thinks this estimate should be doubled (Hiltebeitel 1988:153).

The printing of plays started in the beginning of the nineteenth century (Hiltebeitel 1988:156). Because the printed versions do not include any stage directions or other descriptions of the performance, we cannot be sure that all of them were performed in Kattaiikkūṭṭu style. Possibly many of them were enacted as 'nāṭakams' or 'dramas', another popular performing genre in Tamil Nadu. With some alterations, several of the plays could be performed in either of the two styles, depending on the preference of a particular audience.

The printed versions of the plays, published by about eight small printing presses mostly based in Madras (Hiltebeitel 1988:155, footnote 17 and 18), are rather uniform in set-up and delineation of the story, basically in potu vacanām (general speech), vacanām (speech), tarus (songs) and viruttams (poetic verses). It seems plausible, therefore, that the source material - most probably consisting of palm-leaf manuscripts - was adapted and to some degree standardized to fit the expectations of a literate audience. The transition of these plays into print required,

---

4 The objective of my research was to describe the flexibility of kattaiikkūṭṭu texts. An in-depth analysis of the production of texts in performance required an association over a long period of time with one theatre group in particular in order to become familiar with its performance tradition (and eventual changes therein). Practices of other companies have been studied insofar as these differed from the tradition of the Perunkaṭṭūr Ponṇucāmi Nāṭaka Manṛam.

5 Some kattaiikkūṭṭu performers displayed the palm-leaf manuscripts during Ayuta pājā, the worship of those instruments and implements which are important for exercising one's profession, but there was no indication that the manuscripts were actively used in the transmission of the tradition.
rather than authors, such as Hiltebeitel suggests (Hiltebeitel 1988:156), editors who worked on the plays and made them available in a printed format. The possibility that these editors added their own contributions to the 'original,' or maybe even wrote new plays, cannot, of course, be excluded.

For reasons which are not very clear, Hiltebeitel, who focusses on Kaṭṭaikkūṭṭu in the context of the Draupadī cultus, singles out the name of Irāmaccantira Kavirāyar from the village of Irācānallūr or Irāyānallūr (Vandavasi Taluk) as an important clue in the development of the printed drama literature (Hiltebeitel 1988:157). At least three plays which occupy a central place in festivals in honour of Draupadī, 'Draupadī's marriage', 'The game of dice and the disrobing of Draupadī' and 'Arjuna's penance', are attributed to this author, which may explain Hiltebeitel’s preference. However, the name of Irāmaccantira Kavirāyar is totally unknown among the many performers I met. Though this may be the result of the eventual decline into anonymity of the authors of many plays - most chapbooks do not (any longer) contain an author’s name - as described by Hiltebeitel in his excellent overview of the growth of this genre, there seems to be no reason to attribute to this particular author a more important position than to other authors or editors of plays. And it certainly does not reflect the situation at the level of the actual Kaṭṭaikkūṭṭu tradition where the contributions (of which only some have been printed) of many (local) authors or vāṭṭiyārs, who often are remembered with reverence by the present Kaṭṭaikkūṭṭu performers and their audiences, are readily identified.

The repertoire of the Perūṅkaṭṭūr Poṇnucāmi Nāṭaka Manram in 1990 included twenty-three plays. The company’s repertoire has changed during the time-span of the three generations of Kaṭṭaikkūṭṭu performers which can be traced back by the present artists. While fifty years ago the troupe performed in both Kaṭṭaikkūṭṭu- and nāṭakam-style and had a mixed repertoire of epic and puranic stories, the present company, with the exception of one or two plays, performs exclusively in the Kaṭṭaikkūṭṭu style, and nineteen out of the total number of twenty-three plays carry stories from the epic Mahābhārata. Five plays were said to be based upon printed chapbook versions of which the authors were unknown. Except for 'Karṇa mōksham' which was attributed to the (mythical) Pukāḷentipulavar, the authors of the other plays belonged to the region where this and the other nine companies in the same taluk find their clientele.

With the exception of Kiruṣhaṇacāmi Vāṭṭiyār, who may be the same as Hiltebeitel’s C. Kiruṣhaṇacāmi Nayakar, none of the names of authors cited by Hiltebeitel matches those given by the performers (Hiltebeitel 1988:160, Table 5). From information provided by the descendants of two important local vāṭṭiyārs, Kalavai La. Kumārācāmi Vāṭṭiyār (1847-1910?) and his slightly older contemporary Kōṇamēṭai A. Rāmacāmi Mutaliyār Vāṭṭiyār, it appears that in the second half of
the nineteenth century when folk drama literature flourished, there was a healthy
competition between authors who produced their own versions of well-known
plays. Most of them probably wrote with a local audience in mind. Kumaracami
Vāṭṭiyār, who belonged to the village of Cenn养成uttiram near Kalavai (Arcot
taluk) was himself a Kattaiṅkūṭṭum artist. Rāmacāmi Vāṭṭiyār from Kōṇamēṭai near
Perunkaṭṭūr (Cheyyar taluk) did not perform but knew the Kattaiṅkūṭṭum style well.
Both authors wrote a version of 'Iranyā vilācīm'. To this day performers of the
Perunkaṭṭūr Ponnucāmi Nāṭaka Māṇiram use the songs and viruttams of both
Vattiyārs in their performances. As the two authors characterize the demon
Hiranya in a slightly different way, it is up to a performer to decide which charac-
terization an audience would like best. Alternatively, an accomplished performer
may sing songs of both authors in sequence to display his tiramaī ('competence')
to discerning members of the audience who are familiar with the Kattaiṅkūṭṭum
repertoire and are able to recognize the contributions of the different vattiyārs.

Another version of 'Iranyā vilācīm' (titled 'Śrī Pakta Pirakalātā') is performed
in Nārttevālkutikātu, a village near Thanjavur, which lies outside the present core
area of the Kattaiṅkūṭṭum tradition. According to the printed announcement, this
play has been staged in Nārttevālkuṭikātu for the last 304 years. The author of the
play was given as Karantai Kantacāmi Vattiyār, but Tiru P. Rājākōpāl, who attend-
ed the three-night performance, recognized several songs and viruttams that also
feature in Kalavai Kumāračāmi Vāṭṭiyār’s version. The latter was unknown to the
local performers of Nārttevālkutikātu.

This would imply that some textual versions or parts thereof covered a rather
large area. As the origins of Kattaiṅkūṭṭum lie in the dark, it is difficult to draw any
conclusions about the means of distribution and dissemination of texts. Did it
occur when versions of plays, until then the more or less exclusive property of the bearers of the Kattaiikkuttu tradition, were printed, and became available to a broader audience, or had it already happened before that time? For the northern parts of Tamil Nadu (that is, the present North Arcot-Dr. Ambedkar District, Tiruvannamalai-Sambuvarayar District and Chingleput-M.G.R. District) where I carried out most of my fieldwork, it is known that some songs in ter(k)ittu meṭṭu, that is, the southern style of singing found in the South Arcot District, were introduced in the northern style of Kattaiikkuttu, the songs of which are referred to as vilācam meṭṭu, by performers who migrated to these northern parts as the result of a famine. The migration of communities familiar with the Kattaiikkuttu tradition to other areas is, therefore, a likely factor contributing to the spread of songs, viruttams, and even whole plays. Dissemination may also have occurred through mendicant groups found, for example, among Panṭārāms, Tācaris, Jaṅkamars, etc. These groups led an itinerant existence and often combined their (religious) occupations involving certain aspects of performance, such as the singing of hymns accompanied by several musical instruments, with other performing traditions, among them the staging of plays and puppetry (see for example GoldbergBelle 1989:138 on Tolubommalāṭa in Andhra Pradesh).

Production of live texts in performance
The Nārttevānkuṭiṭāṭu performers are non-professionals, enacting only one play once a year. With the exception of the comic scenes, provided by a very versatile actor, they seemed to perform directly from a script, consisting of a handwritten text (possibly copied from a palm-leaf manuscript). This was held by a prompter who stood at the side just behind the curtain at the back of the stage. Other non-professional companies use printed chapbooks as the basis for their performances or hire a teacher from a professional group who rehearses a full-night’s play with the participants.

The performed texts often amount to a more or less faithful reproduction of songs and speech which the actors have learned by heart. Though I was not able to verify this, it would not be surprising to find that the performed texts of these companies closely follow the handwritten or printed script.

In the Bow song tradition the ritual setting occasionally requires a rendering of the text which is as close as possible to the authoritative (palm-leaf) script (Blackburn 1988:xxi where he refers to a performance consisting of a verbatim recitation from a palm-leaf manuscript). In amateur Kattaiikkuttu performances, however, the adherence to the scripted text seems to be due not so much to ritual requirements, but more to the insufficient grasp of amateur performers of the oral reservoir. They usually find it difficult to manipulate the narrative material to suit the demands of a particular audience. As amateurs normally perform only for their
'own audience' (that is, the village to which they belong) they can count upon a lot of good-will. For them it is not an absolute necessity, as it is for professional performers who have to make a living out of Kaṭṭaiṇkūtu, to tailor a performance to the wishes of different audiences. Moreover, performances of amateur-companies usually are not evaluated as critically as a sponsored performance of a professional company.

In contrast to amateur performances, the texts of professional companies - because of the way in which these are produced - differ considerably from the scripted versions. Actual performances are never literal reproductions of the script. In fact, the shape of a performed text of a particular play and the interpretation of the narrative material - which may show slight differences, for instance, because of a change in the cast of actors - results every time in an unique product. In the process of the production of the text in performance the written script plays a minor role and is at the most used to clear up doubts about a particular passage or song.

Even in those cases where the performers of the Peruṅkaṭṭūr Pōnnumucāmi Nāṭaka Manram said that their performances were based on a chapbook edition, there were a lot of differences between the script and the actual performance. In the scripted version the kattiyakkāran is introduced as a character, but his role is limited to that of herald9 and does not include the function of comedian. The curtain entrances so characteristic of Kaṭṭaiṇkūtu (see below) cannot be distilled from the scripted texts and the relevant songs are missing. Actual performances often include contributions of local Kaṭṭaiṇkūtu performers, usually in the form of songs, and episodes with local colour, such as the story about Karṇa's wife Pōnnumuruvī's descent in the play 'Karṇa mōkṣham' or Krishṇa's prediction that Karṇa will be reincarnated as Cīruttontar Nāyaṅār. These are not found in the printed versions and only some of this material is represented by the notebooks. This brings us to the question of how oral texts are produced during a performance of a professional Kaṭṭaiṇkūtu company.

Assuming that the oral reservoir contains blueprints of Kaṭṭaiṇkūtu texts, these may be conceptualized as consisting of a framework and a number of more or less flexible building blocks which can be inserted into the framework to build up the story. When a play is being performed the text is literally 'assembled' or 'woven' on stage by the actors who combine, recombine and manipulate material belonging

---

9 His 'official' function, as is reflected also by his name, is that of 'panegyrist' (kattiyam means 'panegyric'). It is possible that the roles of comedian and herald, which are now combined in the character of the kattiyakkāran, used to be performed by two actors.
to that part of the oral reservoir to which they have access. While doing this they have to take into account the conventions of the tradition, the specific requirements of a particular play (are there, for instance, any songs which are prescribed by the author of a play that should not be missed or replaced by an alternative song?), the mood, expectations and reactions of an audience, the demands of sponsors and the occasion of the performance.

The framework roughly consists of an opening phase, including a musical introduction, a middle part in which the story is presented, and a closing routine. The major structuring devices in the middle part are the entrances of the various characters, which in the case of kaṭṭai vēshams - that is, royal, divine or demonic, usually male characters - are elaborate, rather standardized events during which a sequence of songs interspersed with speech are rendered to introduce the character to the audience and help the actor to identify himself fully with his role. These entrances have been described in the literature as 'curtain entrances' (Frasca 1984:59-60, Frasca 1990:6), because while a kaṭṭai vēsham enters, a curtain is held up in front of the stage, behind which the actor enters and executes the first part of the song-sequence.

I have used the term framework here to refer, in the first place, to the basic structure of a performance. However, this structure also provides an interpretative frame, as described by Bauman, within which the communicative messages of a performance are to be understood (Bauman 1977:9-10). It identifies the communicative event as being an (artistic) performance, and 'calls forth special attention to and heightened awareness of the act of expression [as contrasted to an 'ordinary' communicative event, HMB] and gives license to the audience to regard the act of expression and the performer with special intensity' (Bauman 1977:11). Moreover, the specific characteristics of the framework, such as the structured curtain entrances, define the performance as being Kaṭṭaikkōṭtu and not another kind of dramatic event.

The building blocks form the main body of the oral reservoir. They contain the actual material of the tradition through which a narrative can be developed. Building blocks are found in many varieties (de Bruin 1991:115-118). In the following analysis I shall focus especially upon building blocks containing verbal and musical material, and upon the interaction of verbal and musical expression in

---

10 The English word 'text' is derived from a (Latin) root meaning 'to weave' (Ong 1982 (1985):13). The Sanskrit word sūtra - 'thread, string, rule' or 'a short sentence or aphoristic rule, and any work or manual consisting of strings of such rules together like threads' (MW 1241) - and the Tamil word nul - 'yarn, cotton thread, string', 'any systematic treatise' - and its verb nul- - 'to spin, to compose, as a poem' (TL 2326) - seem to refer, therefore, not so much to a collection of rules, but to the way in which these rules were composed or strung together in the form of oral texts which could be easily recalled.
the production of an oral text in performance. To facilitate the description I have divided the building blocks into the following categories: (1) building blocks in which verbal expression dominates, (2) building blocks in which verbal and musical expression are represented more or less equally, (3) building blocks in which music dominates.

The first category, building blocks in which verbal expression dominates, consists of vacanam or speech episodes, which may be of varying length. The vacanam moves along the formal-informal continuum, starting with literary Tamil containing sometimes rather archaic words that an actor may clarify by giving a synonym, via standard 'educated' Tamil to colloquial speech. In general, one can say that the most formal speech styles and the educated standard Tamil are used by the royal/divine characters, whereas the kattiyakkaran in his role of comedian and the various other characters taken from 'everyday life' use the colloquial Tamil spoken in the northern parts of Tamil Nadu. The kattiyakkaran, however, may also employ an educated standard Tamil, for instance, in his formal introduction of a play, whereas a royal character sometimes lapses into a colloquial speech style. Apart from the formality of the speech, the way in which it is delivered varies. Monologues and dialogues are somewhat more articulated than in ordinary ('non-dramatic') speech. Some portions of prose are recited instead of being spoken. Because of the use of alliteration and other forms of rhyme, these acquire a specific rhythm, which almost makes them sound like poetry. These prose episodes may alternate with song. Kattaiikkattu also knows a form of 'general speech' or potu vacanam which may be delivered by the kattiyakkaran as well as by any other actor who at that moment is not performing a (costumed) role. The potu vacanam may be spoken on stage or from behind the curtain which covers the back side of the stage. All types of vacanam referred to are often supported by the orchestra or melam (see below), and especially by the percussion instruments which accentuate the words of an actor.

The next category, building blocks in which verbal and musical expression are represented more or less equally, contains what one could describe as 'sung poetry'. The most important verse types are called pattu (or taru), viruttam, and kantarttam. Pattu can be translated as 'song' and may contain any number of lines. The song text is rendered by the actor on stage (munani), while the song lines are repeated by the background chorus (pinnani) which consists of actors

---

11 Though most performers have little or no formal education they use this speech style with ease and competence. Blackburn remarks that in the Bow song tradition 'formal speech varies from performer to performer, but each must use a language that gains the respect of his audience while staying within the range of effortless comprehension' (Blackburn 1988:21). The same holds true for kattaiikkattu performances.
who are (at that moment) not on stage. In some cases the munāni sings the first half of the line, while the second half is sung by the pināni (see also Blackburn 1988:11 on antiphonal singing in the Bow song tradition). The song texts vary from formal, often syntactically complex verses rich in formulaic expressions, to informal song texts in which colloquial expressions abound. A pāṭṭu is sung with full support of the mélaṁ, consisting of a harmonium, mukavīṇai (a small shawm), mṛḍāṅgam and dholak (played by one man) and two pairs of small hand cymbals. In other words, a pāṭṭu includes both rākam (melody expressing a particular mood) and tālam (musical metre). Though the rākams and tālams belong to the system of classical Carnatic music, they are not rendered in completely the same way. Musical metre occupies a very strong position in Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭu. It is a prerequisite for the (sometimes vigorous) dance and the binding element between musicians, background chorus and actors on stage through which the unity of the company is forged. Tālam is one of the first things a trainee has to get thoroughly acquainted with. The five tālams used most frequently in Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭu are āṭti, ata, rāpaka, tirupaṭṭai and jampai. Though the time to complete a full rhythmic cycle is the same as in the classical system, the aksharakālas or beats of the various tālams are divided in a different way (Frasca 1984:197-200). For example, in the classical system āṭti tālam (chaturasra jāti triputa tāla) has eight beats whereas the āṭti tālam of Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭu is counted in two or, in a higher speed, two cycles of three beats of the same duration followed by a rest resulting in a total of six audible beats (see Examples on the next page).

Rāpaka tālam (chaturasra jāti rāpaka tāla) in classical music has six beats, but is counted in Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭu in one or two beats or, for a high speed, five beats and a rest (see examples). Though the same terminology as in classical Carnatic music is used to refer to the different tālams, the names do not always indicate the same musical metre. For example, in Carnatic music jampai tālam, unless announced otherwise, stands for misra jāṭī jhampa tāla (7 + 1 + 2 = 10 aksharakālas), whereas the syncopated jampai tālam of Kaṭṭaiṅkūṭu (also referred to as ottu jampai) means khaṇḍa jāṭī jhampa or khaṇḍa chāpu (2 + 3 = 5 aksharakālas, in which the duration of the first beat is two time units and of the second beat three). In order to count the various tālams the colkaṭṭus or rhythmic syllables of the mṛḍāṅgam are used. The players of the hand cymbals can increase the speed of the aksharakālas to match the dance movements of an actor or just to 'adorn' the music in very much the same way as a singer beautifies a rākam with different alaṅkārams. The small hand cymbals are handled very lightly, though sometimes
vigorously, in order to produce these different 'rhythmical embellishments'.

Even if the high tempo and high pitch (and sometimes high octave) of a song, which are peculiar to some styles of Kaḷṭaikkāṭṭu, result in its words becoming indistinguishable, the performers maintain that the high speed of the ṭāḷam is necessary to illustrate the ferocious aspects of a character. The meaning of the song is often repeated and clarified in the vacanam which follows it. Ṭāḷam contributes, therefore, not only to the specific flavour of Kaḷṭaiıkkāṭṭu music, but also to the creation of meaning of a text.

\begin{quote}
Examples of ṭāḷam in classical Carnatic music
and in Kaḷṭaikkāṭṭu
(- stands for a rest)
\end{quote}

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{lllllll}
Classical music & I₄ & O & O \\
& (laghu) & (drutam) & (drutam) \\
counts: & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 & 7 & 8 \\
 Kaḷṭaiıkkāṭṭu & takka & tim & takkajuṇu & takka & tim & takkajuṇu \\
counts: & 1 & & & & 2 & & & \\
or & 1 & 2 & & & 3 & & 4 & \\
or & 1 & 2 & 3 & & 4 & 5 & & 6 \\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\begin{center}
\begin{tabular}{llllllll}
rūpakā ṭāḷam \\
Classical music & O & I₄ \\
& (drutam) & (laghu) \\
counts: & 1 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & 6 \\
 Kaḷṭaiıkkāṭṭu & takku & ta & ka & tīṃ & tīṅna \\
counts: & 1 & & & & \\
or & 1 & 2 & & & \\
or & 1 & & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 \\
\end{tabular}
\end{center}

\textsuperscript{12} The handling of the hand cymbals (also referred to as ṭāḷam) differs from company to company and depends also on the size and material of which these are made. The Perunkatṭūr Ponnucciṇi Nāṭaka Maṇṇṛṇam uses small bronze (veskalām) hand cymbals, which give a very light sound. Other companies use a bigger size of ṭāḷams made of steel (ekku), which produce a harsher sound and cannot be handled so lightly.
Viruttams are poetic verses which have rākam but, in contrast to the pāṭṭus, no tāḷam. A viruttam consists of four, eight or sixteen lines. In the style of the Perumāṭṭur Ponnučami Nāṭaka Maṇṭam the opening line (or lines) of a viruttam is (are) first rendered by the mūnṇaṇi accompanied by the harmonium and is (are) then repeated by the piṇṇaṇi, while the concluding line of a stanza is sung only by the mūnṇaṇi. This last line goes over into a musical and rhythmical interlude or jāt[i] including both rākam and tāḷam, which is performed by the complete orchestra. Kantārttam is a combination of pāṭṭu and viruttam. Because of the limited scope of this paper, this verse form cannot be discussed here.

Sung passages, and to a lesser extent vacanām, are characterized by an extensive use of rhyme. The performers refer to this phenomenon as yamunām, which is probably derived from the Sankrit term yamaka, meaning 'the repetition in the same stanza of words or syllables similar in sound but different in meaning' (MW 846). However, in the Kaṭṭaiakkāṭṭu jargon yamunām is not used in this specialized sense. It denotes rhyme, in particular middle and end-rhyme. 13

Though classical Tamil prosody knows an elaborate metrical system, most Kaṭṭaiakkāṭṭu pāṭṭus and viruttams rarely follow any such metre, as far as I have been able to analyse. Instead of metrical verses requiring building blocks in the form of adjusted formulae which fit the metre, (as for instance described by Milman Parry for Homeric poetry and Albert B. Lord for the Yugoslav bardic tradition; see Ong 1982 (1985):20-27), the Kaṭṭaiakkāṭṭu tradition uses rhyme to provide rhythm and pace to its verbal expression. Rhyme (yamunām) is more flexible than metre (yāppu), which requires a particular length and form of its constituents, and it can be used in both vacanām- and sung episodes. Moreover, rhyme facilitates easy recall of a passage.

The third category of building blocks in which music dominates consists of musical interludes which are generally performed in combination with dance movements or a particular action of a character. Basically, two kinds of building blocks are found within this category: functional musical interludes illustrating an action or setting a frame, and musical interludes which are used to fill a gap or to embellish a particular episode. An example of the first subdivision is the mēḷakkāṭṭu at the beginning of a performance. The mēḷakkāṭṭu, which frames the performance as Kaṭṭaiakkāṭṭu, is a musical introduction during which the five most

---

13 In contrast to Blackburn's finding that the 'Bow songs follow traditional Tamil poetry in their use of initial rhyme rather than end rhyme (which is very rare in any traditional Indian literature)' (Blackbum 1988:18-19) kaṭṭaiakkāṭṭu songs do have end rhyme, as well as initial rhyme (referred to in Tamil prosody as mōṇai, a term unknown to the kaṭṭaiakkāṭṭu performers) and rhyme in which the second letters of the line of a verse or of some feet of the same line are either the same or assonant letters (called etukai, a term used by some performers).
important tālams mentioned above are played by the orchestra. It is set in nāṭṭai rākam, a frequently used melody in Kaṭṭaikkātṭu. The mēlakkāṭṭu announces that the play is about to start and helps to set the appropriate (auspicious) mood for the performance. Other examples of functional musical interludes are the naṭṭai mēlam which indicates that a character moves from one place to another, the piyāṇṭu illustrating a sneaking movement of a character, 'snake charmer’s music' (called mōttu or makūṭi) which is used to announce the entrance of the snake Asvaceāṇaṅ in the play 'Karṇa mōkšam', the keṭṭi mēlam played during the auspicious moments of marriage and temple rituals, and the cāvu mēlam used in the context of funeral processions. Examples of the second subdivision, musical interludes used to fill a gap or to embellish an episode, are the tōmāṅam, a drum flourish concluding a tālam and serving at the same time as the base for the concluding dance steps of an actor, jatis connecting the verses of a viruttam, veku jāvalis played in between songs, and the different colkāṭṭu pāṭṭus (songs consisting of rhythmic syllables sung by the actor) illustrating small choreographies of, for example, characters such as Mohini (Vishṇu in female form), the child Prahlāda and Arjuna in his role as hermaphrodite.

Concluding remarks: Flexibility versus fixity of texts in performance
Looking at emerging, oral Kaṭṭaikkātṭu texts in performance produced by professional performers, we can say that one of their main characteristics is flexibility within bounds. The bounds are provided by the framework of a performance, the conventions of the tradition and the nature of the oral material itself. The flexibility operates at the level of the handling of the oral material which is rearranged and manipulated by the artists with great dexterity to suit the demands of different audiences, thereby fulfilling the important convention of professional Kaṭṭaikkātṭu companies that a performance should be kirāmmattīṁ iṣṭam - 'following the wish of the village (audience)'. The flexibility is also reflected in a preference for rhythm (tālam or musical metre) and rhyme (yamunam), which are less rigid than classical Tamil prosody and can accommodate words (or a change of words) with more ease. At the level of the individual performer, flexibility means that he composes his part of the text by making use of his prior knowledge of the common structure of performances and of the content of a particular play, and combines these with his competence to recall and handle on the spot the building blocks which are within his command, to develop and sustain the text in performance.

This conclusion seems to be opposed to that of Blackburn who found in Bow song performances 'more fixity than improvisation' (Blackburn 1988:xxi-xxiii, 24-
However, his finding may only be a different way of looking at the same phenomenon. Whereas I tend to stress the flexible handling of the constituting elements of the *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* tradition, especially the enormous number of building blocks, within a set framework, Blackburn appears to have concentrated on the form and contents of the constituting elements of the Bow song tradition, which may be (but not necessarily) rather fixed, and on the adherence to a scripted text. The *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* stories are familiar ones, which people have seen enacted time and again. What matters for *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* audiences is the manner in which the oral material is used to produce these stories anew. The value of the performance lies in skillfully handling the oral material to create the appropriate *rasa* (mood, emotion), which is essential to most Indian aesthetics, and in highlighting the *karuttu* (meaning, essence) of a particular play. The way in which a competent performer manipulates and interprets the (familiar) material and gives a role its unique shape and content provides the 'suspense'.

Textual fixity as a result of or prescribed by the ritual context in which the performance takes place, as Blackburn describes for the Bow song tradition, does not occur in *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu*. One likely reason for its absence is that *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* actors have to move around the stage, which makes the consultation of a scripted text and its verbatim reproduction rather difficult. In contrast, in the *Villuppāṭṭu* tradition, which is not such a fully-fledged theatre as *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* but more the dramatic telling of a story, the performers, who neither wear make-up nor costumes, are seated.

Like *Villuppāṭṭu*, *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* is in essence a sacred theatre. However, the ritual power and authority of its performances lie not in the adherence to a faithful reproduction of a 'recognized', scripted version, but in the verbal and physical impersonation by an actor of a particular role in order to establish contact with 'the world above' (de Bruin 1992). The implicit objective of commissioning a *Kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* performance is often to win the favour of a deity and enlist her/his help in obtaining material wealth, health or offspring. Ritual intensity expresses itself at certain moments in the performance in trance or possession-like states, which may occur among actors and members of the audience. Significantly, in the Bow song tradition this phenomenon is enacted by a separate - but obviously complementary - (group of) dancer(s) not belonging to the seated Bow song group. At slots in the performance which are characterized by extreme ritual intensity the

---

14 It is not clear what exactly should be understood by improvisation. If one defines improvisation as 'being composed on the spot using any (arbitrary) material and not adhering to any specific performing conventions' (de Bruin and Brakel-Papenhuyzen 1992:40), the phenomenon is hardly found in *kaṭṭaikkūṭtu* performances. However, if one considers the creative handling of traditional oral material as improvisation this word describes accurately the phenomenon of flexibility.
dancer or dancers become possessed by the deity or the hero of the story, while ordinary individuals from the crowd sometimes also join the dance (Blackburn 1988: Chapter 2).

References

Abbreviations:


Bauman, Richard

Blackburn, Stuart H.

Bruin, Hanne M. de


Bruin, Hanne M. de and Clara Brakel-Papenhuyzen

Flueckiger, Joyce Burkhalter
1988 'He should have worn a sari: A 'failed' performance of a central Indian oral epic', *The Drama Review* 117:159-169.

Frasca, Richard Armand


GoldbergBelle, Jonathan
Hiltebeitel, Alf

Ong, Walter J.

Transcription
1. Tamil words are transcribed according to the system followed by the Tamil Lexicon. The transcription of Sankrit words follows the conventions found in most Sanskrit dictionaries.
2. Names of well-known Tamil towns, taluks and districts are given without diacritics in the transcription one finds in most maps and in newspapers and other popular writing, for instance, Kanchipuram, Cheyyar taluk, Tiruvannamalai-Sambuvarayar District. Names of smaller villages and names of informants and theatre companies have been transcribed according to the conventions of the Tamil Lexicon, for instance, Perumkatíitur, P. Räjaköpäl and Perumkațiitur Ponucämi Nāṭaka Manram.
3. Familiar names and terms from well-known epic and puranic stories are given in their Sanskrit form, for instance, Arjuna, Prahlāda.
Marjolijn van Roon

FROM BANDUNG TO BERLIN: THE CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN JAAP KUNST AND ERICH MORITZ VON HORNBOESTEL, 1923 TO 1936

Abstract

This article presents some points raised in the correspondence between two of the most influential pioneers in the history of ethnomusicology: Erich von Hornbostel and Jaap Kunst. It is an unbroken communication from 1923 onwards until the death of von Hornbostel at the end of 1935, and it reflects strikingly the rise of the \textit{Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft} or \textit{Muzikale Ethnologie}.

As is to be expected, one of the more important themes of their correspondence is the cross-cultural relationship of instruments and music or even the cultural genealogy of their own existence. However, they do not attempt to tie every musical manifestation to the same umbilical cord; they hope to build a bridge between the different cultures with which they are confronted.

Thanks to the fact that Jaap Kunst preserved all Erich von Hornbostel's letters as well as copies of his own, a reconstruction of this important 'cross-cultural friendship' is possible.

'... Es wird sehr vieles im einzelnen zu berichten sein, aber selbst, wenn schliesslich kaum ein Stein auf dem andern bleiben sollte, so war es doch eine gewaltige Pionierarbeit. Wir müssten erst für alle Teile der Welt so sorgfältige Einzeluntersuchungen haben wie die von Kunst, Kaudern, Nordensköld usw., ehe sich eine wirkliche Kulturgeschichte bauen lässt.'

(Letter von Hornbostel to Kunst, 6 April, 1929)

\footnote{An earlier draft of this paper was presented at the thirty-sixth annual meeting of the Society for Ethnomusicology, 12 October, 1991 in Chicago. I started this presentation: 'It is thirty-seven years ago that Jaap Kunst crossed the Atlantic, working on his book \textit{Ethnomusicology}; several weeks later he wrote in his diary: "Chicago, October 1954". Now, I am very honoured to retrace his footsteps and to write above this paper: \textit{"SEM-Congress, Chicago, October 1991"}.'}

Hereby I would like to express my gratitude to those SEM-members with whom I found a sympathetic ear, when I presented this paper in Chicago and especially Dr. Wim van Zanten who supported me as a true colleague and guided me during this Congress.

\footnote{In detail there will be much to report, but even if, in the end, one were to leave hardly any stone unturned, it would still be an enormous pioneering work. First we should have a very accurate detailed research for all parts of the world, like those by Kunst, Kaudern, Nordensköld, and others, before a real cultural history can be created.'}
The correspondence archives of Jaap Kunst represent the continuing story of the birth and development of modern ethnomusicology. In 1989 Loekie van Proosdij and I started to explore this correspondence, kept at the University of Amsterdam. We soon discovered that we had found an immense treasure of information, more or less forgotten.

From 1920 up to his death in 1960 Kunst preserved all his correspondence, that is, the letters he received as well copies of his own letters. We studied the period between 1920 and 1940 which is covered by about twelve hundred dossiers containing more than ten thousand letters. A name and subject catalogue, and an index of this part of the correspondence has been made and we plan to publish this, thus making it available to a larger public.

Among the correspondents are several very well known names including von Hornbostel, Sachs, Lachmann, Schneider, Coomaraswamy, Herzog, Mantle Hood, Brandts Buys, Spies, Huizinga, Kusumadinata and Mangku Negoro VII. He had contact with people from different disciplines, from anthropology, from ethnology, archeology, from musicology, literature and history. Three-quarters of the material concerns matters in the field of the Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft or Muzikale Ethnologie as Kunst named it.

Not only does the quantity of dossiers and letters make the archives of Jaap Kunst unique. It is especially the development of thoughts and ideas, contained in this correspondence, which describe the adventure of a new field of research. Apart from the information one finds, reading about music and dance, one gets a clear notion of the historical, social and cultural background.

Three names are often mentioned together, namely: von Hornbostel, Sachs and Lachmann. They represent above all the ideas of German diffusionism and were the leading pioneers of the Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft. Many letters have been found in the archives of Jaap Kunst from these three Berlin scholars. A postcard from Sachs, who had just returned from a congress about Arab music in Cairo in 1932, testifies of the solidarity they felt with Kunst; one reads: 'Lieber Herr Doktor! Ich bin auf der Rueckreise von Aegypten. Hornbostel und Lachmann waren mit mir, und wir haben oft von Ihnen gesprochen. Herzlich Ihr Curt Sachs.' (Korfu, 11 April, 1932)

Of these three correspondents Erich Moritz von Hornbostel had the most intensive contact with Jaap Kunst. Their correspondence is in fact among all other dossiers of special importance. It lasted for only twelve years, from 1923 until von Hornbostel's death at the end of 1935, but it consists of a staggering two hundred letters, some of them ten to fifteen pages long.

The name 'Jaap Kunst' has become almost synonymous with 'gamelan'. In 1919, in the palace of prince Paku Alam VII, he heard the gamelan for the first time in his life and was immediately impressed by its beauty. It even inspired him
to stay in Indonesia. Originally he had come to 'Nederlandsch-Indië' as a violinist on a concert tour together with a pianist and a singer (who announced herself as *diseuse lyrique*). A lawyer by profession, he got a job in the civil service. He studied Indonesian music in his free time and earned some extra money by teaching the violin.

He adored the music of Bach, Schubert and Beethoven as much as that of Indonesia. Von Hornbostel wrote about the author Jaap Kunst (both quotations from von Hornbostel’s handwritten text: *Zum Geleit* which he sent Kunst to use as an introduction to *De Toonkunst in Java*, 1934; enclosure letter from von Hornbostel, 23 September, 1934):

'Schon auf der [sic] ersten Blick zeigte sich, dass hier ein sehr begabter, gut vorgebildeter und durchaus wissenschaftlich eingestellter Mann die aus den älteren Arbeiten von Groneman, Land und Ellis bekannten Tatsachen durch neue sorgfältige Beobachtungen und sogar Tonmessungen wesentlich bereicherte.'

... der Verfasser, dessen Wünschelrute die geeignetsten Stellen gefunden und dessen Tiefbohrungen so viele neue Adern entlossen haben, kann des Danks seiner Leser gewiss sein.'

The pan-pipe was the source of much inspiration for von Hornbostel, and the basis of his blown fifths theory. Von Hornbostel was a man fascinated by the search for the origin of mankind, especially in connection with musical and linguistic aspects. Starting as a chemist, he later became involved in *Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft*, partly through his interest in psycho-acoustics. When he started his correspondence with Kunst, he was already the custodian of the Berlin Phonogram Archives (from 1906).

He played the piano, loved Bach, Berlioz and Debussy and was a great jazz fan.

---

3 Because of its inaccuracy, I have slightly changed the translation of these quotations as given in the Introduction to the English version, 'Music in Java' (1973).
Plate 1: Erich Moritz von Hombostel
When von Hornbostel died in 1935, Kunst wrote in a memorandum about his Einmaligkeit, his unique and original mind in which Kunst saw a 'mengeling van geniale intuïtie en kinderlijke argeloosheid': a mixture of ingenious intuition and childlike innocence. Kunst stated that what von Hornbostel once wrote about his teacher Carl Stumpf was also applicable to the pupil, namely (memorandum 14 December, 1935, used for publication in several newspapers and magazines):

'We are through the rare combination of musical and philosophical talents, his whole work is determined by the continuous interaction of two essential features: his broad vision and his consciousness in relation to the facts.'

'Wie durch die seltene Verbindung musikalischer und philosophischer Anlagen ist sein ganzes Schaffen durch die ständige Wechselwirkung zweier Wesenszüge bestimmt: der Weite des Blickfeldes und der Gewissenhaftigkeit gegenüber den Tatsachen.'

'Eines Tages im Sommer 1921 ...' wrote von Hornbostel in the introduction to Kunst’s 'Music in Java' (1934/1949); 'one day in the summer of 1921 I received a heap of offprints' ('einen ganzen Stoss Sonderdrucke'). One of these interested von Hornbostel very much, namely a publication by Kunst in collaboration with his wife Katy Kunst-van Wely, an article about Bali (from Djawa II(3), 1922): gamelan tunings were described in detail and a first comparison was made between different tunings they had discovered in Bali. Accompanying diagrams demonstrated the results. The tone measurements were most useful to him, since he had already started to develop his blown fifths theory. In exchange he sent Kunst some of his own articles not yet describing his theory but already presenting the pan-pipe (Von Hornbostel 1907/1908). A scholarly co-operation was born.

In August 1923 Kunst wrote his first personal letter (Bandung, 8 February, 1923). It was a four page explosion on ethnomusicological subjects. He thanked von Hornbostel for sending the booklet and informed him of a feeling of 'festive excitement', because of this new exchange: 'Het ontvangen en lezen van artikels, handelende over onderwerpen, die mij zoo na aan het hart liggen, veroorzaakt steeds een gevoel van, ik zou haast zeggen, feestelijke opwinding.' He reported on the origin and etymology of the pelog and slendro tone systems, on Javanese flutes, on tone measurements of gamelans and on the scales used on these instruments.

---

4 Ninety-five years old, she died recently on 15 June, 1992. She supported Jaap Kunst until his death in 1960 and always kept his memory alive.

5 'Receiving and reading the articles, about topics so dear to my heart, always causes, I would say, a feeling of festive excitement.'
Plate 2: Jaap Kunst and his wife, Katy Kunst-van Wely, in the 1950s
He announced the publication of his 'Bali-boek' (De toonkunst van Bali I,II, 1925) ending his letter by asking for information about fixing phonograms. These are at least six of the many themes repeatedly discussed in this energetic correspondence.

Von Hornbostel replied in much the same excited way, although with even more words (Berlin, 8 October, 1923). He was very pleased to have found somebody 'an Ort und Stelle' ('on the spot'), doing the actual fieldwork for which others lacked the possibilities: 'Es ist meine feste Ueberzeugung, dass ein wirklicher Fortschritt auf unserm Gebiet nur durch das Zusammenarbeiten der Spezialisten erzielt werden kann, und wer, wie Sie, die beneidenswerte Möglichkeit hat, an Ort und Stelle Tonwerkzeuge und Musik zu untersuchen hat allein dadurch einen ungeheuren Vorsprung vor allen andern.'

He asked Kunst if he would like to contribute to the Sammelbände für vergleichende Musikwissenschaft by rewriting the section on Indonesian music. (The original text by J. P. N. Land, being out of date, was removed.) He was not sure, though, whether they would succeed in printing this, because of the 'Verhältnisse in Deutschland', meaning the bad economic and political situation. He continued his letter by introducing and explaining his blown fifths theory (two pages long) and answering Kunst on his questions concerning instruments and phonograms. He confirmed that the Berlin Phonogram Archives was prepared to galvanize Kunst's phonograms, provided that the institute would be allowed to keep copies of these 'Galvanos'. Advice followed on the recording of music, the maintenance of wax cylinders and some remarks on slendro and pelog, after which the letter ends with: 'In ausgezeichneter Hochachtung, Ihr sehr ergebener E. Hornbostel'.

Typical of this correspondence is the fact that Kunst wrote in Dutch and von Hornbostel in German: they needed no translation. Moreover, their understanding was to go far beyond that. Their letters are not only interesting because of all the purely factual information contained therein, but also, and perhaps even more so, because we can follow their struggle in formulating thoughts and opinions.

This contact between the two pioneers in many ways strengthened their belief in ethnomusicology as a science, and guided their thoughts about many topics. The unifying principal of their convictions was: cross-cultural, border-crossing, general human behaviour.

For Kunst the 'what' and 'where' had top priority, making him concentrate on

---

6 'It is my firm conviction that real progress in our field can only be achieved by the co-operation of specialists. Someone who, like you, has the enviable possibility to study instruments ('Tonwerkzeuge') and music on the spot, has only, for that reason alone, a lead over all others.'

7 Erich von Hornbostel very often signed without 'von'. Also his colleagues and friends often refer to him as 'Hombostel'. Nevertheless, when I omit his first name, I prefer to be unambiguous and to use his full surname 'von Hornbostel'.

---
the musical products and other material culture: hence the need for much fieldwork and the associated reporting. Von Hornbostel concentrated more on the 'how' and 'why' of it all and thus studied the general psychological and physical behaviour that stands behind man's musical actions. Together they craved to solve the mysteries of the human musical past, or as von Hornbostel stated: 'Wir möchten die fernste, dunkelste Vergangenheit entschliefern und möchten aus der Fülle des Gegenwärtigen das Zeitlose, Allgemeine herausschälen': to uncover the remotest, darkest past and to unveil, in the wealth of the present, the ageless, the universal in music (Hornbostel opera omnia 1975:269). When he explained his theory about the cycle of blown fifths to Kunst, he said: 'Ich möchte glauben, dass es der Ursprung aller Instrumentalleitern der Welt ist und jedenfalls heuristisch wertvoll, um in der Chaos Ordnung zu bringen.'

(8 October, 1923). To create this order, to find system and structure, they went endlessly into the problems of etymology and the analogy between instruments and music, and even into the cultural genealogy of their own existence.

The migrations in the trans-Pacific and the parallels between Africa and Indonesia were constant topics of conversation. After having read an article about Africa, sent by von Hornbostel, Kunst was struck by the fact that he already knew some of the instruments mentioned, because he had seen them in Flores; he remarked: 'Is het niet merkwaardig, dat West-Flores zooveel pendants van Afrikaansche speeltuigen oplevert?' ('Isn't it curious that West Flores produces so many pendants of African instruments?'). He found resemblances of the drums described, with 3 to 4 legs carved out of the lower end of the block, central-hole flutes, sets of pipes (under the name of hoi), bamboo-resonating instruments, kemanaks and a 'hooked beater', a drum with stick (10 September, 1933).

Von Hornbostel formulates his thoughts, for example, about the influence of instruments on the voice technique: 'Die Fanfarenmelodik ist nicht ausschliesslich an Panpfeifen gebunden: sie könnte sich ebenso aus der Ueberblastechnik ander Instrumente ergeben, wie das alperische Jodeln ja wahrscheinlich vom Alphorn kommt, also von einem Trompeteninstrument.'

(6 April, 1929).

In these examples one recognizes the comparative musicologists. However, they had enough sense of proportion and self-criticism to poke fun at themselves or to make things sound like a joke. For example, in a serious report about children's

---

8 'I would like to believe that it is the origin of all instrumental scales of the world, and in any case of heuristic value in bringing order into chaos.'

9 'The "Fanfarenmelodik" [melodic pattern resembling the succession of tones created by overblowing, MvR] is not exclusively connected with pan-pipes; it could also have emanated from the overblow technique of other instruments, as the "yodel" singing in the Alps probably stems from the Alphorn, that is, from a kind of trumpet.'
songs in Nias, which, according to Kunst, had obvious slavonic features, he remarked: ‘en vervuilde Leo Tolstoi’s ziet men er trouwens allerwegen rondloop-en.’ (‘and, mind you, everywhere you see shabby Tolstoy’s walking around.’) (19 May, 1930). Von Hornbostel laughed at himself in connection with a new hypothesis: ‘der Wievielle mag es wohl sein’, referring to how many hypotheses he had already stated. However, he thought it necessary to raise hypotheses, ‘sei es auch nur um sie ab zu lehnen’, if only to reject them (7 December, 1927).

The most striking issue of their correspondence is the theory of the cycle of blown fifths. This abundant material, stored in the archives of Jaap Kunst, published and unpublished, can serve historical research in two ways. First of all, it has a descriptive, purely informative function. Secondly, it serves to clarify the facts and theories of those pioneering days. This last function is very important in connection with von Hornbostel’s theory.

There is a constant dialogue concerning this matter, supported by innumerable tone measurements. In fact Kunst became a kind of intermediary for von Hornbostel, publishing details about the theory about the cycle of blown fifths even before he did so himself (but with permission). Kunst liked to systematize: one of his creations was the Windroos (compass-card), a graphical drawing to demonstrate the tonal relationships of the cycle (7 February, 1925):

Hierbij in sluit ik een grafische voorstelling van den Blaaskwintencirkel, waaromheen enkele der meest typisch congruerende schalen zijn uitgezet. Ik geloof, dat men op deze wijze iemand het snelst een juist inzicht in deze materie kan geven.

This is characteristic for the way in which Kunst worked. He was not a man to create theories; he was occupied with the practical side of it all, assembling facts to fit them together into patterns. He honestly believed in parallels between the musics of the world and tried to find proof for that, but in the first place he fought for the recognition and protection of non-European music. Even before he knew von Hornbostel, he had already made tone measurements on instruments in an attempt to describe a piece of the cultural historical background of Indonesia.

Von Hornbostel had done some fieldwork, but was mostly dependent on people like Jaap Kunst who lived and worked within the cultures they studied. Being the conservator of the Phonogram Archives in Berlin, he had access to a huge assembly of recorded music from all over the world, but he realized that he missed the experience of direct contact with the different cultures. He was, however, a great
thinker and it is striking that, when reading the correspondence of Kunst and von Hornbostel, one often feels urged to quote von Hornbostel's formulations of thoughts, while in Kunst's letters one enters daily life and gathers the facts.

Both viewpoints presented in this correspondence are significant. I think, though, that where the blown fifths theory is concerned, the information given by the letters of von Hornbostel is especially indispensable in the discussion on German diffusionism, and in correcting the image one often seems to have concerning von Hornbostel's ideas.

This background information is all the more necessary because von Hornbostel, unlike Kunst, always hesitated to publish his works and did not leave much printed matter behind when he died in 1935. He once asked Kunst to take care of those manuscripts he thought worth publishing, in case he died. Kunst indeed organized bringing together his friend's writings and managed to prepare an *Opera omnia* for publication, but somehow this never materialised in print, apart from the edition of a single bilingual volume after his own death.10

After reading von Hornbostel's letters, I am sure he was often misunderstood. Much has been written and spoken about the ideas of the German diffusionists. According to some critics, they mixed intuitive and hypothetical thinking with statements of facts. On the other hand, someone like Alan Merriam shows his esteem for people like Sachs and von Hornbostel when he says: 'Their formulations are based upon more reliable information more cautiously applied' (as compared with others). Merriam also quotes Melville Herskovits who believed it was useful to reconsider diffusionist ideas, provided: '1) that the area selected for analysis should be one whose historic unity can be assumed, and 2) that the probability, not the absolute fact of historic developments, be recognized as the aim.' (Merriam 1964:290; Herskovits 1948:521) Without hesitation, I dare to suggest that both Kunst and von Hornbostel would have agreed with Herskovits.

Just to show you how the letters can shed light on hot items like these, I shall use von Hornbostel's very first letter to Kunst of 1923 as an answer to Manfred Bukofzer who, as Bruno Nettl formulates it so dynamically, 'explodes' the blown fifths theory (Nettl 1983:230). Bukofzer's allegations are perhaps more deeply engraved on the marble stones of our pioneering history than the careful explanations of the theory by von Hornbostel himself; even more so and maybe especially because of the fact that Bukofzer was chosen to write an article about it in the encyclopaedia *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart* (MGG 1969[1949], 'Blas-

---

10 A complete version of this *Opera omnia* appears to be kept in the Handboekerij of the Royal Tropical Institute in Amsterdam (KIT). We only found a part of Kunst's own copy in the University of Amsterdam.
Let me just quote some remarks from this encyclopedic article together with some quotations of von Hornbostel’s letter to Kunst, explaining the theory.

**Bukofzer (1969[1949];1920):**

'Die Behauptung, dass die Blasquinte eine konstante Grösse sei, ist akoustisch nicht haltbar, sie ist im wahrsten Sinne des Wortes aus der Luft gegriffen...Die Blasquinte ist tatsächlich variabel innerhalb einer sehr grossen Schwankungsbreite, die von der Mensur der Pfeife abhängt.'

'I have assumed a constant reduction of the blown fifth. In reality the depreciation is not absolutely constant, but depends on the pipe dimensions.

**Von Hornbostel (8 October,1923):**

'Ich habe eine konstante verkleinerung der Blasquinte angenommen. Tatsächlich ist die Vertiefung ja nicht ganz konstant, sie hängt von der Rohrdimensionen ab.'

Von Hornbostel stated that the system is an ideal assuming a constant factor of reduction, and that this ideal (as most ideals!) can be reached only by accident.

The conflict here is of course a difference in formulation: if one 'assumes', one doesn't say 'it is'. Von Hornbostel provided a scheme in which a line of thought about the origin of tone systems is modelled following the idea of possible generic relationships. It was meant as a rough outline in spite of all the elaborate tone measurements.

Bukofzer also misunderstood the assumption of an absolute pitch of the Huang Chung, the Chinese 'yellow bell' or pitch-pipe, which von Hornbostel used as his  

---

11 Manfred Bukofzer also corresponded with Jaap Kunst. Their correspondence started in May, 1936, with a letter from Bukofzer who also sent Kunst his article: *Präzisionsmessungen an primitiven Musikinstrumenten* (in Zeitschrift für Physik*, Band 99*, Heft 9,10). He announced a next publication about von Hornbostel's theory: *Zur Frage der Blasquinte in den exotischen Tonsystemen*, which was later published in *Anthropos* 32 (1937), 'Kann die "Blasquintentheorie" zur Erklärung exotischer Tonsysteme beitragen?'. Bukofzer's MGG-article (1969[1949]) appears to give a summary of this.

I deliberately did not quote from of the Bukofzer-Kunst correspondence, because the problem stated here is the contradiction between a well-known source versus an unknown or unpublished source. One may read Kunst's answer to Bukofzer in his publication 'Around von Hombostel's theory of the cycle of blown fifths' (Amsterdam, 1948).
hypothetical Asian tuning fork:

Von Hornbostel:
'Ich habe nun als Hoang dshung 732vd (entsprechend einem Fuss von 230 mm) angenommen, was bei dem elenden Zustand der chinesischen Metrologie einigermassen willkürlich war ...'

Bukofzer:
Der Huang chong ist nicht 366 Hertz, wie Hornbostel angibt, sondern nur ca. 358 Hertz.'

'I have assumed that the Huang Chung is 732vd [octave of 366 vibrations per second or 'Hertz'] (corresponding to a foot of 230 mm), which was, taking into account the lamentable condition of Chinese meteorology, a bit approximate ...'

Bukofzer's statement 'the Huang Chung is' next to von Hornbostel's 'assume the Huang Chung is'. Besides, von Hornbostel wrote - after underlining the fact that the theory is only an ideal - that 'bei der Wahl des Ausgangston 732 leicht um ein paar Schwingungen daneben gegriffen worden sein kann', that is, 366 Hertz may be off by a few vibrations.

It is possible that Bukofzer (and others with him) by analysing thus the apparent facts, not taking into consideration their relativity, has caused misunderstandings about the underlying idea. Here the critic himself is the one who confuses hypothetical theory with the physical facts. (Whether these facts are right or wrong is not the issue here.)

Simple as the demonstrated difference in formulation may seem to be, the consequence has been a prejudice against von Hornbostel and a total rejection of his theory without the consultation of the real source: the written evidence of von Hornbostel's own thoughts in this matter. Another important factor is probably the fact that Jaap Kunst continued to make tone measurements, testing the theory without the illuminating dialogues he formerly had with its creator. The model stayed, but the ideas behind it faded away. Moreover, others wrongly changed the resulting facts into indisputable truths, which rightly elicited criticism.

It seems to me that the Bandung-Berlin correspondence can be a decisive factor in understanding von Hornbostel's propositions to map the regions of musical migration. One thing in particular could symbolize his ideas: the foot.

Man appears to have used his limbs to measure his surroundings. Being part of him, a foot, arm or thumb could bring the world back to human proportions. Afterwards he systematizes this, and the Chinese foot, for example, becomes a
standard of 23 cm. This is what could well have happened to the blown fifth.\textsuperscript{12}

If one has two different pipes and one wants them to be somehow in proportion, the shorter pipe is tuned to the first overblown tone produced by the longer one (both pipes closed at one side). So rather than the pitchpipe itself, the blown fifth, being a natural phenomenon, is like the 'foot': it measures sound.

Turning to the psychological side of cultural relationships: in a letter to von Hornbostel (31 July, 1925), Kunst mentioned his never-published essay about synaesthesia and remarked: 'Voor de eenheid van indrukken, vooral die van gehoor en gezicht, heb ik mij altijd sterk geïnteresseerd...Het verschijnsel synaesthesie is blijkbaar algemeen menselijk: de Voor-Indische goden lachten helderwit...; clarescunt sonitus in the Aeneis; Die Glöcklein laüteten rosenrot, zegt een oud Duitsch volksliedje; de Nederlandsche taal kent... schaterend licht, een donkere alt...\textsuperscript{13}:

'Pre-Indian gods laugh "bright white" and the Dutch talk about a "dark alto voice"'.

The exchange of challenging thoughts and theories went together with the exchange of an enormous amount of factual material. Books, articles and phonograms were mailed; pictures of instruments from past or present (such as on temple reliefs), or even instruments themselves, were sent as tangible evidence. When, for example, Kunst was not able to send a photograph of kemanaks from Bali, he sent a pair 'in natura' to von Hornbostel: 'Een afzonderlijke foto van de Bali'sche kemanaks (goemanaks) heb ik niet. Maar ik zend U met deze zelfde mail een -. overigens iets anders gevormd, o.a. gesteeld - stel goemanaks van Zuid-Bali (desa Tihingan bij Kloengkoeng) in natura toe, die u mogelijk...kunt gebruiken.'

\textsuperscript{12} Von Hombostel believed that also a 'metrical' cycle of fifths had been created (measuring the length of blowing pipes), which was probably rejected or not used in practice, at some stage. In his article 'Die Massnorm als Kulturgeschichtliches Forschungsmittel (in Festschrift für Pater Wilhelm Schmidt, 1928) he suggests that this cycle existed before a more practical one, like the cycle of blown fifths, which would have replaced it. Later, however, he changed his ideas and mentioned the following possibilities in one of his last letters to Kunst (12 May, 1935): '1. Der BQZ ist älter, der metrische erst von den Theoretikern eingeführt und dann neben oder statt der BQZ verwendet; 2. Der metrische QZ ist älter, und erst in der Praxis durch den bequemeren BQZ ersetzt worden. (Der könnte sogar erst ausserhalb Chinas bei Völkern geschehen sein, die keinen Massstab und keine Längenmessung kannten); 3. = 1.+2., d.h. der BQZ hat zu allen Zeiten bei der Praktikern vorgeherrscht...und zeitweise in den gelehrten Kreisen durch den metrischen QZ ersetzt worden, ganz analog wie es mit den bequemen Körpermassen (Fuss, Fingerbreite,...usw.) und der normierte Massen der Fall war. Diese letzte Hypothese ist mir persönlich die wahrscheinlichste.' The last hypothesis inspired my explanation of the theory, which, I must stress, is only meant to encourage a certain way of thinking.

\textsuperscript{13} 'I have always been very much interested in the unity of impressions especially of hearing and sight (...) Synaesthesia apparently is a general human phenomenon: The Pre-Indian gods laugh "bright white"...; clarescunt sonitus in the Aeneis; "Die Glöcklein laüteten rosenrot", reports an old German folksong...; The Dutch language knows a "roaring light", a "dark alto-voice".'
(17 August, 1925)\textsuperscript{14}. It is not only about the form of the kemanak, we also learn about its name and its original location. In the following letters the origin and etymology of this Balinese percussion instrument would often be the subject of speculation by both of them. An amusing detail is that, when they at last met in 1927, von Hornbostel, in order to be recognized by Kunst, welcomed him at the Berlin station with the kemanak in his hands.

After some years they addressed each other no longer as 'Sehr geehrter Herr Doctor' and 'Hooggeleerde Professor', but as 'Lieber Freund' and 'Beste vriend'. Their letters became more intimate and they shared sorrows and doubts. Kunst sighed with regret, describing a performance of Indonesian music (17 August, 1925):

\begin{quote}

\textit{I do not have a separate photograph of Balinese kemanaks (goemanaks). But in the same mail I’ll send you a pair of goemanaks from South Bali “in natura”, which you can possibly use; they have a slightly different form, mind you; namely, these are constructed with stems (desa Tihingan near Klunkung).}
\end{quote}
'Het is wonderlijk, maar, verkeerende als eenige Westerling te midden van dit diep religieuze, gelukkig levende, zich vrij en harmonisch voelende, volk, had ik soms het gevoel, de mindere te zijn; het armzalige gevoel: aan dit alles heb jij geen deel, van dit schoons, deze levensharmonie ben jij, door ras en maatschappelijke omstandigheden uitgesloten.'

'It is curious, but sometimes I felt the lesser, being the only Westerner present in the middle of this profoundly religious, happily-living, free and harmoniously-feeling people; the miserable feeling: you have no share in all of this. By race and social circumstances you are excluded from all these beautiful things and this harmony of life.'

It is this respect for the other cultures that made them very careful in their observations and conclusions. Recently Ali Jihad Racy wrote an excellent article about the already mentioned congress - concerning Arabic music - which took place in Cairo, 1932 (Racy 1991:68). He described the attitude of the comparative musicologists - among them the three correspondents of Kunst: von Hornbostel, Lachmann and Sachs - which was diametrically opposed to that of some of the Arab delegates. The latter would have liked to incorporate the achievements of Western classical music into the theory and performance practice of Arabic music. They considered the Western tradition to be on a high level, which they too would like to reach. The Europeans tried to warn them that they did not regard their classical music traditions to be 'better' or 'higher' in development, and they judged some of its effects on other cultures disastrous. Von Hornbostel remarked, according to Racy, that the replacement of the Arab violin by the Western instrument was virtually complete in Islamic countries. Although some believed it would be an improvement in tonal color and fullness, von Hornbostel considered it a mistake. He was convinced that Western technique, vibrato, and worst of all, sentiment was being introduced with the instrument (Racy 1991:85).15

Comparing cultures was not meant to lead to a hierarchy whereby the Western tradition would hold the most significant place. People like von Hornbostel and Kunst tried to build the bridge between their own culture and others and, as the extensive title of one of Kunst's lectures read: 'Durch den Vergleich der indonesischen Musik mit der europäischer, hinsichtlich der Melodik, Harmonik, Rhythmik und Tonsysteme, wird versucht dem abendländischen Zuhörer die Bedeutung der indonesischen Tonkunst klar zu machen ... ', by comparing Indonesian and

15 These remarks of von Hornbostel (and Lachmann and Sachs) may be found in a report, published in the Zeitschrift für Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft, Heft 1:16 (1933): 'Zum Kongress für arabische Musik-Kairo, 1932'.
European music ... trying to explain the significance of Indonesian music (see letter Kunst: 7 October, 1927).

The loss of tradition caused by Western influence was a significant topic. Both men devoted themselves to the preservation of non-European music: Von Hornbostel with his Phonogram Archives in Berlin and Kunst with his collection in Bandung and later in Batavia. They sent each other several lists of recordings and contents of the collections.

Sometimes there is a sense of optimism when it concerns a change of tradition. Very striking is a remark by von Hornbostel about jazz music, after attending a concert in Berlin (letter of 19 July, 1926):

'... these people used the notated music only as a scheme for their improvisations. The treatment of the wind instruments (saxophone, trombone, trumpet) is priceless and often funny beyond description. The rhythm is still 'Black rhythm' and the harmony is rich with respect to inventions. It all fits so much into our time and is so fresh and lively, that I would like to believe that from here really new musical developments will emerge in the near future.'

Jazz as the inspiration of a new musical development, he also stated in a following letter: '... in diesen Dingen liegen Keime einer neuen Musikentwicklung (die über Stravinsky hinausführen würde, besonders auch im Rhythmischen); ’... in these things one finds the seeds of a new musical development (going beyond Stravinsky, especially concerning rhythm)’ (23 February, 1927).

One could not have expected that political power would destroy this optimism, calling jazz music 'Entartete Musik'. Obviously, Hitler had other ideas about cultures and their differences. The Hochschule für Musik, to which the Phonogram Archives were attached at that moment, stated in 1933: 'Was gehen uns die Neger an ... ', and they banned the Archives (see letter, von Hornbostel, 24 July, 1933).

Von Hornbostel, who had a Jewish background, had to leave Germany in 1934, like his Berlin friends Sachs and Lachmann and so many of his other colleagues (and correspondents of Kunst!). After a short while in New York (as a professor at the 'University in Exile') he went to live in London. Because of his poor health he
was unable to survive these events and he died in November 1935. This put an end to a correspondence that would have been even richer and more extensive had it continued.

As early as 1930, von Hornbostel asked Kunst to look after his spiritual inheritance in case of his death. It is as if he sensed the unhappy events of the future. The tragedy is that, as I mentioned before, only one bilingual volume of the *Opera omnia* was published, although many more were planned.

I sincerely hope that this paper about the Bandung-Berlin correspondence may stimulate the publication of the other volumes of von Hornbostel’s *Opera omnia*. Maybe one could add to it this inspiring correspondence, to honour both Erich Moritz von Hornbostel and Jaap Kunst.  

References

Bukofzer, Manfred
1937 'Kann die 'Blasquintentheorie' zur Erklärung exotischer Tonsysteme beitragen?', *Anthropos* 32:402-418.

Herskovits, Melville J.

Hornbostel, Erich Moritz von
19-- *Opera omnia*, Vol. 1-4, edited by Jaap Kunst. [unpublished manuscript to be consulted at the 'Handboekery' of the Royal Tropical Institute, Amsterdam].
1922 'Phonographierte Tunesische Melodieen' 1907; 'Notiz über die Musik der Bewohner von Süd-Neu-Mecklenburg' 1907; 'Ueber die Musik der Kubu' 1908; reprint in: *Sammelbände für vergleichende Musikwissenschaft* 1.
1933 'Zum Kongress für arabische Musik-Kairo 1932', *Zeitschrift für Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft* 1:16-17.

---

16 Hereby I would like to thank the family of Jaap Kunst for their support and for allowing me access to the documents of Jaap Kunst.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1934</td>
<td><em>De toonkunst van Java</em>.</td>
<td>Den Haag: Nijhoff.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1925</td>
<td><em>De toonkunst van Bali</em> 1,2.</td>
<td>Weltevreden.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract
On the basis of an extensive survey of the use of music in trance rituals throughout the world, Gilbert Rouget has formulated a general theory concerning the relation between music and trance, whereby he concentrates his attention on two factors: the music and those who enter into trance. The present article, through a description of Korean mudang rituals, offers additional material for the debate opened up by Rouget, and suggests that in certain cases it may be helpful to take into account a third factor, the audience.

Introduction
The congested, modern metropolis of Seoul, with its ten million inhabitants, is surrounded by mountains, most of them not very high but too steep to allow building on the slopes. People wanting to escape from the bustle of the city, with its unceasing traffic din, may find some quiet there. No more than a ten-minute climb up one of the paths leading to the top of one of these mountains, the noise of cars is reduced to a distant murmur and you may perhaps hear the clear sound of a flute played by a boy perched on a rock. On almost every mountain of any importance in and around Seoul - near places where the Mountain God is worshipped - one may also hear the throb of drums and the clang of cymbals. To the accompaniment of these instruments, every day of the week, women called mudang perform rituals there, in the course of which they become possessed by gods and spirits.

What is the function of the music which is such an indispensable part of these rituals? That is the question to be addressed in this article, whereby particular attention will be paid to the relation between music and the possession trance of the mudang. The general theory about music and trance developed by Gilbert Rouget (Rouget 1985) will serve as the point of reference in this undertaking.

The mudang
The mudang (typically, but not always, female) are religious specialists who perform rituals to obtain wealth and happiness for their clients, to cure illness and to lead the spirits of the dead to a 'good place' (that is, Paradise). Behind these
rituals lies the concept of a world of gods and spirits close to man, which constantly influences human society. But man, too, may influence gods and spirits: the mudang are able to communicate with the invisible world on behalf of their clients and in this way may persuade gods and ancestral spirits to grant blessings and protection.

In English, the term shaman is commonly used to refer to the mudang. This usage is debatable; the answer to the question whether the mudang can be called a shaman seemingly depends on the content one chooses to give to the concept of shamanism (Walraven 1983; 1985:1). The mudang is certainly not a true shaman according to the well-known definition of Eliade, that is, a religious specialist who employs the technique of ecstasy for voyages to Heaven and the Underworld (Eliade 1974:22). For the mudang, contacts with other worlds are not the result of a spiritual journey to the regions where deities or the dead dwell, but of the 'descent' of gods and spirits into her own body: that is, not of ecstasy, but of possession. Personally, I feel that a more inclusive definition of the shaman as a religious specialist acting on behalf of others, who derives his or her authority from a personal experience of direct contact with divine powers, and is able to reestablish this contact at will by entering into a (culturally defined) state of trance, is useful for comparative purposes. In this sense, the mudang is a shaman.1

The rituals of the mudang follow a fixed pattern. First of all, through song and dance, the mudang invites the deities to attend. When this invitation is accepted, the deity will 'descend' into the mudang and speak through her mouth. Generally, he will first make disparaging remarks about the sacrifices offered and complain about the lack of devotion of those present. Then, satisfied with the offerings or mollified by promises of more, he will pledge help and protection. The words the gods speak by borrowing the mouth of the mudang are called kongsu. The behaviour of the mudang when she transmits this kongsu varies in accordance with the character of the god who has descended into her. One god, for instance, will be boisterous, greedy and fond of meat and wine, another a strict vegetarian and teetotaller of restrained and dignified demeanor. The identification of god and mudang is also expressed in the clothes the latter wears: before each part of the ritual she changes into the clothes befitting the god to be worshipped (often military uniforms from the past, because many of the gods are deified generals). After a deity has spoken, there is again singing and dancing, this time to express gratitude and to bid farewell.

1 The issue is complicated by the fact that there are considerable regional differences in Korea. In certain regions hereditary mudang, who do not have an initiatory experience, predominate. In this article, attention will be devoted primarily to the rituals of the mudang of central Korea, who conform to the definition of the shaman as given.
The spirits of the deceased manifest themselves in a similar way. Usually they begin by complaining about the solitude of death or their premature departure from the world of the living, making bitter reproaches to those left behind. Then, in a dialogue with their surviving relatives, ancient and recent grudges are talked over and resolved. Finally, when the spirits have been pacified and freed from all resentment, they go away to a 'good place,’ promising support for the living.

A full ritual consists of a succession of 'scenes' with this structure, each dedicated to a separate god, and may take a day to perform, or even longer. Whether a ritual is long or short, however, mudang never work alone, but always in teams of at least three or four. They take turns dancing and singing; meanwhile the others are charged with the musical accompaniment or provide assistance in various other ways.

The clients of the mudang - like the mudang themselves - are mainly women (cf. Howard 1991). They seek a ritual solution for a great variety of problems to do with the family, inexplicable bad luck in business, persistent illnesses of members of the family (including the men and the children), childlessness, obnoxious step-children and drunken husbands. Rituals are not for the benefit of single individuals, but for the family as a whole. Sometimes they are performed for a wider community, such as that of the village.

Music
Such rituals as described above are unthinkable without vocal and instrumental music. The mudang sing invocations, prayers, songs to entertain the gods, or narrative songs (often relating the origin of a particular god) and they dance, all to the musical accompaniment of instruments like the drum, cymbals, the gong, the Korean shawm (p'iri), the transverse flute (taegüm) and the two-string fiddle (the haegüm, also called kkaengkkaengi in onomatopoeic imitation of its nasal sound). Only rarely are all these instruments heard at the same time. In many instances the musical accompaniment consists of nothing but percussion instruments, a drum, cymbals and a gong. This might be explained as a modern development - in recent years there has been a trend to simplify and shorten the rituals. But more likely, in the past, too, much as it does now, the number of musicians depended on the scale and lavishness of the ritual. In a painting by Shin Yun-bok (mid-18th c.), a dancing mudang is backed up by two musicians only, a drummer and a p'iri-player.

Without doubt, the most important instrument is the changgo, an hourglass-shaped drum, which is almost never lacking. In certain regions the puk, a simpler
Plate 1: After the god (a spirit general, hence the sword) has descended, he speaks borrowing the lips of the *mudang*, while a believer, rubbing her hands as a sign of humility in the presence of the deity, listens to the divine words. Ritual of a *mudang* originating from Hwanghae Province; Seoul, 1975.

Plate 2: The drummer of the same ritual, with (on the chair) the *p'iri*-player, in front of an altar table and pictures representing the gods worshipped by the *mudang*. 
cylinder-shaped drum, may be used instead. The *changgo* is widely used in other genres of traditional Korean music, but nevertheless it is the *mudang* attribute *par excellence*, as a different kind of drum is the most essential attribute of the Siberian shaman (Findeisen/Gehrts 1989:126-136). In both cases, the drum is more than simply a musical instrument, all kinds of traditions and symbolic meanings being attached to it.

A particular shaman song of the Korean East-Coast describes the career of a *mudang* (Walraven 1985:175-189). Part of this song relates how the *mudang* obtains her drum. When she is making the mandatory rice cake - which in Korean rituals is used both as offering and 'bread of communion' - the neighbours' dog gobbles it up in an unguarded moment. The poor animal is beaten to death and its skin is used to make a *changgo*.

- She fixed the skin to the barrel of the drum
- Made of the wood of the Paulownia tree.
- When it is struck once,
  - The *mudang* of this world dance.
- When it is struck twice,
  - The *mudang* of the nether world dance.
- When it is struck thrice,
  - In the palace the royal *mudang* dance,
  - In the villages the village *mudang* dance.

In another narrative song it is suggested that the protagonists are able to reach Heaven by making drums and performing a ritual with them (Akamatsu and Akiba 1937:409).

The importance of the *changgo* to the *mudang* may also be seen in some of the life-histories of *mudang* recorded by academic researchers. When the sister-in-law of Yongsu’s Mother (the most important informant of the American anthropologist Laurel Kendall) dreamt that Yongsu’s Mother hit the *changgo*, this was regarded as a clear indication that she would become a *mudang* (Kendall 1988:98, 114). Another time, after they had witnessed an unsuccessful initiation ritual, Yongsu’s mother told Kendall what should have occurred had the gods really descended into the candidate *mudang* (Kendall 1985:66):

- She should have been dancing like crazy. Descended people wave their arms and dance whenever they hear the hourglass drum [italics added, B.W.]. They shout out, 'I'm this god, I'm that god.'

---

2 A curious instrument which may occasionally take the place of the *changgo* is the *koritchak*, a wicker basket with which a scratching sound is produced (Murayama 1932: 615). This is used for minor prayers, but also proved useful when the repression of shamanism made it impossible to use such loud instruments as normal drums. Its sound, reputedly, is suitable for calling the spirits of the dead.
The sound of the drum is identified with *mudang* ritual, both in Korean proverbs\(^3\) and in the experience of the *mudang* themselves. 'Let’s hit the drum and start dancing. Then we’ll feel good,’ says Yongsu’s Mother when she impatiently waits for the ritual to begin. Kendall emphasizes the link between the sound of the drum and possession, adding: ‘The drum sounds stir up the spirits and open the way to possession’ (Kendall 1988:73).

Right at the beginning of a ritual, the sound of the drum and cymbals ‘awakens’ the gods. The cymbals announce that a ritual is to be performed to the gods of heaven, the drum to the gods of the earth, one source says (Kim Su-nam et. al. 1983:86).

Not all instruments are played by the *mudang* themselves. Wind and string instruments, in particular, are usually played by professional male musicians, in the past often husbands of *mudang*.\(^4\) The cymbals and the gong may be played by women who are not regular *mudang* themselves. But the *changgo* is nearly always played by a *mudang*, one more indication of its special position among the other instruments. It should be added that there are also sound practical reasons for not leaving the *changgo* to a relative outsider. Because there is no definitely fixed routine for the ritual, the drummer and the *mudang* who sings and dances have to be well attuned to each other.

While the *changgo* is the first and foremost musical instrument of the *mudang*, others, too, have an important function in the ritual. The cymbals (*chegŭm* or *para*) are often used as support for the drumming, and their shrill, vibrating sound is apparently considered particularly appropriate to invite a god to descend into a branch or long stake (a kind of antenna to 'receive' the god). When the god descends, the branch begins to shake and in certain cases the god eventually takes possession of the person who holds the stake (Kim Su-nam et. al. 1983:99 and 1985:44-45). The cymbals seem to be associated with movement between the separate realms of man, the gods and the dead, for they also have an important function in a ritual to guide the spirit of a dead person along the way to the other world, while a ritual to bring the spirit of someone who has drowned from the sea to the site of worship is called *chegŭm kut*, 'Cymbals Ritual’ (Kim T’aegon 1981:316 and 86).

Gongs are found in two sizes: the more common and sonorous big gong is called *ching*, the smaller one, much more shrill and aggressive in sound, bears the

---

\(^3\) For instance, 'Like a *mudang* with a broken drum' (an image of utter dejection), 'An inexperienced *mudang* blames the drum,’ and 'Like drumming when the ritual is over’ (to refer to something that comes too late in the day to be of any use).

\(^4\) In the Southern regions of South Korea and along the East-Coast, where most of the *mudang* inherit their profession, their husbands still take care of the musical accompaniment.
onomatopoeic name of *kkwaenggari*. Both are said to be suitable for calling down and entertaining the gods (Murayama 1932:615).

The *mudang* song quoted earlier points out the connection between musical instruments and the gods (Walraven 1985:186).

The way we *mudang* strike the *changgo* is not striking it at random;
We strike the *changgo*
For the Great God of Heavenly Thunder.
As for striking the *gong*
We strike the *gong*
For the Great God of Earthquakes.
As for striking the *kkwaenggari*
We strike the *kkwaenggari*
For Kwangmok Ch’onwang.
As for striking the *cymbals*
We strike the *cymbals*
For Pibi Pisang Ch’önwang.

This passage should not be taken to mean that these instruments are used for the gods mentioned only - that would be certainly incorrect -, but as an affirmation of a special link between music and the gods.

The *pang’ul* are a separate case, seven little bronze bells fixed to a handle, and which are sometimes regarded as a general *mudang* attribute and not as a musical instrument (Akamatsu and Akiba 1937:225). This is different from other instruments in that the *mudang* who dances and sings holds it herself, and moreover uses it while she speaks the words of the gods when the other instruments are silent (Kim Su-nam 1983:90). Their sound reaches to the gods in heaven and draws their attention to the prayers of man (Murayama 1932:614). They are also said to repel evil and attract benevolent gods (Akamatsu and Akiba 1937:225). 'If these bells sound three times, the Three Disasters and the Eight Misfortunes disappear,’ says a *mudang* song (Walraven 1985:187-188).

**Possession**

What is the exact nature of the possession of the *mudang*? If one expects clearly visible physiological changes in the person possessed, one may doubt if it is correct to speak of possession in the case of the *mudang*. After she has become possessed by the gods, the *mudang* does not fall into a swoon, and in general she

---

5 According to the description of a *mudang* ritual in Kangwŏn Province, possession set in with the shaking of the *pang’ul* and this shaking gradually extended to the entire body of the *mudang* (Kim T’aegon 1981:77).
is perfectly able to remember what happened while in that state. During her possession, the behaviour of the mudang changes according to the character of the descending god, but it does not get out of control. No assistants are needed to restrain her or prevent her from hurting herself.6

The question whether physiological changes accompany possession is, however, of limited importance. The possession of the mudang is first of all a culturally defined concept shared by the mudang and her clients. There can be no doubt that they believe that the gods and spirits descend and that their actions are governed by this idea. Without the assumption that gods and ghosts can possess the mudang, the mudang would have no authority and for the clients the ritual would be without meaning. Whether possession involves experimentally demonstrable changes in the body of the mudang or not, is of no concern.

Although possession is not marked by obvious physical changes, there are certain signals to indicate that a god descends. When this happens, the dancing of the mudang changes - together with the rhythm of the drum - and she begins to jump up and down in one spot. Once she is in a state of possession, she is able to perform certain unusual feats: she manages to maintain a precarious balance on the thin rim of a jar filled with water, dances and relays kongsu while standing on the sharp edge of a pair of big knives used to cut straw, or lifts with her teeth a heavy copper vessel to which a two-meter high construction of small wooden tables has been tied. This, they say, is only possible when one is 'inspired by the gods' (shin param-e). Impressive as these things sometimes may be - especially when performed by frail ladies well past seventy -, these signs of possession are less violent and less bloody than those of the dang-ki in Singapore, who climb ladders of swords, take hot coals in their mouths, pierce their flesh with iron pins and endow amulets with magical power by smearing them with their blood (Elliott 1955). The essence of the possession of the mudang lies elsewhere; it is in the opening of the 'gate of words' (malmun), which allows verbal communication between man, gods and spirits.

More violent forms of possession are not entirely unknown in Korea. When this happens it almost always concerns possession of non-mudang or of persons who are about to become mudang. In regions of Korea where the mudang are hereditary and do not become possessed themselves, spirits of the dead descend into one of their relatives during a ritual (Yi Du-hyun 1988:172-174). Then it may happen, for instance, that a daughter-in-law, thus possessed, rages like mad for half an hour,

---

6 For exceptions - and that is what they are - see Park Il-Young 1988:409 and Howard 1991:78. In the first case the pang'ul were used to awaken a mudang who seemed to have lost control of herself.
Musical Example: An example of the change of rhythm that occurs when the mudang is possessed by a spirit, from a ritual by shamans originating from P'yongyang. The rhythm of the drum is noted on the upper line, the second line presents the corresponding, but simpler rhythm of the cymbals. Registered in Seoul, December 1991.

smashing everything within reach (verbal information, A. Guillemoz). At an initiation ritual for an aspiring mudang, one researcher noted, this woman moved violently from left to right, 'like a metronome,' while she danced. She seemed to be completely unaware of what she was doing, 'waking' from this state only when the dance was finished (Kim Su-nam et. al. 1983:100, cf. the photograph on p. 27). Sometimes a person who is destined to become a mudang will spontaneously become possessed while watching a ritual as a spectator. This happened to Yongsu's Mother, the mudang mentioned earlier. Customarily, at a certain moment during a ritual the women in the audience are invited to put on the costume of one of the gods and dance, which will bring them luck (Kendall 1977). When they do so, they are also supposed to be possessed by the god whose clothes they have put on, but this possession is usually quite undramatic. The women follow the pattern of the dancing of the mudang, finishing by jumping up and down like a possessed mudang, but that is all. With Yongsu's Mother things were different (Kendall 1985:59).

...I put on the clothes [of one of the gods, B.W.] and right away began to dance wildly. I ran into the shrine, still dancing, and grabbed the Spirit warrior's flags. I started shouting, 'I'm the spirit warrior of the Five Directions,' and demanded money. All of the women gave me money. I ran all the way home. My heart was thumping wildly. I just wanted to die like a crazy woman.

In this case dancing, of course accompanied by music, unleashed a form of trance possession characteristic of the mudang in the early stages of their career. One should not forget, however, that precisely in the phase when a person is about to accept a vocation as mudang, there is also possession in which music is not involved at all.

Mudang and Siberian shamans have in common that the gods force someone, through illness, to accept the role of mediator between man and the gods. The person suffering from this illness will not recover until he or she obeys the
command of the gods. Koreans believe that a refusal to do so is not only dangerous for the patient, but also for the relatives whose life will be put in jeopardy. A similar concept is found in Siberia (Findeisen/Gehrts 1989:74). The illness of the mudang-to-be is often characterized by a general lethargy, painful joints and a variety of rather vague, psychosomatic complaints. In many cases the patient keeps to his bed for weeks, hardly eating or drinking. Then, in the final phase, there is a radical change. In a typical case, the sufferer jumps out of bed, leaves the house without care for proper attire, runs around as if mad and predicts the future to anyone who happens to be passing. 'The gate of words has been opened;' the gods have descended. If this behaviour is recognized as an authentic sign of possession, in the days which follow, people will gather in front of the house of the mudang and beg her to tell them what the future has in store for them.

At this stage the new mudang still has much to learn - how to conduct the rituals, the songs, the music, the dancing - but she has already established a certain authority. In the quote given above, an important detail is the giving of money to Yongsu's Mother. During rituals the audience present money to the gods. The fact that the women give Yongsu's Mother money means that they are convinced that she is not an overwrought, neurotic housewife having a fit of hysteria, but an authentic vessel of the gods.

It can hardly be accidental that possession takes its most violent form when it is not part of the expected course of things, when it does not concern the fully-fledged mudang, but the mudang candidate, or ordinary people who are assigned the role of medium during a ritual. The established mudang does not have to demonstrate her authority in this way. Not only does she already have authority, she is able, moreover, to strengthen it by a display of her professional skills: by her dancing, by her vocal and musical achievements, by her histrionic talents (which she uses to involve the audience in the ritual), and by her ritual savoir-faire.

In short, the possession of the mudang is generally mild in nature and not characterized by obvious physiological changes. Nevertheless, it can be most effective. This shows most clearly in that part of the ritual where the spirits of deceased relatives appear and the confrontation with the dead unleashes powerful emotions. I witnessed a ritual of this kind in the summer of 1988 in a small shrine in Seoul. The ritual was performed for a man who had died at the age of 45. Except for the mudang, the man's wife, two daughters, a daughter-in-law and two other relatives were present. First the mudang was possessed by the goddess who leads the spirits of the dead to the site of the ritual. Then she danced for a few minutes, until the drum changed rhythm and the first spirit appeared. 'It's grandmother!' In an intimate gesture the mudang pulled the women towards her and made them sit in a half-circle around her on the floor. The younger women leaned
especially close to her, so as not to miss a word she said. Everything looked so 
natural, there was such an atmosphere of intimacy between ‘grandmother’ and the 
others, that for a neutral observer it was hard to believe that this was not a true 
reunion between relatives meeting after a long separation.

When this was over, the mudang put on men’s trousers and a man’s jacket over 
her other clothes and danced again, until the rhythm changed and the father 
appeared. All the women started to cry and sob, with father joining in. Eventually, 
they calmed down a bit. A somewhat stylized, but long and emotional conversation 
followed between the father and the women who were sitting around him on the 
floor, before it all ended with a last farewell. When the ritual was finished, all 
emotions seemed to have been spent in this cathartic encounter.

To question whether possession in such cases is authentic (since it is not 
accompanied by physiological or physical changes, such as convulsions, swooning 
or foaming at the mouth) seems to me to be missing the point entirely. Possession 
as the mudang and their clients understand it undoubtedly ‘works,’ and enables 
them to perform a ritual that is both meaningful and satisfactory.\footnote{For a discussion by a psychiatrist of the psychotherapeutic effects of mudang ritual, see Kim Kwang-il 1988.}

The Function of Music in the Rituals

The function of music in the rituals of the mudang is manifold. Drum and cymbals 
announce the beginning of a ritual, a very tense moment, for the gods, thus 
startled, may attach themselves to anyone near and do him harm (Kendall 1985:4). For that reason, everyone except the mudang must leave the house when the drum 
is first struck (even dogs and other animals are removed from the scene). In the 
parts of the ritual that follow, the gods are invited to attend with music and dance, 
and when they have accepted the invitation, dancing, songs and music are used to 
entertain them. From time to time, music is also used to scare away evil infulences. In the course of every ritual there is divination, to check if everything is 
proceeding well. One method is trying to balance a whole slaughtered pig (one of 
the offerings) on the prongs of a trident. If this fails, there is a deafening explosion 
of noise: all the percussion instruments are beaten as loudly as possible to drive 
away unlucky forces. The most dramatically powerful, exciting music generally 
accompanies those parts of the ritual in which impure and evil forces are chased 
away.

Obviously, music plays a role throughout the ritual, not just in those parts where 
possesion occurs. But does it have a more specific function with regard to the 
descent of gods and spirits? With Rouget we may reject the notion that music 
(especially that of the drum) brings on a state of possession in the mudang through
a purely neurophysiological process. Too many different kinds of instruments, with totally different acoustic properties, are used in trance rituals world-wide, to lend plausibility to the supposition that a particular sound by virtue of its sonority alone could trigger trance (Rouget 1985:75-78). We have seen, moreover, that in Korea, possession without music does occur, while the convulsions that should be induced by drumming, according to the ‘neurophysiological hypothesis’ (cf. Rouget 1985:172-176), are not observed in mudang rituals.

Of course, the special link between the mudang and the drum is suggestive, but this does not necessarily imply a direct, physical relation between possession and music. One obvious explanation for the association of mudang with the drum is that the changgo is the most important instrument for accompanying dancing. To dance, after all, is one of the most basic activities of a mudang. Significantly, critical remarks about colleagues who do not possess the skills of the fully-fledged mudang often take the form of criticism of their dancing: ‘They just jump up and down a bit.’

There is no need to deny the effect of percussion instruments on the human spirit entirely. Drums and cymbals may have a liberating effect, may help us to get out of the straightjacket of daily preoccupations. This phenomenon is certainly not confined to religious rites - let alone possession ritual - but the fact remains that such an effect is well-suited to certain forms of ritual. To transcend the limitations of everyday life is the very purpose of a mudang-ritual. The seemingly inexorable flood of sorrow and anxiety that life brings, has to be stopped. The ritual is meant to open up a new perspective to the clients: of affluence and health, of a life without cares. The mudang themselves, too, view ritual as a way to get rid of a psychological burden. Remember the words of Yongsu’s Mother quoted above: ‘Let’s hit the drum and start dancing. Then we’ll feel good.’

It is also quite likely that the habitual association of the rhythms of the drum with the performance of ritual has an effect. The mere sound of the drum may contribute to the psychological disposition of the mudang to immerse herself completely in the ritual and do what is expected of her. An assumption of this nature is, of course, quite different from theories claiming that music causes possession, either through its neurophysiological effect or through a conditioned reflex, as Rouget (1985:176-183) has pointed out.

Rouget’s book certainly contains valuable critical discussions on the relation between music and trance in general, and offers a number of insights useful for an examination of the function of music in Korean possession rituals in particular. It is questionable, however, whether the core of the theory he proposes contributes to our understanding of what happens in terms of music when the mudang perform. To formulate a general theory, Rouget had to limit the number of variables to be taken into account. One important distinction he makes is between shamanism and
For Gods and Man: Music in Korean Shaman Rituals

Possession, and correspondingly, between persons who make music themselves when they go into a trance ('shamans'/′musicants′) and persons who go into a trance while others make music (who are 'possessed' or 'musicated'; Rouget 1985:102-111). For his definition of shamanism, Rouget bases himself on Eliade, a choice he does not seem entirely happy with himself. While maintaining a critical attitude toward certain theoretical aspects of Eliade's work, he justifies his choice with the argument that Eliade is the only one who offers the kind of comprehensive general survey he needs (Rouget 1985:18).

The application of Rouget's categories to the Korean data poses a problem of classification. Mudang, if we follow Eliade and Rouget, cannot be regarded as shamans. But do they fit into the category of the possessed? If so, Rouget says, they would have to meet the following conditions: 1. they are visited by the gods (and do not journey to Heaven or the Underworld to meet them), 2. they are the servants of the gods (and do not have the power to command or coerce them) and 3. their possession is involuntary (Rouget 1985:23). With regard to the first condition there is no difficulty. The second condition may also be said to apply to the mudang, although there is some room for debate on this issue. The third condition is most problematic. Except in the period of initiation, the possession of the mudang is not involuntary. Mudang have control over their trance; they make the gods descend at their will.

A similar confusion or ambiguity is seen when the use of music is taken into account. Before she gets possessed, the mudang dances to the music of her colleagues, but during the ritual she herself sings, often using a simple instrument: the little handbells. Is, then, the mudang who becomes possessed musically active or musically passive, 'musicant' or 'musicated'? Furthermore, the mudang do not use specific motifs of instrumental music as 'mottos' identifying individual deities (a function Rouget assigns to possession music; 1985:133). Their gods are identifiable in many other ways, by the fixed order of the parts of a complete ritual, by the text of the songs, by the costume the mudang wears, by her behaviour when she is possessed. In Korean rituals, differences in music indicate differences in the function of particular parts of the ritual (invocation, descent, entertainment for the gods, exorcism of noxious influences) rather than the identity of deities. Rouget also suggests that possession music does not form a separate category within the general musical system to which it belongs: '...possession trance seems to require, everywhere and at all times, a form of music belonging to the most everyday and popular system.' (Rouget 1985:95) This does not apply to the music of the mudang, which is generally different from other genres of Korean popular music.

---

8 The mudang consider themselves servants of the gods, but in practice it often seems that, rather than serving them, they negotiate with the gods, or even manipulate them with promises and bribes.
although there is some overlapping. 9

In fact, Rouget briefly discusses an intermediate category in which the mudang would apparently fit, that is, that of the mediums who use possession to transmit the words of supernatural beings (Rouget 1985:133-139). The trance of these mediums is sometimes like that of shamans and sometimes possession trance. Also, they do not all make use of music in the same way, some of them providing the music themselves, while others need accompanying. The only common characteristic is that when the mediums speak, the music (if at all present) is silent, which is logical because otherwise one would not be able to understand the message. For a discussion of mudang and music, this section would seem to be of particular relevance, but in fact Rouget merely notes that in this case every kind of variation is possible, which means that the distinctions he made earlier in his theoretical scheme are of no use here.

Rouget concludes the section on the trance of mediums by noting that it occurs often in a private, individualistic context (Rouget 1985:139). One may wonder what exactly is meant here with a term like private, because this word does not mean the same thing in every culture. However this may be, the rituals of the mudang are performed not for individuals but for collectives such as families or villages. This draws our attention to the issue of the social context of trance rituals, which Rouget mentions from time to time, but which does not occupy a prominent place in his theory. For an understanding of the relation between music and trance in mudang ritual, attention to the social context is essential, as it may well be for other instances of what Rouget calls mediumistic possession.

During the 20th century there has been a marked development in the study of the mudang. Early researchers often limited themselves to a registration of ritual details, of the words of the songs and of the life histories of the mudang. The social context was largely neglected in their work. Gradually, scholars became more aware of this latter aspect and realized that rituals derive their importance from the fact that they are a transaction (in more than one sense of the word) between the clients who have the ritual performed, and the mudang. One must always, therefore, take into account the role of the clients as well as that of the mudang. This remains true when the problem under consideration is the relation between music and trance, even if at first sight this concerns only the musicians and the person who is possessed.

In a sense, the rituals of the mudang can only be effective if the clients are convinced that real contact is established with the world of deities and spirits.

---

9 A well-known example is the ensemble music called shinawi, which was originally used to accompany mudang ritual, but now - in a somewhat different form - is performed separately for its own sake (Howard 1988:62-63 and 1989:174-180).
They have to accept, for instance, that the words they hear are really spoken by their own father or grandmother, even if only for the duration of the ritual. The *mudang* are faced with the task of making their rituals credible to the audience; the ritual transaction should be satisfying to all parties. We have already seen that they often succeed in this, but the question remains how they manage to achieve it. Basically, they derive the power to convince their clients, to make them participate actively in the ritual and enter into dialogues with gods and spirits, from two things. The first is the authority they have acquired because of their having been chosen by the gods, who through the 'divine illness' have forced them to become mediators between two worlds. The second - of no lesser importance - is that they are able to perform every ritual (in which they repeat their initial possession in stylized form) 'properly', that is, both in conformity with culturally defined standards (Choi 1989:240) and with the (individual) force to draw an emotional response from the audience. In the words of a researcher who has especially concerned herself with the artistic aspects of *mudang* ritual, '[The *mudang*] must ... be able to perform theatrically convincing religious rites - complicated procedures involving considerable ritual knowledge and aesthetic skill - in order to transform her clients' misery over misfortune into hope.' (Choi 1989:236)

Here, music is of inestimable value. It contributes to giving ritual its sacred character, and charges it with emotion. This is not limited to instrumental music only. Older *mudang* consciously teach their apprentices to deliver the text of the songs in such a way that a maximum emotional effect is achieved (Choi 1989:241). Helped by the dancing, the altar tables heavily laden with extravagant piles of fruits and rice cakes, the display of painted pictures of the deities and the use of special costumes and all kinds of paraphernalia, music 'sets the scene.' It is one of the factors that transform an ordinary gathering of people into true ritual, allowing the participants to transcend the limitations of quotidian reality.

One might object that the 'essence' of a *mudang* ritual is in the *kongsu* dialogues, when the clients show the most intense interest in the proceedings and the greatest emotional involvement, not in all the 'folkloristic' details (such as songs, music or costumes) surrounding these dialogues between the possessed *mudang* and her clients. These conversations with deities and spirits are, indeed, of the greatest importance, but one should never forget that they are highly dependent on the other parts of the ritual (including songs and music), which create the setting in which this form of communication becomes possible.

**Conclusion**

Our examination of the rituals of the *mudang* has drawn attention to a lacuna in Rouget's treatment of the problem of music and trance. In his effort to find a systematic correlation between a limited number of variables, his focus is too
much on those who enter into a trance and those who provide the musical accompaniment. This is at the expense of other factors. Rather than the effect of the music on the mudang, it is the effect of the music on the audience that makes the trance work, in the sense that the music - together with other factors - prepares the audience to accept the possession of the mudang as genuine. This is essential to the functioning of the ritual and cannot, therefore, be overlooked when one seeks to explain the relation between music and trance in such rituals.

References
Akamatsu Chijō & Akiba Takashi

Choi, Chungmoo

Eliade, Mircea

Elliott, Alan J.A.

Findeisen, Hans & Heino Gehrts

Howard, Keith


1991 'Why should Korean shamans be women?,' in Papers of the British Association for Korean Studies 1:75-96.

Kendall, Laurel


Kim, Kwang-il
Kim Su-nam, et. al.

Kim, T’aegon
1981  *Han’guk musok yŏn’gu.* Seoul: Chimmundang.

Murayama Chijun
1932  *Chŏsen no fugeki.* Keijō: Chosen sōtokufu.

Park, Il-Young

Rouget, Gilbert

Walraven, B.C.A.

Yi, Du-hyun
Abstract

In tembang Sunda certain songs can be performed not only at a different pitch, but also using a different mode. This article compares parallel versions of tembang Sunda songs found in different tuning systems. It appears that in some cases a change of tuning may involve transposition or vocal chromaticism, whereby the relative intervals of a melody are preserved. In other cases, change of tuning occurs without transposition, but involves instead a radical modal change, whereby the intervals of the melody must be adjusted. This analysis of the parallel versions of tembang Sunda melodies tries to clarify certain aspects of the concept 'mode' in Sundanese music.

Introduction

Western vocal music is often transposed to accommodate different vocal ranges. While a Schubert song or a jazz standard may readily be transposed from the key of, say, A major to F major, it would be very unusual to find two versions of a song in both A major and A minor. In tembang Sunda, as in several other vocal and instrumental genres on the Indonesian island of Java, certain songs can be performed not only at a different pitch, but also using a different mode. This article compares parallel versions of tembang Sunda songs found in different tuning systems.

Several authors have already noted that Sundanese music theory is not always well formulated in the (written) literature. This is certainly the case with the concept 'mode', described by lara and pathet in central Java. Much work has still to be done, before this musical concept can be adequately described for Sundanese music. This article attempts to clarify a few issues connected to the important concept 'mode', based on the analysis of tembang Sunda melodies.

Tembang Sunda1 (also known as Cianjur'an) is a genre of solo vocal music

---

1 Wim van Zanten's thorough research (1987 and 1989) provides an excellent comprehensive introduction to the world of tembang Sunda. The idea of writing this article sprang from a perusal of the list of song titles in Appendix E of van Zanten's Ph.D. thesis (1987), which collates information gathered mainly from commercial cassettes of tembang Sunda, and draws attention to versions of songs in different tunings.
accompanies by one or two zithers (kacapi) and a bamboo flute (suling) or a stick fiddle (rebab). It is a prestigious art form principally enjoyed and performed by the upper echelons of Sundanese society in West Java. There are two main types of tembang Sunda song. The mamaos songs are very free in rhythm, and the accompaniment is not metrical. A set of mamaos songs is rounded off by a song of the other type, panambih or lagu ekstra ('additional song'). The panambih songs are metrical, moving in phrases of 8 (or 4 or 16) beats strictly defined by the kacapi accompaniment, over which the vocal and suling (or rebab) parts float with some rhythmic freedom, but still a clear feeling of 8 (or 4 or 16) beats. Many panambih songs are adapted from the repertoire of two kinds of gamelan found in Sunda: gamelan degung and gamelan salendro.

Instrumental tunings and Sundanese notation

Three instrumental tunings (surupan) are generally used in tembang Sunda: pelog (or pelog degung), sorog and salendro. Normally a serious tembang Sunda performance or rehearsal (which would traditionally begin after dark) starts with songs in pelog. Later in the evening the kacapi are retuned to sorog, and later still retuned to salendro. The suling is used for the pelog and sorog tunings, and is replaced by the rebab in salendro. In practice, the salendro tuning is least frequently used, not only since people by that time often wish to sleep, but also because rebab players experienced in accompanying tembang Sunda are scarce. Also some people (especially in Cianjur: van Zanten 1989:28) do not much care for salendro, perhaps because of its associations with the less prestigious sphere of gamelan salendro.

While there is some slight variation in tuning between different kacapi players at different times, it is both convenient and sufficiently accurate to represent the pelog and sorog tunings in terms of Western intervals. Pitch varies in tembang Sunda, and is defined by the length of suling used, in centimetres. With a 61 or 62
cm suling, the pitch of the note barang (or tugu) is approximately Western f. The pitch of barang is the same in all three tunings. The tone system is pentatonic, and the five pitches (from high to low) to which the kacapi is tuned are called: barang, kenong, panelu, bem and galimer. These five pitches are often referred to by the numbers 1 to 5 from high to low. In pelog the 18 strings of the large kacapi indung are tuned thus:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sundanese</th>
<th>Western</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3 panelu</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 kenong</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 barang</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 galimer</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 bem</td>
<td>B♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 panelu</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 kenong</td>
<td>e</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 barang</td>
<td>f</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 galimer</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 bem</td>
<td>b♭</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 panelu</td>
<td>c'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 kenong</td>
<td>e'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 barang</td>
<td>f'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 galimer</td>
<td>a'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 bem</td>
<td>b♭'</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 panelu</td>
<td>c''</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 kenong</td>
<td>e''</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 barang</td>
<td>f''</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note that in using dots with Sundanese ciphers to indicate octave register, a dot below a number means a high note, while a dot (or two dots) above a number mean a low note.5

To retune the kacapi to sorog, the player raises each panelu string by approximately 200 cents. The scale barang - kenong - panelu - bem - galimer thus corresponds to the Western pitches f - e - d - b♭ - a.

5 Sundanese cipher notation is thus a total inversion of the Javanese kepatihan system. Although the intervals differ slightly, Sundanese pelog and Javanese pelog bem could be compared thus:

Sunda: 3 2 1 5 4 3 2 1 5 4 3 2 1 5 4 3 2 1
Java: 3 5 6 1 2 3 5 6 1 2 3 5 6 1 2 3 5 6
The intervals of the salendro scale lie approximately 240 cents apart. According to van Zanten’s informants, the pitches of barang and bem remain constant in all three tunings (although in practice bem may be altered a hair’s breadth). Panelu salendro is slightly sharper than panelu pelog. Kenong and galimer are considerably flatter than their equivalents in pelog or sorog. Western intervals do not correspond to those of salendro. Van Zanten (1989:115) describes the scale barang - kenong - panelu - bem - galimer as sounding approximately like f - d♯ - c - bb - g♯.7

The two conventions for cipher notation

While Sundanese cipher notation presents few problems in pelog, its use for other tunings is more complicated. There are two conventions, which in Western music are directly comparable to the use of absolute pitch names (A, B, C ...) on the one hand, and the movable tonic sol-fa system on the other. In Sunda the ciphers 1 to 5 may be used as a short-hand for the note names barang to galimer, or they may be used in different transpositions to denote relative pitch (Machjar Kusumadinata’s da-mi-na-ti-la). Van Zanten (1989:122) uses the former convention, following Barmara and Ida Achman (1958). 1 always denotes barang. This entails the use of accidentals in tunings other than pelog. A minus sign denotes the raising of a note, and a plus sign its lowering. Thus the sorog scale is notated 1 2 3- 4 5, and the salendro scale is 1 2+ 3 4 5+. This convention has the advantage of consistency, and makes perfect sense from the point of view of the kacapi player. However, it seems to me unnecessarily involved to notate the natural salendro scale in terms of pelog with accidentals, and I do not follow van Zanten in this.8

Machjar Kusumadinata’s floating da-mi-na-ti-la system has certain advantages for the vocalist, in that it more readily conveys the intervals of a melody. In pelog, the notes barang=kenong=panelu=bem=galimer=barang (f’, e’, c’, bb, a, f) are vocalized to the syllables da=mi=na=ti=la=da.9 Da and mi are

---

6 See van Zanten 1989:120 & 126 for his empirically grounded conclusion that ‘the realizations of the salendro tone system in tembang Sunda may be considered to be “almost” equidistant...’

7 Van Zanten chooses a raised d♯ for kenong rather than a lowered eb♭ ‘to show the fifth-relationship between the 2nd and 5th strings’. Unfortunately there is no satisfactory way of delving into the cracks of Western notation to show the equally important fifth-relationship between kenong and bem: see van Zanten’s transcription of ‘Kulu-kulu Bem’ (1987:248). I will use the enharmonic alternatives d♯ or eb♭ to suit the context.

8 Accidentals are not used when notating pieces for the gamelan salendro, from which much of the salendro repertoire of tembang Sunda is derived.

9 Each equals sign inserted between two note names represents an interval of approximately 100 cents. Thus barang=kenong, da=mi, or F to E are one semitone apart, while kenong=panelu, mi=na, or E to C are separated by four semitones.
close together, as are na, ti and la. In sorog (usually referred to as madenda by those who favour this system), it is the notes bem=galimer====barang=kenong====panelu sorog====bem (bb, a, f, e, d, Bb) which correspond to da=mi====na=ti=la====da. Using da-mi-na-ti-la emphasizes the similarity of intervallic contour between pelog and sorog. However, it thereby obscures the essential difference between the two scales. Consider the group of three nearby notes na, ti and la. In pelog ti is closer to la (na==ti=la), while in sorog ti is closer to na (na=ti==la). This ambiguity is instructive, as we will see later. In salendro, the intervals of da==mi==na==ti==la==da are equally spaced. In all three tunings, the ciphers 1 to 5 are used to stand for da-mi-na-ti-la. Van Zanten (1989:122) deplores the confusion caused by the use of ciphers for both systems.

Pentatonic 'chromaticism' in the vocal part

In tembang Sunda (as in most Sundanese vocal music) the voice part contains many notes which lie outside the scale to which the kacapi are tuned. These notes are also played by the suling (or rebab), which cues and shadows the singer. This 'chromaticism' almost always remains pentatonic. In other words the notes outside the natural scale briefly substitute certain scale steps, but are not used in direct melodic conjunction with them. Consider for instance the phrase 'Daweung', used as an introduction to mamaos songs of the type known as papantunan, which are always in the pelog tuning:

![Musical notation](image)

The first half of the phrase revolves around the note 2 (kenong/e'), which is reiterated by the kacapi. The note 3- (panelu sorog/d') occurs here as a lower neighbour note immediately adjacent to 2. However, the second half of the phrase

---

10 Here I use the combination of symbols -=- to indicate an interval of approximately 240 cents. The psychology of equidistant salendro is an intriguing topic. It is my impression that many foreign students of Sundanese (and Javanese) music hear salendro intervals as unequal, even when this may not be the case: the 'wider' intervals give one a handle on which to fasten. Playing a gomelan with a very slightly different tuning to that which one is used to hearing, can prove wildly disorientating. In Sunda, musicians often assert that salendro is equidistant (padantara). Even when acoustically this is clearly not the case, they still seem to perceive and treat the intervals as equidistant. As van Zanten 1989:146 says, to his informants 'salendro is definitely equidistant in a cognitive sense'. This was forcibly demonstrated to me when I was once attending a singing class at ASTI, the academy of performing arts in Bandung. The class was learning a salendro song by rote, phrase by phrase, accompanied by a kacapi tuned to a salendro which to my ear was definitely not equidistant. At the end of the song was a high passage. Too high, it proved, and the teacher decided to start again, transposing the whole song down a step. The beginning of the song, which I thought I had almost memorized, sounded completely different to me. However none of the Sundanese students seemed to experience any difficulty.
descends from 2 to 5 (galimer/a) via the note 3 (panelu pelog/c'). This particular passing modal change is characteristic of papantunan songs. The following extracts from papantunan songs further illustrate this:

from 'Papatet'

```
3-2 2 2 . 2 1 5 5 2 3 2 3
```

from 'Balagenyat':

```
3-3- 3- 3- 3 2 4 5 4 5
```

It is very unusual to find 3 and 3- directly adjacent, without an interceding 2. On occasion 3- replaces 3 throughout a phrase, and in descending as well as ascending motion. Thus for instance in the dedegungan12 song 'Panangis Degung' (which like all dedegungan is in the pelog tuning) there occurs the following

11 A notable exception occurs in the papantunan song 'Pangapungan' ('Sampiung'):

```
3- 3- 3- 3- 3- 4 4
```

In the last syllable of 'pahiri-hiri' the 3- (panelu sorog/d) slides down to a 3 (panelu pelog/c). The slide is here notated as ' \ Many singers articulate the end of this syllable with a momentary break into falsetto, like a sob, which very briefly touches a 2. This jenghak ornament is here notated as ' (see Williams 1990:326). Such slides are more frequently found in panambih songs.

In the context of gamelan, the rebab player Sulaeman Sutisna (Pa Entis) uses the term diatonis to refer to melodies where notes outside the pentatonic scale occur in conjunction with notes within it, rather than replacing them, eg 4 3 3-3 4 5 (bb c d c bb a). Such turns of phrase are a feature of the Cirebon and Indramayu styles, which are sometimes imitated by Priangan musicians.

12 This and similar passages in the same song and also in 'Dangdanggula Degung' would seem to contradict the statement in Williams (1990:87) that 'musical features which separate dedegungan songs from rarancagan songs include the lack of pitch borrowing from outside of pelog'. However, this was the explanation given by her informants.
Here one might speak of a 'modulation' to sorog in the vocal and suling parts.\textsuperscript{13} The kacapi cannot of course include $3-$ in its accompanying runs.

The following phrase from the papantunan song 'Goyong' illustrates the occurrence of $5+$ (lowered galimer/g') as an upper neighbour note adjacent to 1 (barang/f'):

As with 3 and 3-, it is unusual to find $5+$ and 5 in direct conjunction.\textsuperscript{14}

\textbf{Pelog intervals sung in sorog, and sorog intervals sung in pelog}

In many songs in pelog, the note 4 (bem/bb) is raised to 4- (bb') either as a lower neighbour note adjacent to 3 (panelu/c), or as an ascending passing note in a phrase moving from 5 (galimer/a) to 3. In the latter case, it tends to revert to 4 (bem/bb) when the phrase moves back down from 3 to 5. Thus for instance at the end of the papantunan song 'Kaleon':

This change is particularly significant in the context of this article, since it is indicative of a certain blurring of the essential intervallic difference between the

\textsuperscript{13} Sulaeman Sutisna refers to such modal changes (involving a change in hand position on the rebab) as modulasi.

\textsuperscript{14} A striking exception occurs at the beginning of the panambih 'Toropongan' (in the pelog tuning):
pelog and sorog modes in vocal parts. In sorog, ti is raised (na=ti=la), while in pelog ti is lowered (na=ti=la).

Conversely, in certain sorog songs, the singer uses 'pelog' intervals. A striking example is 'Pancaniti II', the version of 'Dangdanggula Pancaniti' (a mamaos song of the rarancagan type in the sorog tuning) sung by Euis Komariah on the Jugala label cassette 'Jalan Satapak'. The following transcription of the opening and closing phrases uses the da-mi-na-ti-la convention, for ease of comparison with the pelog transcriptions.

\[
\begin{align*}
d (1) &= \text{bem} \\
n (2) &= \text{galimer} \\
a (3) &= \text{barang} \\
t (4) &= \text{kenong} \\
l (5) &= \text{panelu sorog}
\end{align*}
\]

In the first line, again we see that while ti remains raised in ascending motion (5==4=3 / d' e' f'), it is lowered in descending motion (3==4==5 / f' e' b' d'), and also lowered when used as an upper neighbour note (5==4==5 / d' e' b' d'). The second line illustrates the same type of 'modulation' already met with in 'Dang-

---

15 This is not to say that anyone would think of classifying 'Kaleon' otherwise than as a song in pelog: both the kacapi and the register of the melody firmly anchor the song to the pelog tuning (see van Zanten 1989:115).
16 Also recorded by Rina Oesman on the Gita cassette 'Mega Warna'.
PARALLEL VERSIONS OF TEMBANG SUNDA MELODIES

danggula Degung'. The penultimate line (carrying over into the last) is extraordinary, since it so strongly emphasizes a note which the kacapi cannot play: 4+ (eb'). In the entire song, the note 4+ is sung nineteen times, while 4 (e') is sung four times, and then only in passing. The vocal part thus feels as though it is in a transposed pelog, rather than sorog.

Melodies sung in either pelog or sorog: transposition

'Campaka Kembar' is a panambih song, normally sung in the sorog tuning. Like many of the most popular panambih, it consists of a verse section and a refrain. The kacapi accompaniment is based on the musical structure 'Kulu-kulu Bem', which is a symmetrical elaboration of the notes panelu sorog (la/d) and galimer (mi/a). In the vocal part ti is found both raised (na=ti=la) and lowered (na=ti=la). The following transcription of the end of the verse, and of the refrain again uses the da-mi-na-ti-la convention for sorog:

17 Uking Sukri once described the move to a raised la within the sorog tuning as 'sorog dina sorog', or 'the sorog within sorog'.
18 The kacapi player avoids conflict with the vocal and suling parts at this point by continuing to play runs, rather than cadencing on a bass 'goong' note.
19 On very rare occasions, the kacapi may be tuned to pelog intervals at sorog pitch: thus da-mi-na-ti-la corresponds to bem/f=galimer/f=barang/f=kenong/f=panelu/d. This tuning is called mataraman by van Zanten's principal informants (1989:118-119), and mandalungan by Williams' informants (1990:196-201) and (most influentially) on recent commercial cassettes. The repertoire specific to this tuning is so small and rarely performed that it lies beyond the scope of this article. Uking Sukri told me that this tuning used to be used occasionally to transpose ordinary pelog songs such as 'Papatet' to this higher register.
20 Composed in 1972 by Sunnen Winatadipradja (van Zanten 1987:274)
21 The framework of pitches in 'Kulu-kulu Bem' can be notated (using the absolute pitch convention): 5 3-3-5. In the verse section the structure is in 4 wilet, while in the refrain and instrumental introduction (gelenyu) it is contracted to 1 wilet. See van Zanten 1989:147-150 and 1987:246-248 for an explanation of these terms, and transcriptions of 'Kulu-kulu'.
(Refrain (sung twice)

Many tembang Sunda singers find 'Campaka Kembar' uncomfortably high. The third line of the verse ('deudeuh teuing, watir teuing') reaches a high barang, and sustains a high kenong. One solution would be to tune the kacapi to a lower-pitched suling, but this might prove too low for other songs. 'Campaka Kembar' can also be sung without melodic alteration a fourth lower in the pelog tuning.\(^{22}\) The kacapi plays 'Kulu-kulu' on the notes galimer (a) and kenong (e).\(^{23}\) There is no modal conflict with the vocal part, since the accompaniment nowhere stresses the scale-step ti. In this instance the difference between pelog and sorog is as much a question of register as of mode.\(^{24}\)

While this transposition solves the problem of the high notes, the panelu sorog on 'bongan' in the last line is uncomfortably low (beyond the range of bottom notes for mamaos songs given by van Zanten 1989:144-145). Clearly, a melody

---

\(^{22}\) I heard 'Campaka Kembar' performed in pelog in a broadcast by the tembang Sunda group of Radio Republik Indonesia, Bandung, on 29 March 1990.

\(^{23}\) The framework of pitches for 'Kulu-kulu' pelog can be notated 2552. In the last two lines of the verse (which are quoted above), many kacapi players stop playing in the metrical style (kait) usual for panambih, allowing the vocalist to sing these two lines as a kind of 'cadenza' in the non-metrical mamaos style. Instead the kacapi accompanies in a style characteristic of papantunan songs such as 'Rajamantri' (teungit sari ical ganda gapong taya komarana):

\[\text{sorog:}\]

\[\text{pelog:}\]

Since papantunan are always in pelog, the use of these patterns in a sorog song is striking. The only other instance I have found of a kacapi accompaniment for papantunan being used in sorog is the song 'Pegat Duriat' (by Engkos), which transposes the repeated pattern (transcribed in van Zanten 1989:139 ex.2e) from the papantunan 'Pangapungan' (or 'Sampiung'), 'Tejamantri' and 'Goyong' (though not 'Balagenyat', as van Zanten 1989:23 & 139, and Williams 1990:76 both state). The vocal melody of 'Pegat Duria' is unrelated to papantunan style.

\(^{24}\) Van Zanten 1989:146 reports that some musicians say that 'generally speaking, the sorog songs have a higher tessitura than the pelog songs'. However his analysis of rarancagan songs does not confirm this.
must have a rather narrow range if it is to be sung comfortably with the same melodic contour in both pelog and sorog.

'Budak Ceurik' is a frequently performed panambih in pelog. The kacapi accompaniment consists of the gamelan degung piece 'Lalayaran', based on the notes panelu (3/c) and galimer (5/a) thus: 5 3 3 5. One verse of 'Budak Ceurik' consists of five repetitions of the 'Lalayaran' cycle, of which the third and fourth are an interlude for the female vocalist, which may either be sung by a male (alok) or, or left to the suling (gelenyu):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>cycle</th>
<th>highest note</th>
<th>lowest note</th>
<th>final note</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>i</td>
<td>galimer(5/a')</td>
<td>barang(1/F)</td>
<td>galimer (5/a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ii</td>
<td>panelu(3/c&quot;)</td>
<td>bem(4/bb)</td>
<td>galimer (5/a')</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>[iii/iv alok/gelenyu improvisation: high range]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>v</td>
<td>panelu(3/c&quot;)</td>
<td>barang (1/F)</td>
<td>galimer (5/a)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first cycle stays low, the second (which is a melodic variation of the first) moves from low to high, and the last moves back from high to low.

Around 1970, 'Budak Ceurik' was adapted by Uking Sukri as a panambih in sorog entitled 'Puspa Priangan'. Since the kacapi accompaniment does not include the scale-step ti, it can be transposed without modal change to the notes barang (1/f) and panelu sorog (3-1 3-). However a literal transposition of the vocal part up a fourth would be too high: up to top barang (1/f") in the second and final cycles. Instead, the second cycle simply repeats the first, thus avoiding the move from low to high. The alok/gelenyu is omitted. The first half of the final cycle is a fifth lower, rather than a fourth higher than in 'Budak Ceurik'. The melody then folds back on itself in order to cadence in the right octave. The following outline transcription uses the da-mi-na-ti-la convention for sorog:


26 The singing of alok, which derives from the rather raucous gamelan style, is (perhaps for that reason) no longer common in the refined sphere of tembang Sunda. However 'Budak Ceurik' is one song in which alok is still often sung: as for instance in the performance by Euis Komariah and Yus Wiradiredja on the Jugala cassette 'Mega Beureum'. The note on 'Budak Ceurik' in the Demonstration Tape of van Zanten 1989 is thus a little misleading.
The late Ibu Saodah Harnadi Natakusumah was one of the most famous and influential tembang Sunda singers. Her voice was low in range, and she adapted a number of songs to suit it. One of these was the *rarancagan* 'Dangdanggula Pancaniti' in pelog. There are two versions of 'Dangdanggula Pancaniti' in sorog: the more commonly performed version I shall refer to as 'Pancaniti I' to differentiate it from 'Pancaniti II' (quoted in the previous section). Neither of these songs goes below *galimer* (A). Thus in theory either of them could be transposed literally down a fourth into pelog, without going below *kenong* (E), the normal limit of the vocal range. In fact the relationship between 'Pancaniti' pelog and the sorog songs is more complex: up until the last three lines of the verse form (pupuh) Dangdanggula, 'Pancaniti' pelog comes closer to being a transposition of another related song in sorog, 'Pangrungrum' (by Endoh). The chart on the next page compares the contours of these four songs. The three sorog songs are notated using the da-mi-na-ti-la convention. The ciphers indicate the main opening and closing notes of each phrase (which are generally the cue and cadence notes in the *kacapi*). The signs / and \ indicate rising and falling motion respectively, while ~ indicates that the melody circles around a note. The phrases in square brackets are variants used by certain singers. In the first column, '10i, 10a...' indicate the number of syllables and final vowel sound of each line of the verse form.

In the fifth line (9i), while all the sorog songs cadence on low mi (♯), 'Pancaniti' pelog cadences on low da (♯).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>line of pupuh</th>
<th>Pancaniti pelog</th>
<th>Pancaniti I sorog</th>
<th>Pancaniti II sorog</th>
<th>Pangrungrum sorog</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dangdanggula</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10i</td>
<td>2 ~ 2 , 2 ~ 2</td>
<td>5 / 2</td>
<td>5 \ 2</td>
<td>2 ~ 2 , 5 / 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10a</td>
<td>2 ~ 2 , 2 \ 5</td>
<td>2 ~ 2 , 2 \ 5</td>
<td>5 / 2 , 2 \ 5</td>
<td>2 ~ 2 , 2 \ 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8e/o</td>
<td>2 / 2</td>
<td>2 / 2</td>
<td>2 / 2</td>
<td>2 / 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7u</td>
<td>2 \ 5</td>
<td>2 \ 5 \ 2</td>
<td>2 \ 5</td>
<td>2 \ 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9i</td>
<td>2 / \ 2</td>
<td>2 / 2 \ 2 / \ 2</td>
<td>2 / 2 \ 2 / \ 2</td>
<td>2 / \ 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[2 / \ 4]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7a</td>
<td>2 / 543</td>
<td>2 / 543</td>
<td>2 / 54+</td>
<td>2 / 543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6u</td>
<td>543 / 2</td>
<td>543 / 2</td>
<td>5 \ 2</td>
<td>543 / 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8a</td>
<td>2 / 5</td>
<td>2 / 5</td>
<td>2 / 5</td>
<td>2 / 5 543 / 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12i</td>
<td>543 / 2</td>
<td>543 / 2</td>
<td>5 \ 2</td>
<td>2 ,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 / 4/2 / 4</td>
<td>2 / 4+ / 2 / 5</td>
<td>2 / 4+</td>
<td>2 / 4+ / 2 / 5\ 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[2 / 4+ / 2 / 4+]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7a</td>
<td>4 ~ 5</td>
<td>5 ~ 5</td>
<td>4+ ~ 5</td>
<td>2 / 5 ~ 5 \ 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>[4+ ~ 5]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
However some singers\textsuperscript{28} go down to mi, perhaps influenced by 'Pangrungrum'. Another interesting variant occurs at the end of the long penultimate line (12i), carrying over into the last. 'Pancaniti' pelog, like the passage in 'Pancaniti II' (sorog) already discussed, here cadences on a (lowered) ti (4). In 'Pancaniti I' (sorog) most singers\textsuperscript{29} cadence on la (5). The variant in square brackets is taken from one recording in which the singer\textsuperscript{30} cadences on a lowered ti (4+). The \textit{kacapi} player on this recording was clearly not expecting this, and cadences on la (5). It is possible that the singer was here influenced by the other versions of 'Pancaniti'. In general, songs of the same type (\textit{wanda}) tend to have many melodic turns of phrase (\textit{senggol}) in common. It is not unusual for the variant of a particular \textit{senggol} found in one song to be sung in other songs where the same melodic formula appears in a similar context. Occasionally the overlap of melodic material can cause singers to take the ‘wrong’ turning.

In the songs discussed in this section, the scale-step ti (raised or lowered) tends not to be strongly stressed. This is prerequisite if a melody is to fit both pelog and sorog tunings. The penultimate line of 'Pancaniti' is an interesting exception.

\textit{Melodies sung in either pelog or sorog: modal change}

In the previous section we compared songs in both pelog and sorog in which the intervals of the melody are the same, but at a different pitch. To make this comparison, it was convenient to use the transposing da-mi-na-ti-la convention in the transcriptions. We now turn to songs in these two tunings which are at the same pitch, but with different intervals. In this instance the comparison will be clearer if we use the convention in which ciphers stand for absolute pitch-names (barang, kenong etc.).

'Panyileukan' is a \textit{panambih} song in the pelog tuning. The accompaniment is based on the pitches barang (1/f) and bem (4/bb).\textsuperscript{31} Two different \textit{tembang Sunda} musicians, Uking Sukri and the late Ebar Sobari, independently discovered that 'Panyileukan' works very well in sorog, without transposition, and with little

\textsuperscript{28} For instance Ida Widawati on the DJR cassette 'Peuting Panineungan'.

\textsuperscript{29} Including Rina Oesman in her recording of both sorog versions of 'Dangdanggula Pancaniti' sung in succession, on the Gita Cassette 'Mega Wama'.

\textsuperscript{30} Nenden Priatni on the Hidayat label cassette 'Malih Wami'.

\textsuperscript{31} Van Zanten 1987:280 identifies the structure as 'takolna Kulu-Kulu Barang', presumably reporting what his informants told him. 'Kulu-kulu Barang' has the structure 1 4 4 1 (beginning and ending on barang). 'Panyileukan' is an expansion of the following notes (in 4 wilct):

\begin{align*}
4 & 4 & 4 & 4 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 1 & 4 & 4 & 1 & 1 & 4 & 4 & 4 \\
\end{align*}

(The underlined section is a gelenyu or instrumental introduction). This could perhaps be more accurately described as being based on the structure 'Gendu', which begins and ends on bem: 4 1 1 4. \textit{Kacapi} players sometimes speak of structure in rather loose terms.
PARALLEL VERSIONS OF TEMBANG SUNDA MELODIES

adjustment to the accompaniment or the broad outline of the melody, apart from the change from panelu (3/c) to panelu sorog (3/-d). For the sorog version, Uking Sukri chose the title 'Paturay', and Ebar Sobari chose 'Tambelar', while many musicians refer simply to 'Panyileukan Sorog'. Here is the singer's first entry in the two versions:

pelog:

\[ \text{\includegraphics{pelog_score.png}} \]

sorog:

\[ \text{\includegraphics{sorog_score.png}} \]

This modal change is eased by the fact that panelu (3/3-), the note that makes the difference between pelog and sorog, occurs only in passing. In the sorog version, the detail of the melody is adapted to turns of phrase (senggol) more idiomatic to the style of sorog songs. Note that in the sorog version there is also a tendency for the scale-step ti to be lowered (here notated 2+/eb).

Uking Sukri told me of two other panambih sorog which are adapted with modal change and without transposition from panambih pelog. These are 'Panggeuing' (sorog) by Ibu Saodah, which is based on 'Kadewan', and 'Purwakanti' (sorog), based on 'Puloganti'. Both 'Kadewan' and 'Puloganti' happen to have originated as gamelan degung songs, which are always in pelog.

The rarancagan 'Langendria' can be performed in pelog, sorog or salendro. While the salendro version is much more loosely related, the pelog and sorog versions are melodically almost identical. Again, the critical note panelu is not emphasized, and in pelog it often appears raised (panelu sorog/3/-d), as a neighbour note below kenong (2/e). The only difference between the pelog and sorog versions of the melody occurs in the fourth and eighth lines of the Sinom verse form (which are melodically the same):

---

32 Not to be confused with the unrelated panambih pelog by Bakang Abubakar also called 'Paturay'.

33 Not to be confused with the unrelated panambih pelog by Bakang Abubakar also entitled 'Panggeuing'.

pelog:

\[ \text{\textcopyright Simon Cook} \]

At the end of the song, panelu pelog (3/c) is sung in both versions:

pelog/sorog:

Only the kacapi accompaniment gives a different modal feel to the two versions.

The relationship between the rarancagan 'Kentar Ajun' (pelog) and 'Kentar Cisaat' (sorog) is less straightforward. Here is the beginning of both songs:

'Kentar Ajun' (pelog)

'Kentar Cisaat' (sorog)
In these songs the note panelu (3/c) or panelu sorog (3/-d) is fairly frequently stressed. Its treatment is quite different. Thus for instance the first line of "Kentar Ajun" cadences on a high panelu (3/c). While "Kentar Ajun" does go up to a high panelu sorog (3/-d") at the end of the phrase, it curls back down to cadence on galimer (5/a"), anticipating the next structural note at the beginning of the second line, which is not reached in "Kentar Ajun" until the third syllable ("wawangina"). It would be stylistically absurd to try to translate the end of the first line of "Kentar Ajun" literally into sorog, (that is, 4 4 4 4 3- 3- 2 2 3- 4 3- 2).

In the two songs as a whole, most of the structural notes (reinforced by bass notes in the kacapi) are the same. However the melodic paths (senggol) by which these notes are reached are sometimes quite different, in keeping with the idiom characteristic of rarancagan pelog and rarancagan sorog. Note for instance the different phrases leading to kenong (2/e") at the end of the second line. The widest divergence occurs at the end of the songs, where long melismas typical of rarancagan pelog and rarancagan sorog are sung. A close comparison of the two songs is rewarding for the insight it gives into these two different idioms: a kind of lexicon of senggol.

Melodies sung in either pelog or salendro
A number of rarancagan can be performed either in salendro or pelog. These include "Garutan", "Lorloran", "Pamuradan", and "Sebrakan Sapuratina" ("Sebrakan Pelog"). It seems that these songs were originally in salendro, and were later adapted to pelog. There is among the elite who enjoy tembang Sunda a 'tendency to frown upon the salendro songs, especially in the western parts of the Priangan' (van Zanten 1989:81), because of the association of salendro with game/an and with genres favoured by the common people. Perhaps this is part of the reason why these songs were adapted to pelog.

---

34 Another rarancagan in sorog, 'Kentar Rawita' or 'Kentar Miring' is identical to 'Kentar Cisaat' except for its ending.

35 My teacher in Central Java, Suhardi of R.R.I. Yogyakarta, told me that while many Javanese gamelan pieces in slendro translate happily to pelog, it usually does not work to translate pelog pieces to slendro. One reason for this is the incidence in the seven-note pelog tuning of notes outside the pentatonic scale currently in use (pelog bem or pelog barang); in the five-note slendro scale they cannot be accommodated.

In tembang Sunda, we have seen that in pelog melodies, notes outside the tuning abound. It is striking that in pelog versions of salendro songs in salendro, such 'blue' notes are rare.
The relationship between the salendro and pelog versions of these melodies is straightforward, involving a simple change of tuning without transposition. Thus for instance, 'Sebrakan Pelog' is an adaptation (by Ibu Mimin of Jakarta) of the first section of the salendro song 'Sebrakan Sapuratina'. The latter was originally a kakawen, a song sung by the puppeteer in wayang. The text is Javanese, and does not use one of the pupuh verse forms. However in 'Sebrakan Pelog' the text is Sundanese and uses the verse form Dangdanggula. Here is the opening of the two songs:

'Sebrakan Sapuratina' (salendro):

\[ \text{Gunung keli:r} \quad \text{langit linglang taya} \]

'Sebrakan Pelog':

\[ \text{gusti} \quad \text{ya mring wayang} \]

The final melisma demonstrates the different character of senggol in salendro and pelog: it is easier to sing more notes when they are closer together. One structural difference between the two melodies occurs at the end of the second line of Dangdanggula in 'Sebrakan Pelog'. At this point in 'Sebrakan Sapuratina' after a cadence on low barang (1/F), there is a melodic tag cadencing again on a low kenong (2/D) to the words 'ya mring wayang'. In pelog most singers omit this.\(^{37}\)

Van Zanten (1989:146) observes that 'It is remarkable that 27 of the 37 Rarancagan salendro songs [analysed] end on ... bem 4. One could say that in salendro this note has taken over the function of the note galimer 5 as most frequent final note in pelog and sorog. This is even more remarkable, if we suppose the salendro system to be equidistant. ... In that case one could expect these final notes to be more equally spread over the possibilities, as a song can easily be transposed up and down. Apparently this is

\[^{36}\text{Though not Tika Rustika on the Hidayat cassette 'Neundcun Teuteup'.}\]

\[^{37}\text{The only other such structural change I found in the songs mentioned, occurs at the end of the penultimate line of the verse form Sinom in 'Lorloran'. In salendro the melody here cadences on galimer (5/G)\textsuperscript{♯}. In pelog the melody does first settle on galimer (5/A), but then descends to a cadence on low barang (1/F).}\]
not done."

It could be said that this is not so much remarkable as logical. The ease with which a melody in salendro can be transposed up or down (by mistake) is the very reason why it is essential to orientate on one or two landmark notes in the otherwise featureless tonal landscape. Throughout a wayang performance, the gamelan salendro reiterates the notes barang\(^{38}\) and bem at apparent random, so that the puppeteer may keep his musical bearings. The kacapi introductions (pasieup) to rarancagan salendro, consisting of runs usually beginning on barang and ending on bem, serve a similar function for the tembang Sunda singer. The rebab strings are also tuned to these two pitches. Seven of the thirty-seven rarancagan salendro listed by van Zanten (1989:145) finish on barang. I have found only two rarancagan pelog that finish on this note ("Lorloran" and "Garutan") and they are both originally salendro songs.

While the versions of 'Langendria' in pelog and sorog are almost identical, the salendro version differs considerably. It includes several metrical passages. Like the pelog and sorog versions, it is in the Sinom verse form; however unlike them it proceeds to a second section in the Kinanti verse form, and it is sung to a Javanese text. While 'Langendria' in pelog and sorog both begin and end on galimer (5\(\text{a}\)), 'Langendria' salendro begins and ends on bem (4/b\(\text{b}\)). Melodically there is little resemblance, with one striking exception in lines 6 and 7 of Sinom:

'Langendria' salendro:

\[\begin{align*}
\text{4-} & \text{3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 3 4} \\
\text{ka-} & \text{dai ijo wis wong kali} \\
\text{4 4 4 1 1 1 2} & \text{5 5 5} \\
\text{wong wdu} & \text{sun elus-} \\
\text{wong} & \text{elus} \\
\end{align*}\]

'Langendria' pelog and sorog:

\[\begin{align*}
\text{5-} & \text{4 4 4} \\
\text{di-} & \text{su- surup ku ati} \\
\end{align*}\]

\(^{38}\) The other name for barang is ugu. Its meaning is apposite: 'erected stone column', 'border sign', 'pole', 'pillar' (see van Zanten 1989:115).
The different pitch of these versions is interesting in the light of van Zanten's remark (quoted above) concerning the function of galimer (5/a) in pelog and sorog, and of bem (4/bb) in salendro.

The only panambih I have found which is performed in both the pelog and salendro tunings is 'Sumarambah' by Engkos. The kacapi part (which features irregular phrase lengths, as in many of Engkos' panambih) oscillates between the notes galimer (5/a) and kenong (2/e) in pelog, and between bem (4/bb) and barang (1/f) in salendro. This also ties in with van Zanten's remark. When this song is performed in salendro, only the tuning of the kacapi changes: the melody is sung unchanged in a transposed pelog scale in which mi (2 in pelog) coincides with barang (1/f), and la (5 in pelog) coincides with bem (4/bb). Ti is often raised (4-in pelog), thereby coinciding with panelu (3/c) in salendro. The next section deals with a similar phenomenon: sorog melodies with salendro accompaniment.

There is another way in which a pelog scale can be combined with the salendro tuning, which gamelan musicians refer to as kobongan, but which in tembang Sunda is conspicuous by its absence. The pelog scale-steps da (1), na (3) and ti (4) are fitted to the salendro notes barang (1/f), panelu (3/c) and bem (4/bb). This combination can only work if just these three notes are structurally important in the melody (as in the structure 'Sinyur'): in the pelog songs of tembang Sunda these are, more often than not, the three least important notes.

Sorog and salendro
In tembang Sunda the relationship between the sorog and salendro tunings is a special one. In many salendro songs (ie songs with the kacapi tuned to surupan salendro) the singer uses a sorog scale. This practice derives from gamelan salendro, as indeed does much of the salendro repertoire in tembang Sunda. Certain salendro songs which melodically are entirely in the sorog scale may also be performed with the kacapi tuned to sorog. An example is the salendro song 'Kulu-kulu Bem', which in tembang Sunda is usually performed in the sorog tuning, if only because the salendro tuning is often not included.

In the sorog tuning, the notes panelu sorog (3/d/la), galimer (5/a/mi) and kenong (2/e/ii) are separated by the interval of a fifth (approximately 700 cents). In the salendro tuning, every note is separated by a (slightly wider) fifth from the note three strings away on the kacapi: barang (1/f), bem (4/bb), kenong (2/e/b↓ /d↑), galimer (5/g↑), panelu (3/c), barang (1/f). The salendro fifths are approximately 720 cents. The sorog scale-steps mi, ti and la can be made to coincide
PARALLEL VERSIONS OF TEMBANG SUNDA MELODIES

(tumbuk) with the salendro scale. In theory, this could occur in five different positions: sorog mi ti la is salendro 1 3 4, 2 4 5, 1 3 5, 1 2 4 or 2 3 5. In practice, the two permutations which include both barang and bem are the most common: 1 2 4 and 1 3 4. This is how they combine with the sorog scale:

**tumbuk 1 2 4** (as for instance in the song 'Senggot'):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>salendro (kacapi)</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eb</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>G♯</td>
<td>B♭</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Eb</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sorog (voice)</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>5+</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3+</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>la</td>
<td>ti</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>mi</td>
<td>da</td>
<td>la</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eb</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>G♭</td>
<td>B♭</td>
<td>C♭</td>
<td>e♭</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**tumbuk 1 3 4** (as for instance in the song 'Sinyur'):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>salendro (kacapi)</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B♭</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D♯</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>G♯</td>
<td>B♭</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>sorog (voice)</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2+</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>5+</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>la</td>
<td>ti</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>mi</td>
<td>da</td>
<td>la</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B♭</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D♭</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>G♭</td>
<td>B♭</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The exact intonation of the sorog scale accompanied by salendro is not identical to that of the sorog scale in the sorog tuning. This is soon apparent to anyone who tries playing a sorog melody on the suling in salendro, or on the rebab in the sorog tuning. Thus for instance, the interval between ti and la in the sorog tuning is about 200 cents, while in the sorog scale accompanied by salendro it is about 240 cents. However, musically the scales are not perceived as different.

The sorog scale-steps da and na do not correspond to salendro notes. The clash between da and na in the vocal and rebab parts, and salendro 5 and 3 (for tumbuk 1 2 4) in the kacapi accompaniment gives the music great poignancy. However these clashes only occur at structurally unaccented points. If a song from the sorog repertoire is to work with salendro accompaniment, the structural notes must be confined to mi, ti and la (galimer/5/a, kenong/2/e, and panelu sorog/3/d in the sorog tuning). A song like 'Puspa Priangan' or 'Sekar Manis', based on the notes na (barang/1/f) and la (panelu sorog/3/d) simply does not work in salendro. Note that from the kacapi player’s point of view the transfer between sorog and salendro involves a transposition: thus 'Senggot' is based on the notes

---

39 See end of previous section.

In the sorog repertoire as a whole it is in fact very common for the structural notes of a song (as defined by bass notes in the kacapi) to be confined to mi, ti and la. From a sample of 27 rarancagan sorog I found this to be the case in 18 songs, and from 113 panambih sorog there were 70 such songs; nearly two-thirds in all. Thus in theory the majority of sorog songs could be performed with the salendro tuning. In practice I have heard this done with relatively few songs. These include the rarancagan 'Asmarandana Rancag'⁴⁰, 'Ceurik Rahwana' and 'Satria', and the panambih 'Karesmen', 'Kingkilaban', 'Ngumbar Lamunan', 'Ra'yat Desa', 'Karang Nunggal', 'Kulu-kulu Bem', 'Renggong Malang' (called 'Sumoreang' in sorog), 'Senggot', and 'Tablo'. The last five of these are in fact pieces from the gamelan salendro repertoire which have sorog melodies. All tembang Sunda songs performed in both the sorog and salendro tunings ⁴¹ have their structural notes in the position tumbuk 124 in salendro. It would be technically possible for the sorog melody of a salendro song like 'Buah Kawung' which is tumbuk 134 to be sung with sorog accompaniment, but this is not done. Certain salendro songs have sorog melodies which shift position. Thus for instance 'Bayu-bayu', which is based on the notes 4211 1334, is sung in the sorog scale tumbuk 124 in the first half, and tumbuk 134 in the second. This would be impossible to transfer to the sorog tuning.

If the panambih sorog 'Sumoreang' (by Uking Sukri) is sung in the salendro tuning, it usually alternates verse by verse with a similar melody in the salendro scale called 'Renggong Malang'. The kacapi accompaniment is based on the notes 2244 4411 1122 in 4 wilet⁴². This transcription of the opening gives the sorog version both in terms of salendro and of da-mi-na-ti-la:

'Renggong Malang' (salendro):

```
\[ \text{Transcription of the opening gives the sorog version both in terms of salendro and of da-mi-na-ti-la:} \]
```

---

⁴⁰ There is also a rarancagan salendro entitled 'Asmarandana Rancag'. The melody, which is in the salendro scale, is unrelated to that of the sorog version. The two songs are often performed together in the salendro tuning.

⁴¹ Apart from 'Talutur' and 'Satria', which are discussed below.

⁴² In the sorog tuning the kacapi plays 3-3-5 5522 2223-.
'Sumoreang' (sorog):

A number of panambih salendro alternate between the salendro and sorog scales a verse at a time in this way. These include 'Macan Ucul' (‘Gendu’), 'Kaelangan', 'Panglirh', 'Metik Rincang' and 'Buah Kawung'. Other salendro songs, such as the rarancagan 'Pamuradan' and the panambih 'Sekar Mawar', have melodies which switch from salendro to sorog just for a phrase or two: a beautifully expressive effect.

In earlier sections we discussed chromaticism in sorog songs. Salendro songs with sorog melodies can be equally chromatic, if not more so. Frequently the scale step ti is lowered in descending motion (as on 'asa' in the above extract from 'Sumoreang'). In several rarancagan salendro such as 'Banjar Sinom', 'Erang Barong' and sections of 'Sebrakan Sapuratina' the notes which tumbuk are frequently changed. Here is part of 'Sebrakan Sapuratina':

43 There are in fact two salendro versions of 'Pamuradan', which are often performed in conjunction: one including sorog phrases as described, and one entirely in salendro.

44 I have encountered just two instances of singing in salendro with sorog accompaniment. These occur during the last phrase of some versions of the popular melody 'Es Lilin' sung in the song 'Senggot' (eg on the Hidayat cassette 'Panghegar'), and during two complete verses of 'Kulu-kulu Sadunya' (on the Hidayat cassette 'Kulu-kulu Sadunya'). Neither of these songs (both from gamelan salendro) is particularly serious.
The 'modulations' in this passage could be parsed as follows:

'Yen kembang' to 'buang den'
\[ \text{tumbuk 1 3 5} \quad \text{da}=\text{mi}==\text{na}=\text{ti}=\text{la} \quad 2+=3==4+=5==1 \quad \text{db}=\text{c}==\text{ab} \quad \text{ti}=\text{f} \]
lowered ti is 5+/g

'-kembang malati' to 'pependeman pupung-', and last line
\[ \text{tumbuk 1 3 4} \quad \text{da}=\text{mi}==\text{na}=\text{ti}=\text{la} \quad 5+=1==2+=3==4 \quad \text{gb}=\text{f}==\text{db}=\text{c}=\text{bb} \]
lowered ti is 3+/c

'pupungkuran tandurane'
\[ \text{tumbuk 1 2 4} \quad \text{da}=\text{mi}==\text{na}=\text{ti}=\text{la} \quad 3+=4==5+=1==2 \quad \text{cb}=\text{bb}==\text{gb}=\text{f}=\text{eb} \downarrow \]
lowered ti is 1+/f

Note the lowered ti: 5+ in the first line, and 3+ subsequently. There is of course an overlap between the different tumbuk positions. My aim here is not to define or explain the music, but to show its chromaticism. The dominant feel of this passage is tumbuk 1 3 4. In the two preceding sections of 'Sebrakan Sapuratina' ('Rebeng-rebeng ...' and 'Dalancang ...') the melody changes frequently between tumbuk 1 2 4 and tumbuk 1 3 4. Ibu Mimin would have been hard pressed to include these sections in her 'Sebrakan Pelog'.

The melody of the panambih salendro 'Tablo' comprises two stanzas: the first uses the sorog scale with tumbuk 1 2 4, while the second mainly uses the sorog scale with tumbuk 1 3 4 (though often with the ti lowered to 3+). Here is the opening line of these two sections:

i)

ii)
What is remarkable is that 'Tablo' is also performed with sorog accompaniment, despite the shift, over quite a long period, to a scale unavailable to the kacapi. However this is not a problem (as it would be in 'Bayu-bayu') since the kacapi part only emphasizes the notes 1 (barang/f) and 4 (bem/bb), so there is no structural conflict with the scale used by the melody.45

'Satria' is a rarancagan sorog which one might reasonably assume cannot be performed with salendro accompaniment: the third and penultimate lines of the verse form Sinom stress the sorog scale-step da, while salendro can only be made to coincide with the sorog scale-steps mi, ti and la. Here are the first four lines of 'Satria', using the da-mi-na-ti-la convention:

The interval mi to da on 'kabentur' is approximately 100 cents. 'Satria' can be performed in salendro as follows (transcribed in terms of salendro):

---

45 In salendro the kacapi part of 'Tablo' is based on the following notes (in 4 wilet): 4 4 1 1 1 4 4 4 4 4 1 1 1 4. Van Zanten 1987:280 states that the panambah sorog 'Panyuat' is called 'Tablo' in salendro. It is true that the kacapi parts are very similar (with the two stanzas reversed). However, apart from the opening line, the melodies are completely different. 'Panyuat' remains in the usual sorog scale.
Most of the song is sung in the usual way, with sorog ti la mi corresponding to salendro 1 2 4. However the third (and penultimate) lines 'modulate' to tumbuk 1 3 4. Note that the interval sung on the word 'kabentur' is not 100 cents but about 240. The rest of the line is altered with a sengkol appropriate to the context. 'Satria' is the only sorog song to have undergone this type of melodic alteration in order to fit salendro, as far as I can establish.

Another exceptional case is the sorog adaptation by Ibu Saodah of the raranca­gan salendro 'Talutur'. The notes stressed during most of the salendro melody are barang (1/f), panelu (3/c) and bem (4/bb). The sorog version thus uses the sorog scale tumbuk 1 3 4. However, the final, and arguably most important note of the song is kenong (2/eb♭), which will not fit this sorog scale. Here are the last three lines of the salendro original:

One hypothetical solution might be to change the sorog scale at the end of the
penultimate line to tumbuk 1 2 4, perhaps as follows (notated in terms of salendro):

\[ \text{This alteration is the more surprising since the rest of 'Talutur Sorog' is in very close parallel with the salendro melody. However even when the two songs are performed in succession with salendro accompaniment, they end on different notes.} \]

\[ \text{Conclusion} \]

Many musical cultures generate new music from existing material: total originality is less highly prized than coherence within a familiar idiom. In the tembang Sunda tradition, melody is formulaic. Generally, there are few single turns of phrase in any given song which cannot be found in identical or similar form in other songs of the same type. These shared senggol characterize the different types (wanda) of song. Similarly a complete song may be shared within two (or even three) tunings.

\[ \text{46 As for instance on the Hidayat cassette 'Gupay Kadeudeuh'.} \]
The different melodic realizations may range from almost identical ('Campaka Kembar', 'Langendria' pelog/sorog, 'Sumarambah', 'Tablo') to very different ('Kentar Ajun/Cisaat', 'Langendria' salendro).

In some cases change of tuning may involve transposition or vocal chromaticism, whereby the relative intervals of a melody are preserved. While the tuning (surupan) of a song is unambiguously defined by the kacapi, the distinction between different vocal scales may be less definite. When la=ti=na recurs in surupan pelog, and na=ti=la recurs in surupan sorog (and either may appear in surupan salendro), then the distinction between pelog and sorog may, for the singer, be as much a question of register and ornament, as of interval.

In other cases, change of tuning occurs without transposition, but involves instead a radical modal change, whereby the intervals of the melody must be adjusted. This may be reflected in slightly different senggol ('Sebrakan Sapuratina/Pelog'), very different senggol ('Kentar Ajun/Cisaat'), or in structural change ('Satria', 'Talutur'). Where the conjunction of structural pitches (tumbuk) allows it, the singer may use a scale different from the kacapi, thus preserving the intervals of a melody.

The songs found in more than one tuning form only a small part of the whole tembang Sunda repertoire. Three important categories of mamos songs, the papantunan, jejemplangan and dedegungan are found only in pelog. The salendro songs are comparatively rarely performed. Although the songs I have discussed are in this sense exceptional, at the same time they are not unrepresentative. A comparison of how the same melodic material is realised in the different tunings can provide insights into the nature and workings of tembang Sunda melody in general.

References

Barmara and Ida Achman

Williams, Sean

Zanten, Wim van
1986 'The tone material of the kacapi in tembang Sunda in West Java', Ethnomusicology 30:84-112.


1989 Sundanese music in the Cianjuran style; Anthropological and musical aspects of tembang Sunda. Dordrecht/Providence: Foris. [KITLV, verhandelingen 140.]
Appendix 1: A note on the transcriptions

The musical examples in the text were transcribed from my own recordings and from commercial cassettes of tembang Sunda. While only notating the basic outline of these highly ornamented melodies, I use the following symbols as an approximate indication of some of the more prominent ornaments:

~ (during a note): a heavy vibrato
~ (after a pair of notes at the end of a phrase, e.g. 2+3~): a shake
~ (on its own at the end of a note): a turn ending on the upper note
\ a slide downwards (in the Western sense)
’ an upward vocal break, or a glottal stop

Tembang Sunda ornaments are discussed in detail by van Zanten (1989, Chapter 8) and Williams (1990:325-331). The Western notations are transliterations of the Sundanese ciphers. The pitch is that for a suling of 61 to 62 cm. In the mamaos songs the rhythm is free, so only note-heads are used. However, the spacing of the notes is intended to give some idea of their relative duration. This will be slightly different if another text is used. In the panambih songs I have indicated approximate rhythms to convey the metre of the music: in reality the rhythm of panambih can be almost as free as that of mamaos. Where pupuh verse forms are used, each line of the transcription is a line of the verse. The chevrons >>>>> indicate that a musical phrase is extended by that many syllables up to the caesura (pedotan) in the next line of the verse form. The exact placement of the pedotan varies with different texts.
Appendix 2: False friends: musically unrelated songs with the same title

Jalir Jangji pelog
panambih

Jalir Jangji sorog
panambih by Bakang Abubakar, accompaniment = 'Bungur'

Jemplang Karaton pelog
jejemplangan by Ibu Saodah
(Asmarandana verse form)

Asmarandana Karaton sorog
rarancagan

Pamoyanan pelog
dedegungan by Bakang Abubakar
(Dangdanggula verse form)

Pamoyanan sorog
rarancagan by Uking Sukri
(Sinom verse form)

Panggeuing pelog
panambih by Bakang Abubakar

Panggeuing sorog
panambih by Ibu Saodah

Panglamunan pelog
panambih by Uking Sukri

Kulu-kulu Panglamunan sorog
panambih by Endang Suryana

Kulu-kulu Panglamunan sorog
panambih by Uking Sukri

Paturay pelog
panambih
accompaniment = 'Kulu-kulu' 4 wilet

Paturay sorog
panambih by Uking Sukri
= 'Panyileukan Sorog' / 'Tambelar'

Rakitan Degung pelog
dedegungan (Sinom verse form)

Rakitan Pakuan salendro
rarancagan (Dangdanggula verse form)

Sinangling Degung pelog
panambih (dedegungan)

Sinangling sorog
panambih by Ibu Saodah

Sumedangan pelog
papantunan
accompaniment = 'Tejamantri'

Sumedangan I & II sorog
rarancagan
(Sinom verse form)

Tepis Wiring pelog
dedegungan by Bakang Abubakar

Tepis Wiring sorog
panambih by Uking Sukri

Tunggara pelog
dedegungan by Bakang Abubakar
(Sinom verse form)

Tunggara sorog
rarancagan
(Kinanti verse form)
Abstract
This article presents some of the problems encountered during research of historical photographs and films related to the performing arts. While the material presented in this article was originally collected for an exhibition on classical Javanese dance, the discussion deals with general questions of the use of historical visual documents.

Dance in picture: the problem of the still image
There is a well-known problem which is encountered by visual artists in general when they want to represent movement on a flat surface: how do we make a visual representation of three-dimensional, dynamic (dance) movements on a flat sheet of paper, that is, in a two-dimensional and static manner?

I was faced with this problem, when illustrations had to be drawn for a book on dance terminology (Brakel-Papenhuyzen 1991) by the Leiden artist Marjolijn Groustra. The same problem had to be solved when arranging an exhibition of photographs for the Cultural Centre of The Netherlands in Jakarta during the last months of 1991. The exhibition was intended to demonstrate continuity in dance and theatre practice throughout the 20th century, in spite of tremendous social and political changes.

In the above-mentioned book I published a Javanese treatise about dance practice at the Mangkunagaran palace in Surakarta, written approximately in 1920 by dance masters of the court. Two identical copies are held at Leiden University Library and at the Reksapustaka palace library in Surakarta. It contains a description of sixteen basic dance patterns, each of which is illustrated by a black-and-white photograph.

---

1 An earlier version of this article was presented as a lecture for the Indonesian Academy for the Performing Arts (Sekolah Tinggi Seni Indonesia) in Surakarta, December 1991. The matter discussed has been limited on purpose, so as to refer only to the material demonstrated during the lecture.

2 Except for the first photograph, which is missing in both manuscripts. A translation of this treatise may be found in Brakel-Papenhuyzen 1991 (in Indonesian).
The purpose of these photographs is informative, illustrating dance patterns which are explained in the written text.

In the exhibition continuity was visualized by combining historical black-and-white photographs and films of Javanese theatre and dance with recent research photographs,\(^3\) and with a selection of drawings by Marjolijn Groustra. In order to select which aspect of the movement was to be represented by the drawing, a very detailed analysis of Javanese dance movement and its terminology was necessary.\(^4\) This rather tedious process of movement-analysis proved that movement in Javanese dance is regularly interrupted by static positions of the body and its limbs. In fact, stylized poses and positions of parts of the body form a very important part of the movement patterns in Javanese dance - probably as important as actions. It may be observed that movement patterns in Javanese dance start and end by a pose of the body, and that the flow of movement is counter-balanced by static positions of the entire body or its limbs. Although this observation seems to be characteristic of Javanese dance,\(^5\) it may in fact also be true for human movement in general.

Therefore it is not surprising that precisely where movement analysis is concerned, there are important correspondences between the arts of drawing and photography. One of the factors stimulating the development of photography in the course of the nineteenth century was the possibility created by this medium of analyzing movement-structure which is too rapid or too complex for the human eye to perceive with exactness. A famous example is the horse’s gait, which was analyzed with the help of photographic pictures. Consequently, photography developed not only as a means to retain a visual image, but also as a means to sharpen and refine the power of observation.

Historical photographic images

Historical black-and-white photographs have suddenly attracted people’s attention again, after decades of neglect during which they were kept hidden in dark attics and archive drawers, or even destroyed. Gradually, people started to realize that these ancient photographs form a unique source of information for the study of artistic

\(^3\) Historical black and white photographs were borrowed from archives of Ethnographic Museums and Leiden University libraries, The Netherlands, and from the library collection of the Mangkunagaran palace in Surakarta. Research photographs by the present author were made between 1972 - 1990.

\(^4\) Dance terms were collected during practice with Javanese dancers between 1972 - 1990. All descriptions have been checked by the well-known dance master Ngaliman (see Brakel-Papenhuyzen 1991:103-105). See also the discussion on Javanese dance terminology in Brakel-Papenhuyzen 1992.

\(^5\) Western authors have frequently made remarks about the ‘static’ and ‘slow’ movements of classical Javanese dance, as for example Faubion Bowers: ‘Juxtaposition of the two opposite kinds of movement [i.e. the passive and the active, CB] impels the dance and gives it its form ....... Each dance is full of pauses, silences, motions arrested in space, meditative poses, and passages of immobility’ (Bowers 1975:210-211).
developments, containing unexpected data about performances, artists and their context in the past. In fact, these photographs have proven to be an important complement to written sources and stories from the oral tradition.

This insight into the documentary value of (historical) images recently led to the founding of visual archives and the serious study of images, resulting in renewed publications and exhibitions. Even scholarly institutions which formerly looked down indignantly on the use of pictures as 'entertainment for the unlearned masses', have recently started to create data-bases of pictures and make use of visual means of instruction. Sometimes this has led to a completely reversed attitude, as is apparent in the following passage from a project description of the Chinese Studies Department, Leiden University:

'It is widely recognized that the written word can only provide a very inadequate picture of any civilisation, and certainly of any great historical civilisation that has existed in the past. This is especially true of Chinese traditional civilisation, in view of its very long existence and its extraordinary richness. However, in spite of that recognition, the transfer of information concerning the Chinese heritage still almost exclusively relies on texts. This is regrettable, for several reasons.

In the first place, texts and oral exposition are not able to convey a concrete and lively impression of a civilisation that largely has disappeared; they talk about the past, but are not able "to show what it was like" ....'

(The project 'Visual Documentation and Presentation of Traditional Chinese Civilization', p.1).

Without denying the value of images for scholarly investigation, I feel that the above remark needs some comment. Even if one agrees with the statement that 'the written word can only provide a very inadequate picture of any civilisation', this does not necessarily mean that a painted or photographic picture by itself represents an adequate understanding of a civilisation. One should always be aware of the fact that the production of pictures is restricted by limitations, not only of a technical nature (depending on the medium in which they are produced) but also of a social and contextual nature. Moreover, the immediate and fast impression which the picture makes on the senses holds the danger of faulty interpretation, which is particularly likely when the perceiver is not well-acquainted with the object or happening represented by the picture.

It must be apparent that faulty interpretation of a picture, or a lack of understanding of the representation, is more likely to happen when one is confronted with pictures produced in the (distant) past, or generally, in situations unknown to the perceiver. Thus, the proper interpretation of a historical picture may be as difficult as, or even more difficult than, the interpretation of a written historical document. The problem gets even more complex when one realizes that the producer of a picture may not have understood the objects or happenings represented by the picture, which may be
the case when photographic pictures are made by people travelling in foreign countries, or by technical experts unacquainted with the situation they are portraying. Thus the necessity to interpret and explain pictures in terms of language seems to have increased through the fast development of visual technology.

Discussions about the (im)proper use of photography by the world of the press have shown that photographs or any other type of image for that matter do not just 'go without saying'. However great its aesthetic attractiveness or artistic interest may be, a picture or photograph only becomes meaningful if one can interpret the image portrayed. And again it gains importance if one knows why, by whom and in which circumstances the picture was created.

Therefore historical images not only need to be properly conserved, they also need to be researched and documented in order to be valuable and interesting to a large group of people.

**Historical photographs from the Dutch East Indies.**
The development of photography in the former Dutch East Indies closely followed developments in Europe. Thus historical photographs of what is presently called Indonesia are not only found in The Netherlands, but also in Indonesia, and they were not only made by European photographers. One of the best-known 19th century photographers was a Javanese named Kasihan Cephas, born in Yogyakarta and on good terms with the royal family. Having been appointed official court photographer, he was given the chance (or received the request) to make photographs of court life, especially of ritual celebrations and the artistic performances presented at such occasions (music, theatre, dance).

In the course of the 19th and 20th centuries an increasing number of photographers set up photographic studios. These photographers, called *tukang potret* (to make a

---

6 In a recent article in NRC/Handelsblad Stephen Adolf discusses the publication of a new book with historical photographs of the dramatic happenings on May 7th 1945 in Amsterdam: 'However impressive the photographic material is in itself, the drama of May 7th is only brought out in full relief (perspective) by the accounts of eyewitnesses that have been included in the book' ('Het drama van 7 mei 1945', NRC/Handelsblad 7 May 1992:32).

A similar problem in the field of archeology has been signalled with regard to the interpretation of narrative reliefs on Javanese temples: 'Visual representations of narratives that have neither been preserved in written nor in oral form can no longer be fully understood.' (Klokke 1990:19).

7 I am grateful to Dirk J. Nijland for his comments on the complex issue of communication by (audio)visual means and written texts.

8 Apart from his photographs of court people and festivals, Cephas also acquired fame through his beautiful photographs of archeological objects, made in cooperation with scholars such as Groneman. Information on the life of the Cephas may be found in the article by C. Guillot 1981. His photographs became well-known through the publications of Groneman (for instance, 1888; 1897), scholar and court physician at the *kraton* of Yogyakarta.
Photograph is still called motret in Indonesia) made portraits of people, or of objects such as temples, to order. In many ways, the photographic images they produced kept up the traditional function of paintings and drawings made by European artists before. The problem of movement-analysis did not present itself, as the person depicted had to remain frozen in a motionless position for quite a while.

Unfortunately, such early portraits of Javanese actors and dancers do not provide much information about the art of dancing, in spite of the fact that stylized poses form an essential part of Javanese dance. As the dancers have not been photographed in a performance situation, their poses in front of the camera have the characteristic static quality of a 19th century photographer’s studio. And yet, they are not completely valueless for the study of theatre and dance. Sometimes, the arrangement of the dancers or actors in the picture reflect their positions on the stage. Moreover, photographs may contain interesting data about expressiveness of face and body, details of costume and contextual factors.

However, the information provided by historical photographs of the 19th century does have limitations, apart from those of a situational or a purely technical nature, such as the absence of colour. As the photographs have not been made with the aim of providing information to future generations, data which we would like to find on them nowadays are very often lacking.

Gradually, in the course of the 20th century, technical developments have enabled photographers to take pictures more rapidly than before, both inside and outside the photographic studio. Thus, photographic series could be made at the request of rulers of important court performances staged in the palace compound. Sometimes, a series of such photographs was collected and glued into a heavy, leather-bound album to serve as a prestigious present 'from ruler to ruler'. The plays depicted in these albums were performed at the Javanese courts to honour an important celebration of the Dutch royal family, such as Princess Juliana’s wedding in 1937. The performance in Yogyakarta would be attended not only by members of the Yogyakarta royal family and their subjects, but also by a large number of specially invited Dutch guests-of-honour. These Dutch guests, seated on chairs in the royal dance hall (pendhapa), received printed 'program-books' just as they would get when attending a performance in The Netherlands, containing the contents of the play and an outline of the 'acts' into which the action had been divided. Often such program-books were illustrated by a small number of photographs showing actors from the play.

Clearly these photographs made for albums or program-books are very strictly determined by their text and context. They usually depict actors and dancers in poses that actually occur in a particular performance of a play, since they were made to illustrate the textbook of that play. Sometimes, photographs taken as a series are found arranged in the album in accordance with the course of the story enacted during a particular performance.
Plate 1: portrait of the famous dancer-composer Tandhakusuma from the archive of the Mangkunagaran palace in Surakarta, last part of the 19th century.
Plate 2: The bow-shooting competition between Srikandi and Larasati, from the play entitled 'Srikandi megunu manah' (Srikandi learns to shoot arrows), performed in the kraton of Yogyakarta for the birth of Princess Beatrix on 12 February 1938 (Tekstboek 1938).

This dependence on a specific (con)text implies that the pictures have not been made with the intention of telling an independent story, like drawings in a comic-book. The fact that a comparatively small number of photographs have been made of the usually lengthy performances (several consecutive days for a play) proves that the photographs could not have been made with the aim of depicting the entire plot and course of the story. Photographers show a rather unpredictable liking for certain characters or scenes, irrespective of their relevance for the story portrayed. Partly, photographers may have followed their own tastes and preferences, which would explain why certain grotesque and funny yet minor characters such as animals and clowns have been photographed much more frequently than their function in the play would justify. On the other hand, some of the most essential scenes or characters have often not been photographed at all.

---

9 The program-book of the 1938 performances in Yogyakarta (Tekstboek 1938) contains two plays, each lasting one entire day; the first play is illustrated by two, the second play by three photographs.
Unfortunately, the characters and scenes depicted on ancient photographs do not usually 'speak for themselves', even if it is possible to identify a particular character by his or her costume and make-up. One of the reasons for this difficulty is that photographers often focus on only one personage from a theatre scene or dance formation, and seldom represent the whole scene as occurring in a performance. On the other hand, if a photograph represents a full scene, it may be impossible to distinguish the details which are essential for a proper interpretation. Thus, when coming across a picture without further (written) information - as often happens in historical visual archives - one may well be confronted with a 'puzzle-picture' which is difficult to interpret.

**Historical films of Javanese theatre dances**

Performances of Javanese theatre, especially those of court performances, have been a favourite topic not only of photographers, but they also often occur in historical films. One of the early filmers in the Dutch East Indies who made photographs and moving pictures of theatre and dances performed at the courts of Surakarta and Yogyakarta was Tassilo Adam (Adam 1927). During the 1920s he was commissioned by the Dutch government to make a film which would show to the people in The Netherlands what life in the colony was like. As he had originally worked on Sumatra as a planter, filming was probably his hobby rather than his profession, yet his documentary film entitled 'Mataram' was well-made and encountered much enthusiasm from Dutch audiences.

When trying to determine the historical value of this early mute black-and-white film for the present time, one should take into account that there is an essential difference between photography and film. If photography represents a static pose which may be part of a complex series of movements, but is not necessarily so, film in fact is frozen or rather fractioned movement. It is a series of tiny still images made of one and the same subject in quick succession, which is interpreted by the human eye as movement because of the speed by which the images are projected onto the screen.

The fact that the documentary 'Mataram' has been cast into no less than four different versions proves how the filmmaker wrestled with the possibilities and limitations of the new technology. Apparently, none of the versions were totally satisfactory to him. All the versions of his film have the fragmentary structure so characteristic of that era when film making had just started. Analysis of the pictures suggest that the film was produced in the following manner.

---

10 In 1934 he mentions in a letter to the director of the Ethnographic Museum in Stockholm that he would like to re-edit the film.
The filmmaker would 'shoot' series of tiny still images (shots) of a particular scene, object or person during a limited period of time, between thirty to forty seconds, at the most two or three minutes. A roll of film was filled with a number of different shots, which may have been taken at various times and places on different occasions, of people and objects which were not necessarily related.

In the next phase, the series of pictures (shots) were not only separated from one another (cut), they were also internally separated and rejoined in a way which satisfied the filmmaker and his editor. In a sense, the filmmaker played with the images, separating and connecting them in ways that suited his aim. The images were explained by a number of short explanatory texts, which were connected with a particular series of pictures. Consequently in the end product ('the film') the original sequences of images (shots) have been disrupted internally, and images that belong to very different times and places have been placed in a connection which they did not have 'in reality', that is when they occurred and were being filmed.

In a sense, this type of film-making may be compared to making an artistic drawing or painting, as it necessarily presents a very subjective organisation of images. It does not - as many people still assume - contain a 'realistic' image of 'reality' as an 'objective' registration of happenings occurring at a particular time and place.

All this should be kept in mind when watching the strips of edited shots, which occur in different combinations in the various versions of Tassilo Adam's documentary film Mataram. One stretch entitled Wajang Wong (drama with human actors) contains images of two court plays, performed in 1923 and 1926 by large groups of court dancer-actors and musicians, who were either members of the royal family or court servants (abdidalem). The majority of images belong to the play entitled: 'Suciptahening Mintaraga' (the ascetism of Arjuna). This play, featuring the popular hero Arjuna, uses a theme known for many centuries in Java, both from literary works and from reliefs on different temples and caves. The play was not only repeatedly performed at the court of Yogyakarta, but in other courts as well.

Tassilo Adam's film Wajang Wong was made at a performance in honour of the 'silver anniversary' of Queen Wilhelmina’s marriage. The images have been cut into series with lengths varying between 10 seconds to 2.5 minutes. The various sections of this mute film have been intersected by written texts, introducing and explaining the different scenes. Although there is no information on the writing of these texts, it may be assumed that the filmmaker himself provided the information or possibly even wrote them personally.

Contrary to what might be expected nowadays, the contents of the film only show a loose connection with the course and content of the enacted play. This holds true both for the arrangement of the images, and for the content of the explanatory texts. The succession of images is not determined by the content of the play, but the different shots have been arranged into clusters around a number of characters from
the play, such as the ascetic Arjuna, his servants and the nymphs tempting him; or the
demonic ruler Winatakawaca with his grotesque followers. Images of these characters
are embedded in contextual shots of musicians and the audience. Consequently, one
could not possibly learn from this film, not even in its most complete version,¹¹ what
is performed in this play.

Further analysis of the images shows that their contents do not actually permit
'telling the story'. The reason for this apparent vagueness is connected with the way
in which the film was made. The shots have been taken exclusively outside the
dance-hall (pendhapa), not during the performance on the dance-floor. One gets the
impression that the filmmaker just asked the actors to 'demonstrate some actions'
whilst they were resting in between appearances. The closest he gets to the dance area
is when he shoots dancers upon entering or leaving the pendhapa. It is also possible
that the images have been filmed on several separate occasions, possibly at different
rehearsal times.¹²

Consequently the relationship between image and reality - the reality of the
performance - is very loose in this film. The film does not offer an account of the
performance and does in fact not aim to do so. Indeed, the need for such an account
does not seem to have been felt at the time. Neither is its aim to explain, or even to
follow the plot of the play, as the documentary film 'Mataram' merely intended to
give a general idea, rather like snapshots, of life in the colony. Probably this limited
aim was at least partly due to technical limitations, as in those days it was not yet
possible to make a visual account on film of such complex happenings as court
theatre. Whereas the performances lasted for several consecutive days and involved
hundreds of artists, it was impossible to shoot continuously even for a few hours. The
reason why the film was not shot inside the dance-hall may be purely technical, as
there may not have been enough light for shooting, or the space may have been too
limited to set up the camera. But it is also possible that for some reason the Sultan
did not grant permission to do so.

However, in spite of all these limitations the film is of great historical value, if only
because it preserves unique images of actors and performances from the past. These
images provide information which cannot be found in any other document, such as
details of movement patterns, costumes, identities and personal expressions of actors,
and the context of past performances. Thus the film not only serves to increase our

¹¹ Of the Tassilo Adam films kept in The Netherlands, the most complete version of the wayang wong
performance at the kraton of Yogyakarta is represented by the film named 'Wayang Wong', sections of
which have been used in the documentary 'Mataram'.

¹² Whereas the first scenes of the film belong to the play 'Jaya Semadi', performed on 3 and 4
September, 1923, the other scenes belong to the performance of 'Suciptahening Mintaraga' on 10 and 11
February, 1926.
knowledge of the past, but also helps us to understand developments of the performing arts in Java. On the other hand one’s expectations of the information contained on ancient film should not be exaggerated. For example, it is quite impossible to ‘reconstruct’ forgotten scores of dance or theatre performances, as modern students and practitioners of the performing arts, both in Indonesia and abroad, often intend to do. The detailed information necessary for a reconstruction needs to be sought in written sources such as notations of dance and music scores, textbooks, or descriptions of performances in the past. Therefore, I am convinced of the necessity to consult written sources for the interpretation of historical, and probably also of recent, visual documents.

In conclusion, I want to reconsider the assertion of our Chinese friends quoted above. Without denying the unique qualities of visual images, either from the present or from the past, can one really maintain that: ‘the written word can only provide a very inadequate picture of any civilisation’, and that texts and oral exposition: ‘talk about the past, but are not able to show what it was like’?

In my opinion, written or orally delivered texts are indeed capable of depicting very vivid and detailed images of what happened at a particular time and place, however remote this may be from the reader or listener. As an example, I quote the description of the end of a battle-dance performed by two princes at the court of Surakarta in 1883, from a Javanese poem entitled ‘His Majesty dances’ (Sri Mataya), in Dhandhanggula metre (Padmasusastra 1898:47; translation CB):

’At the same time the rattle (keprak) sounds lively
As the dancing princes on the battlefield
Hold pistols, both of them
Circling around the arena
They are waiting to be exactly on the sound of the gong
Air iing with precision
They lean over to the right, then
Bang! sounds the fireshot.
The rattle stops all instruments - sudden silence.
Now the Sampak music is alternated with
The softly played Ayak-ayakan music...........’

References
Adam, Tassilo
Brakel-Papenhuyzen, Clara

Bowers, Faubion

Groneman, J.

Guillot, Claude

Klokke, Marijke J.

Padmasusastra, Ki

Tekstboek
This collection of source literature about dance and music in Surinam makes a large amount of information easily accessible. The original sources are widely dispersed, and there is not much specific literature on these subjects. Music and Dance in Surinam contains about 6000 pages of text and 369 illustrations, including photos, on microfilm. These are selected from 481 (of over 4000 examined) publications, which appeared before 1983, and which may be found in Dutch libraries. The editors listed about 120 other relevant publications from which - for various reasons - unfortunately no information could be collected. It must have been a tremendous job to finish this project.

The source information of the microfiche collection is very interesting. You can find publications as old as 1669 by Schiltkamp & Smidt or a fairly recent one from Ernst Heins in 1982. Even salient remarks were categorized by the editors. In a publication of 1855 we can read that the author, Focke disliked certain African ways of singing very much. There is information about music and dance of all the different ethnic groups in Surinam. The major part of the literature deals with Black music. I was pleased to find also lyrics and/or written music of songs of which I never expected notations. For instance, of a lobi singi (critical-satirical song/dance of Creole women) by Comvalius.

In most cases the quality of the texts and photos on microfiche is good. I love the photo of a gamelan ensemble. This collection does not deal with Surinam musicians who lived or live outside Surinam (especially in The Netherlands) like Kid Dynamite, Lex van Spal, Max Woisky, Oscar Harris, and so on. The title 'Music and Dance in Surinam' has therefore become a problem: by now half of the Surinam people live in the Netherlands.

The microfiches are ordered from 1 to 116 in a ring binder with 5 plastic sheets. There are microfiches for respectively indexes, bibliographies, texts and photos. All publications of texts and photos are numbered. The indexes refer to these publication numbers and photo numbers. The accompanying guidebook contains an
98 REVIEWS

introduction and 3 lists. The first list is a glossary. It also refers to authors, publication numbers and photo numbers in connection with an entry. By using this list you will find general information. For more specific information you need the second and third list. The second list consists of alphabetically ordered catchwords. Every catchword is provided with codes. These codes come from the third list, consisting of 3 coded lists: Population groups, Occasions and Subjects.

The (more detailed) microfiche indexes come from these coded lists and three combinations: Population groups + Occasions, Population groups + Subjects, and Occasions + Subjects. The examples in the guidebook show how to use the above-mentioned lists to get the desired information.

Now we have come to the important question of whether this searching system works. I can reply to this in the affirmative sense, but the system is not as easy as it seems. In the first place a microfiche system is rather slow for such a large amount of data. Moreover, a microfiche device has to be found to read the microfiches, and this may not always be very easy.

Further, I had several problems with the guidebook. This book is written in English, but the more detailed codes on the index microfiches are written in Dutch, without a translation. Also, the English language is not used consistently in the glossary and code list. For instance, Surinaamsche wals is not translated into 'Surinam waltz', but orkest is translated into 'orchestra'. Only the brief descriptions of terms in the glossary have Dutch translations. Unfortunately the Surinam language (Sranantongo) is used in several spellings. If you use the spelling 'Djuka' you should also write 'Poku' and not 'Pokoe'. The guidebook should also include a short explanation of the modern Sranantongo spelling.

Words in the guide-lists are not mentioned with possible synonyms. For instance, a certain Creole music named bigi poku can also be named skratyi poku and in some cases motjo poku. If you did not already know this, you may be in trouble here. The editors chose to use English terms as well as terms literally taken from the original texts in other languages, usually without synonyms. In my experience this does not work well, because you do not know the spelling of a certain passage of original text before.

A difficult point is the difference made between 'general' and 'specific' information. You find yourself regularly switching between the glossary and catchword index for one kind of information. Perhaps it would work more easily to combine the two lists into one list that provides the user with information of both.

Each entry in the glossary lists the names of the authors who wrote about it. Unfortunately, this does not happen in the catchword list or microfiche index: you have to see the texts to find out about the authors' names.

The coding system has an ethnic base (Creole, Hindustani, Javanese, and so on). In many cases this works very well. But there is no good possibility to trace
exceptions. For instance, Arawak Indians playing Creole music created *kawina* music. In the Philharmonic orchestra, and some other ensembles, several ethnic groups played or play together.

The way of presenting information about authors and publications in the glossary is not explained. In the beginning it took me quite some time to understand that Biharie 1971(86)199 means: author is Biharie, year of publication is 1971, publication number on microfiche is 86 and I have to search on page 199 of the presented section of that publication. In the list of abbreviations for libraries the ECJK is not mentioned (ECJK = Ethnomusicological Centre Jaap Kunst).

Some important words are missing in the catchword list. For instance: *Militaire kapel* (the first professional Surinam orchestra), CCS (Cultural Centre of Surinam), NAKS (important for the *kawina* music), Surinam national anthem, and so on.

A clear index system is needed to find the right places on the 6000 presented pages from the literature. Thus the catchword list surely has to have more essential entries, including names of cultural institutes, orchestras, groups and persons. A missing catchword means much more searching. I conclude that improvements could be made to the guidebook, in spite of the very detailed index system. Maybe another way of referring to the texts and photos should be used. The two editors did a good job, but the guidebook does not work as it should do.

Concluding this review, I think that relevant sources of music and dance concerning Surinam are collected for the most part. Due to the fact that the system and the guidebook do not allow you to work with optimal efficiency, it might mean that some parts of the information still remain too much hidden. Nevertheless this microfiche collection is a real giant step in the right direction.


ELISABETH DEN OTTER

The subtitle of this book, 'Dance, music and cultural dynamics in a Polynesian kingdom', refers to a subject about which still very little is known in the Netherlands.¹ Earlier Ad Linkels and his wife Lucia wrote *Van schelphoorn tot disco*:

---

Ad and Lucia Linkels are interested in music and dance from Polynesia in their capacity as music and dance teachers. They made a number of research trips which resulted in above mentioned books and accompanying sound material. Their book about Tonga is the result of a research trip of seven months in 1986, in order to - in their own words - ' jot down songs and dances and to transmit them to people interested in them upon our return to the Netherlands.' What fascinated them most were the similarities and the differences between western Samoa, earlier studied by them, and Tonga; the developments and the future of the Tongan tradition were the central point.

They went to Tonga with the following questions:
- Which developments are taking place in Tongan society?
- Are those development processes in some way visible or audible in the dances and songs?
- Do such changes determine in some way the attitude of the Tongans towards the traditional forms of expression?

This is not so much an academic, musicological book, with transcriptions and analyses, as a description of the music and dance in the daily life of the Tongans, intended for a broad Dutch public.

*Dynamics of Tongan culture.* After an introduction on Tonga - 169 islands in the Pacific Ocean - and the Tongans, and their developmental issues and future (a fantastic photograph of the King of Tonga, complete with ski-goggles as status symbol is to be found on page 17), the songs, dances and musical instruments - traditional and modern - are described in part II.

The songs are divided into profane and religious songs, with a short paragraph on imported popular songs and pop songs. The most important still-existing forms of dance are described extensively, with a short comment on dances as entertainment for tourists and dances in European-American style. The musical instruments are presented likewise: first the indigenous instruments (including the slit drum, the Jew’s harp, the conch shell and the nose flute), then the imported stringed instruments, and finally modern ensembles such as string bands, brass bands and pop groups.

---

2 A shorter and revised version of this book has been published in 1991, including a cassette, by Mundo Etnico, Sibeliusstraat 707, 5011 JR Tilburg, The Netherlands.
In part III, 'Tradition of the future', the Tongans voice their vision on the preservation and development of their traditions, often called the 'vision of the participants' by anthropologists.

The most significant aspect of this book is the fact that the traditional music and dance are so clearly linked with the developmental issues and the future of the Tongans. Influences from outside can - to a certain extent - be absorbed, but the Tongan tradition must remain recognizable.

If it is to be avoided that the characteristic music and dance become merely folklore - through a process of westernization and through the influence of tourism - these forms of expression will need to have a function in society. Therefore, the last sentence of the book reads: 'Renewed but traditional Tongan music and dance will therefore be of importance in the future, to propagate a cultural identity of their own and to realize that they are unique.'

Recordings by Ad Linkels:

- **Popular dances of Tonga**, Mundo Etnico ME 87-1.
- **Current music of Tonga**, Lyrichord LLST 7400.
- **Music from Western Samoa, from conch shell to disco**, Ethnic Folkways Records FE 4270. Also: Smithsonian Folkways cassette FE 4270.
- 6 **Samoaanse dansen**, Hakketoon EPE 84-1 (mini-LP), (accompanying manual for the dances: Siva Samoa 1, Ad and Lucia Linkels, 1985).
- **Malie!! Beautiful!! Dance music of Tonga**, CD PAN 2011.


HENRICE M. VONCK

In January 1986 the Dutch ethnomusicology student Gijs Schneemann left for Siberut, a small island near the west coast of Sumatra, never to return again. He died several months later on the island, only three weeks before his return to Holland. Whereas the fieldwork material he left behind was not suitable for publication, his letters from Siberut proved to be easily accessible and even impressive. In this book we find a collection of his letters, which were skillfully gathered and edited by Jeanette Werkhoven. It is meant as a kirékat, which means 'a sign for remembering a dead person' in the Mentawai language.
During his stay in Siberut, Gijs Schneemann wrote many letters to his girlfriend, family and friends in Holland. In these letters he fully expresses himself. He catches the reader's attention with his poetic depictions of tropical nature, of his personal feelings about the contact with the Mentawai, the inhabitants of the island, his experiences in the field, and the achievements as well as the set-backs in his research. But there is also a flaw of disappointment, endless longing for the Dutch blue skies, the long and winding rivers, quiet and privacy, which he could not find among the Mentawai.

In his letters we meet Gijs Schneemann doing fieldwork as a young, inexperienced ethnomusicologist. He was inspired to go to Siberut by the work of the anthropologist Reimar Schefold, who lived for several years among the Mentawai. Reimar Schefold has documented their life, music and culture on film and in books, which they discussed together on several occasions before his departure.

As he himself states in one of his letters, Gijs Schneemann was attracted by the image, depicted by Reimar Schefold, of the Mentawai as a pure and friendly people, who in some parts of the island still live in the Stone Age. He was looking for these 'Reimar-book people' with their culture from a distant past, which he associated with tranquility and insight into human life. He was attracted even more by the fact that he was to be one of the first ethnomusicologists to do research on their music. For his MA thesis, he was looking for the songs and dances of the ritual healing ceremonies of the Mentawai, performed by si-kerei, their traditional medicine men.

Right at the beginning of his fieldwork the first disappointment already awaits him. His first experiences with the Sumatran people in Padang, where he stays to make some necessary preparations, do not coincide with the idea he has himself formed about the contemplative Eastern people. He is disturbed by their continuous presence, their curiosity and the noises on the street, and he finds no rest and time to write his letters.

Then Gijs leaves for Siberut, in search of the songs of the si-kerei. The first period, he does his research on the island alone. He visits some informants and rituals, but here too he does not find the rest he needs to concentrate fully on the job. People constantly beg for presents, as they expect to get from a Western anthropologist. His contact with the Mentawai is disturbed by his irritation about their continuous curiosity and questions, the long periods of waiting, the difficulties in making himself understood, because he does not speak their language. Above all, the Mentawai are not interested in his questions. And, alas, in Siberut there is electricity too, so that even here he is haunted by the sound of tv sets.

After a month he has already attended several ceremonies. Gijs is very impressed, but he is also disappointed. The songs are performed together with drumming, cymbals and dance. This dancing on a floor with loose wooden planks makes the
text of the songs almost unintelligible and the recording of the music difficult. Because he does not speak the Mentawai language, he cannot understand the song texts and ask the questions that come to his mind.

The heat hinders him very much, and has a bad influence on his memory and concentration. He feels that he has not collected enough material in this month, and the few recordings are not even suitable for documentation purposes. In this condition he waits for Hanefi, a music student from Padang, who will assist him in the coming period. Hence the presence and assistance of Hanefi in interpreting the texts and interviewing the people is a great improvement. Moreover, at last Gijs has a friend and company to pass the time that weighs heavily on his shoulders.

In the introduction to the book, Reimar Schefold points out that the assistance of Hanefi may have had other effects. There are only a few traditional Mentawai left in Siberut. During the last 15 years the Indonesian government has succeeded in transforming their traditional life in the uma - the traditional family houses in the woods - into a modern, standard Western life style in villages near the coast, with schools, churches and electricity. The Mentawai are forbidden to continue their own traditions. In order not to lose their traditions entirely, the Mentawai have to hide in the forest when they perform their traditional healing ceremonies. This modernization program, carried out under the Sumatrans, obviously gives rise to social tensions between the Sumatrans and the Mentawai. As a result, through the company of Hanefi, Gijs could have been associated with the 'ruling class' and the threatening of tradition, and therefore hindered in his research. Gijs himself mentions this too. He notices that in the company of Hanefi the Mentawai act differently and speak about their own culture in a detached manner. They are less approachable and Gijs is not able to bridge the gap.

After a short interlude in Sumatra, Gijs and Hanefi leave for the second period of fieldwork in Siberut. This time to round off the research, make good sound recordings, and a film. During this second period Gijs becomes ill. The diagnosis is malaria tropica. Transport to Sumatra, where he could find the necessary medical assistance, is not possible because of the festivities at the end of Ramadan. Gijs dies in the early morning of 11 June, 1986, and is buried the next day at a Roman Catholic graveyard near the coast.

After reading these letters it becomes clear why Gijs Schneemann left us only scattered fragments, and no scientific report, no film, no documented music. He encountered too many problems to be able to carry out his research properly. One may wonder whether he could not have forseen part of this. And what about his supervisors at the University? Should they not have instructed him how to deal with such problems? All the problems he encountered belong to the field of methods and techniques in fieldwork.
He should have known that there would be long periods of waiting in the field, and be prepared for it, without feelings of irritation. First of all you have to make people enthusiastic about your research before you can expect them to cooperate. Why should anyone be interested in the silly questions you ask about music?

He could also have been better prepared for the difficulties in finding and recording good music material in such an area. His program was ambitious. Six months were certainly not enough to realize the filming, the photographing and the recording of the music in such a vast area with few transport facilities.

Last, but not least, Gijs was obvious a romantic, attracted by an ideal image of the island as a place of purity and rest. A contemplative rest, that is, as you may find in a Medieval painting of a chair, a table and a candle, as he writes in a letter. But here in Siberut he does not find that at all. On the contrary: life bumps in on him in a way he could not cope with. He feels that his creativity is inhibited. He needs more time to think, to be alone instead of being a public attraction. He could not manifest himself the way he wanted and could not find the rest to work things out.

There was no real dialogue between him and his Mentawai informants. In his last letter he says that the success of his research will very much depend on his productivity and creativity in dealing with the material when he is back in Holland. He never got the chance to do so.

He only leaves us his letters. In my opinion no less worthwhile than the music he was looking for. Letters which show him as the romantic he is, in search of an ideal he could not find.

Rokus de Groot, *Compositie en intentie van Ton de Leeuws muziek; Van een evolutionair naar een cyclisch paradigma* [Composition and intention of Ton de Leeuw’s music: from an evolutionary to a cyclical paradigm]. Ph.D. University of Utrecht. University of Amsterdam: Vakgroep Muziekwetenschap. 517pp.+12, musical examples. ISBN 90-9004735-2.

GERARD VAN WOLFEREN

Rokus de Groot obtained his Doctor’s degree from the University of Utrecht on 4 December, 1991. His thesis is a study of the compositions and ideas of the Dutch composer Ton de Leeuw. His promotor, P. M. Op de Coul, mentioned at the promotion that this dissertation is the first one about the work of a living Dutch
composer written after 1945. In contrast, several studies on Dutch writers have appeared during the last fifty years.

Initially, this study was intended to include the work of Peter Schat and Theo Loevendie as well. Later on, the research was limited to Ton de Leeuw’s compositions. According to de Groot, Ton de Leeuw’s conceptions are essentially different from those of his contemporaries.

Thinking of 'ideal sound', Ton de Leeuw created his own technique: verwijsde modaliteit (widened modality). De Groot describes this essential feature of Ton de Leeuw’s work as a search for the best suitable way to combine 'intention' and 'composition'. The concept of 'widened modality' is introduced step by step, using some compositions from the 1980s to show how de Leeuw creates structures in an amazingly clear fashion. Some of the basic techniques are applied in an seemingly independent way; nevertheless, they create the typical music of Ton de Leeuw.

Rokus de Groat also tried to make an inventory of de Leeuw’s intentions in a series of talks with the composer to reveal the relation between 'intention' and 'composition'. Finally, he described the process 'from an evolutionary to a cyclical paradigm' as a re-discovery of early European (isorhythm, de Machault), Asian (Central-Javanese, Hindu), and Arabic static-cyclical thoughts on musical structure. This renewed attention for those principles came, according to de Leeuw, after a period of evolutionistic thinking in Europe, with composers like Beethoven and Wagner.

Method. De Groot’s research method is based on a critical dialogue between the composer and the researcher. De Groot checked the consistency of Ton de Leeuw’s compositions and statements, and de Leeuw commented on de Groot’s conclusions.

Widened Modality. Ton de Leeuw’s compositions start from a structure called toon-duur model (tone-duration model). This model may exist in the composer’s mind, or on a piece of paper. It can almost never be heard as a whole in the performed music. What can be heard are the sounds remaining after a process of filtering. A tone model or a duration model may be used as a filter. Certain ways of filtering may result in a specific effect, called 'fluctuation'. By using the 'tone-duration model', one selects a set of tones, and the duration of each selected tone is limited by the appearance of the next tone. De Leeuw’s 'tone-duration model' consists of formal aspects such as wave structure, space and time symmetry. These unfold gradually, thereby closing the gap between two tones limiting the range of an ambitus. On a higher level of organization, aspects as ornamentation

---

3 In fact, this is not correct. In 1989 Charlotte Grace Mueller obtained her Ph.D. from the University of Texas, Austin, with the dissertation The music of contemporary Dutch composer, Jan van Vlijmen.
and the development of tempo, dynamics and timbre are determined by the interaction of patterns (secondary differentiation).

**Ideal sound.** Since he was seventeen years old, Ton de Leeuw developed a concept of ideal sound, that he tried to realize ever since. It is an image of an eternal flow of sounds '... in which all components are treated equally. That is, all remote corners of sound are filled with life. It is one continuous exchange of colours and movements and unprecedented variegations' (letter to his friend Willem Adriaans, January, 1960). The starting point for the realization of this dream was the serial composition technique. In those days, this was the common technique. De Groot writes, that Ton de Leeuw was 'not motivated by a taboo: the taboo of tonality, the triad, the octave, repetition, etcetera. He rather wanted to give all musical components equal treatment'.

In the 1980s, Ton de Leeuw's 'intention' is still based on his concept of an ideal sound. His musical intuition is inclined to use the static, cyclic formulae of Asian music. Ideas like 'everything is already present', 'nothing has to coincide', 'no action', 'flowing with the stream' and 'balance', are the opposition of 'developmental' and 'tension seeking' ideas in Western music, according to Ton de Leeuw. De Groot points out that de Leeuw is searching for an alternative coherent music tradition, instead of the Western pluriform tradition: Ton de Leeuw has created a tradition of his own.

In his conclusion de Groot remarks that Ton de Leeuw's way of composing needs a different method of analysis than the traditional analytical methods. De Groot had the advantage of becoming familiar with Ton de Leeuw's method of composing, because of the talks they had. One may think that in this way the analysis is carried out through the composer's eyes. Does the absence of an objective analytical method not undermine the reliability of this study? I do not think so. First of all, this way of working is known from ethnomusicology: relating theory and practice, and translating the concepts into a musicological description. Secondly, de Groot's aim was not to make an analysis of the process of listening but the reconstruction of the process of composing. Describing this relationship in the works of composers who died long ago is the main problem of music historians, as they never have the opportunity to check their conclusions in an interview with the composer.

It is clear that de Groot greatly respects Ton de Leeuw as a composer. De Leeuw is not just his informant, but he seems to play the role of a guru (teacher). De Groot seems to be trying to understand rather than to criticize. This may be the reason why de Groot intended to describe de Leeuw's theory from a holistic approach. With such a method, the researcher always has the last say in the discussion. There is, however, the possibility that the composer may change his
point of view during the many discussions, being influenced by the researcher's earlier findings.

There are more inconsistencies in the theory of Ton de Leeuw than de Groot mentioned. Musicologists often consider Asian music to be cyclical, and, in contrast, European music to be linear. Ton de Leeuw mentions the isorhythms of de Machault as one of his starting points. However, he uses many more European techniques, like canon and rondeaux (cyclical forms), and the diminution techniques (formalized way of ornamenting). The use of a multitude of timbral possibilities may even be more European than Asian or Arabic. For me, Ton de Leeuw is a typical European composer, who faces the same problems as, for instance, Schönberg, Webern, Stockhausen and Messiaen. De Leeuw definitely uses Asian concepts like 'everything is already present'. However, in regarding music as the actual sounding part, or layer, of an eternal flow of sounds, Ton de Leeuw and Rokus de Groot over-emphasize the role of Asian concepts.

Rokus de Groot has succeeded very well in writing a book on a difficult subject. Such a topic can only be researched by using the artist both as a subject, and as a critic to give feedback. Without this feedback the study might have been more objective, but it would also have been less interesting. I am convinced that this book will remain an important reference for future studies on contemporary Dutch composers. As such, it is a valuable scholarly contribution.


HEIN CALIS

To most people, including many scholars, bibliographies come into the same category as telephone directories or floral catalogues: listings of names or objects. But if one perceives a bibliography as the description of a bibliothèque idéal, the collection that exists only in the mind, it obtains a quite different dimension. A good bibliography is far more than a listing. It is a guide through half-known land, revealing, suggestive, opening up unexpected side-views through the collection of published documents, in much the same way as those librarians of the old school did.

Since the mid-sixties, much has changed in the library. Computerized catalogues help to rule the ever-growing stream of academic publications. Also, many of the 'guiding' tasks of librarians have been taken over, in a more 'objective' way, by automated search profiles, and interactive retrieval of information. The stormy
developments in catalogue control within the libraries go together with the appearance of large-scale bibliographies and abstracting services with sophisticated indexing systems, for users outside the reach of on-line catalogues.

Students and scholars in ethnomusicology have long been kept exempt from the benefits of these modern devices of bibliographic control. This is partly due to the lack of a standard theoretical framework for the discipline and, consequently, to the absence of a consolidated and recognized ethnomusicological terminology. The long struggle of the RILM project to cope with the subject breakdown in this field is but one supporting example. For a long time we had to rely solely on the geographical approach and broad categories like 'folk song', 'ritual music', or 'mode'. Ethnomusicologists with bibliographical skills were scarce and a librarian with ethnomusicological training could be qualified as a white crow.

Therefore, it does not come as a surprise that Ann Schuursma’s selected bibliography radically discards the geographical or ethnographical approach. Ann Schuursma has served as a long-term librarian and director of the Ethnomusicological Archives at UCLA. She is advisor on ethnomusicology to the RILM project, and finished her Ph.D. dissertation on Rumanian midwinter kolinda a few years ago. Strangely enough the RILM project is not even mentioned in the paragraph dealing with bibliographic control in ethnomusicology.

Instead of a culture-specific bibliography she presents a general listing of books and articles under five broad headings: (i) history of the field, (ii) theory and methodology, (iii) fieldwork theory and method, (iv) musical analysis, and (v) sources from related fields. The reasons for this stance are mentioned in the preface: the absence of a general research bibliography since Kunst’s Ethnomusicology (1960), the importantly-felt need for 'a good general bibliography aimed at both lay persons and scholars', and, of course, the production of several culture or area-specific bibliographies by specialists such as Fredric Lieberman, Mervyn McLean, Ken Gourlay, or James Porter, in the recent past.

The emphasis on the main issues of ethnomusicological research is refreshing, and at the same time so obvious that one is surprised that this approach is not used much more frequently in our discipline. The first, rather small section, deals with the recent upsurge of historical interest in ethnomusicology, including questions of definitions and paradigms. The second (Theory and Method) and third (Fieldwork) sections, constitute the core of the bibliography. They encompass 'the major works that reflect the overall research activity...'. The part on fieldwork focuses on both the theoretical background, and the more practical aspects, drawing largely on anthropological literature. Musical analysis (part IV), mainly the preoccupation of the late 60s and 70s, covers a variety of approaches. Part V, Sources from related fields, comprises a rather loosely-fit sample of publications mainly in the social sciences. A Name index, listing authors, editors, translators, etc., and a Subject
index, including also names of tribes and nations, and sometimes even titles, complete the book.

For the selection of her materials, Ann Schuursma of course relied on her experience as librarian in one of the most important research collections in the American West. A second source is formed by the reading lists of the main US ethnomusicology curricula. This strategy probably accounts for some bias in the 'related fields' section.

Taken as a whole, the nearly 500 titles in the bibliography constitute the ideal library to have at hand for an ethnomusicology curriculum in a music department. It reflects the important trends in American ethnomusicology from the sixties onwards. Its main asset is the emphasis on theory and methodology, leaving out all the descriptive studies of the X-tribe in Y-land.

There are limitations, however. The bibliography excludes publications on popular music, dance and organology, mainly for practical reasons. The theoretical orientation of the book, though, deserves the inclusion of the main theories of popular music and improvised music. One misses Charles Keil or Jeff Todd Titon on the blues, Gunther Schüller's epoch-making study of early jazz and Mike Haralambos' evaluation of the popular singer, to name but a few titles that spring to mind.

Another weak side is the limitation to American literature. There is no trace of the important German contributions to the European folk song studies and tune family theories. Typical European issues such as the study of musical instruments and iconographical sources are left untouched. Even A.B. Lord's Singer of tales, a real classic in the theory of oral transmission, does not turn up in this bibliography. French ethnomusicology is virtually non-existent. Only Zemp's English-language publications are respresented; the same goes for J.J. Nattiez and the influential 'school' of semiotics in French-speaking Canada, or the output of Latin American scholars.

Even within the language limitation there are strange choices. The inclusion of, for instance, Karl Popper's Conjectures and refutations is trendy, but not very relevant. At the same time, one looks in vain for the main works of Lévi-Strauss, very relevant for the theory of culture, and all translated into English. As a whole, the fifth section (Sources from related fields) is the most unbalanced part of the book, and seems to suffer from the way Ann Schuursma collected her materials. I would have abandoned many of the 150-odd titles in this section to expand on the core matter, 'the most significant and representative recent literature in the field of ethnomusicology' as the preface states.

The largest part, theory and method, could then possibly be regrouped in broad classes representing research trends, like performance studies, the linguistic and cognitive approaches, gender studies, structuralism, etc.
One of its nice features are the short annotations, very factual and to the point, revealing the insights of a trained ethnomusicologist. Remarkable also is the attempt to highlight examples of research, probably inspired by an article of Hafez Modir (item 110 in the bibliography) on research models in ethnomusicology. Under the heading 'Model' in the subject index a couple of dozen studies are listed.

In the subject index helpful hints of this type go side by side with strange terminology and occasional bloopers, such as the indexing of the Herndon-Kolinski debate on musical analysis under 'sacred cows, herding of'.

Of course, these are the inevitable teething troubles of a guide to the field of ethnomusicological research. Hopefully one day there will be an expanded edition also covering the non-American literature and trends. Already now, the field has a powerful tool and a work of fine librarianship.


WIM VAN ZANTEN

This book on female court dances in the kraton of Surakarta and Yogyakarta in central Java is a valuable addition to the literature on Indonesian performing arts. It is the revised version of Clara Brakel’s Ph.D. dissertation of 1988, and a thorough discussion of Javanese concepts and manuscripts, containing dance theory. This is combined with an analysis of the dance practice. For many years the author participated in dance and music, and took dance lessons in Java. This combination of theory and practice is in line with the Javanese, who generally do not separate artistic theory and practice (p.306). We are very fortunate that the author followed their example, and wrote a book from this perspective.

The bedhaya dances are performed by a group of nine female dancers with the accompaniment of solo and choral singing, and a gamelan ensemble. The singing (texts and music) and dancing, the most important parts of the performance according to the Javanese, are discussed in separate chapters. The gamelan accompaniment, by which the singing and dancing are coordinated, is treated only in the context of the singing and the dancing. The more general points and the context are discussed first, followed by the more specific and formal aspects of the different components.

After an introduction, the court dances are discussed as they were performed in 1982. This is followed by the three main chapters: 3. Javanese written sources on origin and performance of bedhaya dancing, 4. Songs of bedhaya dances, and 5.
Structural analysis of *bedhaya* choreography. Chapter 6 is a shorter chapter on Javanese scores of *bedhaya* dances. The Appendix contains five complete Javanese song texts of *bedhaya* performances, without English translation. Further, the Appendix supplies a transcription of the 'Bedhaya Sumreg' from a Yogyakarta manuscript, with a reconstruction of the choreography (group formations). This is followed by a Bibliography, Glossary and Index, and 24 illustrations.

Chapter 5, on the choreography of the dances, seems to me very important for the study of Javanese dance. The Javanese make a distinction between group formation (rakit, gambar pernah), sequences of dance movements, forming a movement pattern (kembangan), and transitional movement sections (sendhi). These concepts are used in the structural analyses of some sections of *bedhaya* dances. The dances are described with diagrams of the formation of the nine dancers, the movement patterns, and the transitional movement sections, in combination with the temporal organization given by the structural tones of the gamelan music ('colotomic structure').

To the Javanese, the group formations in which the dancers are arranged seem to 'constitute an essential and characteristic formal factor of bedhaya dancing, which we could expect to find in all bedhaya choreographies, irrespective of the theme of the song.' (p.185). The group formations also get the most attention in Clara Brakel's analysis. Fair enough, but more attention to the structural aspects of the movement patterns (kembangan) could have provided more insight into the classification principles of the Javanese. This could have given more depth to interesting remarks such as 'movements in space and dance movements are mirrored' (p.259), and 'terms referring to leg and trunk movements or positions precede the terms for arm and head movements in the notation (read from left to right), even though they are performed at the same time' (p.303).

On page 188 the diagrams for the group formations are introduced. I think this notation system deserves a more thorough introduction. Why does, for instance, the reading direction from left to right represent the south-north direction of the dance space? Why does this not correspond with the west-east direction? North would then be represented by the upper part of the page, and south by the lower part. This is the way most geographical maps are made, and also the plans of the two dance floors (pendhapa) in the Surakarta and Yogyakarta courts in Figures 12 and 13 of this book. Is it because of the ruler of the court sitting on the western side, that this is represented by the upper part of the page? Does this correspond to the Javanese way of representing these diagrams, for instance, such as given in Figure 14 from a Yogyakarta manuscript?

Maybe this last question would have been solved if chapters 6 (Javanese scores) and 5 (Clara Brakel's structural analysis) had been discussed in reverse order. It is
not in line with Clara Brakel's general approach to give her own diagrams first, and then talk about the notation systems as used by the Javanese.

The analysis of the songs in chapter 4, the formal structure and the contents of the poems, is very detailed. However, this chapter was the least convincing to me. I prefer a more separate treatment of form and contents of the texts, and I miss the general lines in the analysis. After reading this chapter, I still have no clear picture of the main themes of the texts and the most important musical characteristics of the songs.

On page 20, Becker's (1980:20) remarks about the oral music tradition are applied to the dance tradition: 'What Becker has remarked about gamelan musicians applies equally to traditional Javanese dancers: they are learning a process rather than a fixed content.' According to me, Becker does not explain very well that although in an oral tradition the learning process may be different from the learning process in a written tradition, the 'contents' of a performance may be almost entirely fixed. Clara Brakel's discussion of the bedhaya dances is illuminating in this respect. I quote: '... in principle compositions are fixed' (p.74); 'The bedhaya being group dances performed in unison, their practice does not allow for improvisation during the performance and their complex choreographies are always set according to special rules' (p.279); '... the compositions were open to variation and change, be it not usually on the performer's side' (p.307). The 'contents' of the different performances and the 'contents' of the different compositions have to be distinguished. The Javanese concept mutrani, to (re-)create a composition after an existing model' does not so much refer to the 'contents' of the performances.

An English translation of the Javanese texts in the Appendix would have made the book more useful for the general reader. In the Glossary and index the use of passim after many terms is not very helpful. Why not (also) mention the most important pages on which these terms occur? But these are only minor shortcomings. I can strongly recommend this book to those who are interested in the analysis of dance as a means of communication by text, context, music, dance formations and dance movements.

References
Becker, Judith
RECORD REVIEWS


HANS VAN STRATEN

This first CD of the Dutch ensemble Čalgija was presented to the audience at the 'Ijsbreker' in Amsterdam on 9 January, 1992. The ensemble was formed in 1969 by the ethnomusicologist Wouter Swets. As Swets says in the documentation added to the CD (p.2): 'Its [the ensemble's] object was to perform folk music from the Balkans and Anatolia in a way characteristic of the authentic expression of this music as it is still played by autochtonous musicians of these countries. (...) Čalgija wants to contribute to a development in the musical folklore of this vast but culturally coherent area in such a way that the feeling for tradition and the enrichment of the rendering by means of contemporary experimental elaborating of historical stylistic models go hand in hand.' I must say that Čalgija succeeds in achieving its object on this CD. The pieces sound very authentic even though a synthesizer has been used.

In the information for track eight we can read why the ensemble has been called Čalgija. In the nineteenth-century Macedonian towns, inhabited mostly by Turks, the so-called *çalgija* ensembles came on the scene. They used Turkish instruments together with the Western clarinet and violin and they had a mixed Balkan-Turkish repertoire. 'The similarity in mentality, used instruments, and repertoire gave the Dutch ensemble Čalgija its name', to say it in Swets' words.

The CD contains twenty pieces from different areas of the Balkans and Anatolia. Every piece is well-documented in the booklet by Swets. He provides information about the geographical origin, the modes, the names of the musicians, and on which instruments they play, the contents of the songs, and last but not least, the meters.

The metrical variety in the folk music of this region is extremely rich. The metrical patterns can be very complicated. For example, on the first track, *Aide Mor’ Milia*, the meter is 29/16. Swets divides this into groups of two, three and four beats: (3+2+2)+(2+2+2+4)+(3+2+2+3+2). With this in mind, the listener will finally, after playing this piece several times, get the feeling of the rhythm.
We can hear twenty-seven different metrical patterns on the CD. Very interesting and strange to Western ears, is the technique of metrical shortening which is characteristic for certain regions. There are three pieces demonstrating this fascinating phenomenon.

There is a list of 25 instruments with a short description. Moreover, we can see who is playing which instrument on which track. On two tracks Čalgija introduces new unusual combinations of instruments: a modern clarinet together with a Bulgarian bagpipe or a *santur* and *kanun* together with traditional Macedonian instruments. There is also a list of the used modes and their structure.

Swets is a 'walking encyclopedia', and a competent musician, concerning the music of the Balkans and Anatolia. He is able to put the music of the different areas in a large geographical context and to compare them with each other in a rather objective way, where ethnomusicologists in the respective areas fail. Moreover, Swets is able to put his theoretical knowledge into practice. He arranged most pieces and added *ritornelli*, extra melodic phrases or improvisational sections to the existing songs.

Čalgija consists of competent musicians, especially the clarinet player Jan Hofmeijer, and it has been able to create an authentic atmosphere on this CD. Although Čalgija's vocalist is a good singer and able to render perfectly each song in the local style, his voice does not throw me into ecstasy. In my opinion, the vocals are mixed too much to the background. Despite this critical note, I must say that I very much enjoyed listening to this CD. It is a welcome addition to the repertoire of 'world music'.
Jaap Kunst Foundation

GEURT BRINKGREVE

The Stichting Jaap Kunst was founded by Sjuwke M.L. Brinkgreve-Kunst and Egbert D. Kunst in Amsterdam on 3 June, 1991. The foundation is called after their father. The aims of the foundation are:

* To encourage ethnomusicological research.
* To stimulate ethnomusicological work by established researchers.
* The establishment of a Jaap Kunst Award, which will be awarded at regular intervals to an outstanding musicologist. For this award the Governing Board will ask the advice of an international board of experts (Advisory Committee).

The initiative to start the foundation was taken after the commotion aroused by an article Een schat in een oude kantoorkast ('A treasure in an old cupboard') by Renée Heijnen, which appeared in the Dutch daily newspaper De Volkskrant (20 April, 1990). This article was rather critical of the way the University of Amsterdam dealt with the scientific heritage of Jaap Kunst, consisting of his personal books, documents, manuscripts, audio-recordings, photographs, slides, films, and especially his correspondence, consisting of more than ten thousand letters. The foundation cannot and does not want to get involved in the internal organizational problems of the University of Amsterdam. Its purpose is rather to promote the study of ethnomusicology, and, more specifically, the ideas of Jaap Kunst as one of the pioneers of the discipline.

The first public activity of the foundation took place on 3 October, 1991, to celebrate Jaap Kunst's 100th birthday in the Agnietenkapel at the University of Amsterdam. On this occasion Mantle Hood and Rembrandt Wolpert both delivered a speech. Mantle Hood is the most outstanding student of Jaap Kunst, and he has agreed to become honorary chairman of the foundation. In the afternoon the program was continued with a symposium. In the Etnomusicologisch Centrum Jaap Kunst, Department of Music, University of Amsterdam, the youngest great-granddaughter unveiled a bronze plaquette of Jaap Kunst.

The Governing Board is presently organizing the Jaap Kunst Award 1993. This award will be awarded every three years to an outstanding scholar in ethnomusicology. The recipient of the award should have shown her/his contributions to the field of ethnomusicology in international publications in the form of articles,
books, recordings and/or films. Candidates for the award should preferably not be more than 50 years old. The Board is open to suggestions by anybody. The decision on the award rests solely with the Board, after hearing recommendations given by an Advisory Committee. The Board’s decision will be announced in international journals. The Jaap Kunst Award will consist of:

- A bronze medal with the image of Jaap Kunst.
- A prize of - at present - 5000 Dutch guilders.
- The occupation of the Jaap Kunst Visiting Chair (wisselleerstoel) at the University of Amsterdam for a three-month (trimester) period. This period will in part be supported financially.

The Governing Board stimulates the compilation of a scientific and literary biography of Jaap Kunst in English. The first part should deal with his early years, and finish with the period in which he becomes fascinated by the gamelan in the kraton of Yogyakarta, Indonesia. This last experience was of decisive importance for Jaap Kunst’s life, and also for the study of the non-European music.

The address of the foundation is: Aalsmeerder Veerhuis, Sloterkade 21, 1058 HE Amsterdam, The Netherlands.

Photo: Two great men, in literal and figurative sense, in ethnomusicology: Arnold Bake (left) and Jaap Kunst (right). In between them stands Mrs. Gertrud Liebrich (‘Tante Gerti’), Basel, 1947.
The Dutch 'doctorandus' degree (Drs.) is equivalent to the English Master of Arts. Most theses were written in Dutch. Titles are translated into English.


This study is the result of Judit Meijer's interest in Arab music. She learned to play *darbuka* and used Moroccan informants in Amsterdam. The first chapter of her study gives a description of the percussion instruments used in Moroccan traditional music, with an emphasis on *darbuka*. She explains the playing technique of each instrument, the different possible beats and their notation. In the second chapter she presents the terminology with respect to rhythm in Moroccan traditional music. A few rhythmical patterns are transcribed, and their use in combination with song lines and dance is explained.

Fred Raps, *The Mikagura Uta; Ritual music of the Tenrikyo religion, Japan*, May 1990.

The Tenrikyo religion (which means 'religion of the divine wisdom') dates from about 150 years ago and has its centre and main church in Tenri. During the celebrations, Migakura Uta (songs of the celebration) are sung, accompanied by 9 musical instruments. Fred Raps took lessons in singing and playing the repertoire of the Mikagura Uta in a Tenrikyo mission post in Holland, and participated in the celebrations that took place there. Later on he went to Japan for his fieldwork.

In the first five chapters of his study Fred Raps deals with the history, the life of the founder, and the main doctrines of this religion. In the next chapter the daily celebration, which consists of music, poetry and dance, is described in a flowchart. The last chapter is dedicated to the analysis of the music of the Mikagura Uta repertoire, its melodies, rhythms and musical instruments.


Caught by the unique atmosphere of a Saramaka village (Surinam) and its rich music and folklore, Terry Agerkop started his research on this musical culture in 1975. This thesis is in part based on the experience and knowledge he gained on several trips to the region, where he documented the music. Further, on the drumming lessons he had during a period of six months.
The influence of language on the Saramaka drumming can be considered one of the major factors in creating the great diversity and richness of the art. A few characteristics of the use of particular features of Saramaka language that influenced drumming are discussed in the first part of this study, such as level intonation, rhythm and tonal inflections. In this way Saramaka drumming works as an extension of the natural human communication apparatus. Therefore, drumming may be used on many occasions of different character.

Also in this part Terry Agerkop gives a description of different Saramaka drums and their use, and an overview of drum ensembles. In the last part attention is paid to the art of drumming itself, and transcriptions of many different drumming patterns are given, also in combination with song lines.


Ronald Snijders was born in Surinam and lived there until 1970, when he moved to Holland. With this background of participation in the Creole culture of which the Kaseko dance music is part, he wrote this study. After the introductory chapter about the social history of Surinam, he continues with a detailed description of the great many musical styles that influenced Kaseko, such as Afro-Surinam music, Western-European and Pan-American music. In the next chapter Ronald Snijders describes the historical style periods of Kaseko, followed by a definition of Kaseko according to contemporary musicians.

The second part of his study is dedicated to the musical concept of Kaseko. He describes the repertoire, the instruments and their use, the song texts and dance patterns, together with the musical analysis and transcription of Kaseko rhythms and melodies. The use and function, cultural meaning and appreciation of Kaseko form the last chapter in his study.


The main question addressed in this study was: to what extent do Antillean and Aruban music groups in the Netherlands use Antillean music to keep up their cultural and social identity? The repertoire of these music groups was studied, and the weight of the typical Antillean music investigated. Two types of questionnaires were used: one for the total music group, and one for each member of the group. The results of these data are analysed, and a short history of Antillean and Aruban music in the Netherlands is given. Further, the concept 'poly-musicality', a typical feature of Antillean/Aruban music, is discussed.

The author concludes that the majority of the groups 'adjust' themselves to the
situation in the Netherlands, although they want to stick to their own Antillean/Antillean music. The greatest problem is that most groups are not very professional. The 'exotic' element in their music is not enough for success with a large public, and becoming part of the professional circuit. Hence the groups try to adjust themselves to the Dutch situation, in the meantime avoiding making too many concessions to their own culture, identity, and music.

Ethnomusicology and world music in the Netherlands 1990-1992
Report of the Nederlandse Vereniging voor Etnomusicologie
'Arnold Bake'

WIM VAN ZANTEN

The Nederlandse Vereniging voor Etnomusicologie 'Arnold Bake' was founded in December, 1984, and has operated as the Netherlands National Committee of the International Council for Traditional Music since 1986. Its aim is to provide a platform for scholarly exchange and discourse in the field of ethnomusicology. Membership has gradually increased over the last few years. In January 1992 there were 77 members. The society cooperates with the Department of Music at the University of Amsterdam in organizing lecture series.

Publications
In 1988 the society started a newsletter, the Ethnomusiciologen Nieuwsbrief. A directory of its members (Geannoteerde Ledenlijst), has been regularly published since December 1990. The new directory will, apart from information on the members (some publications, specializations, practical musical activities), also include the addresses of some relevant institutions in the Netherlands. In 1991 the General Meeting of the society decided to start a series ('yearbook') in English. The present issue of Oideion is the result.

In 1989 the journal Wereldmuziek was started by a special foundation. Unfortunately, this popular journal with articles and reviews, and the very useful monthly concert calendar, suddenly stopped appearing in January 1991, because it was no longer subsidized by the Dutch government.

The CHIME (Chinese Music Research in Europe) Foundation was founded in 1990. It is based in Leiden (P.O. Box 11092, 2301 EB Leiden), and publishes the biannual CHIME Newsletter. The foundation also started a documentation centre. It co-operates closely with the European Seminar in Ethnomusicology (ESEM).
World music and dance
The last few years have been characterized by the fast development of world music. Performances of music, dance and theatre from all over the world have attracted more people than ever before, especially in the Soeterijntheater (Tropenmuseum, Amsterdam) and RASA (Utrecht). In Amsterdam, the World Music School opened as a direct result of the activities of ISTAR Nederland (International Society for Traditional Arts Research, Netherlands). The program offers lessons in about all the different musical forms that may be found in our multicultural society. Other music schools (The Hague, Rotterdam, Utrecht, Enschede, Haarlem, Leiden) have also started paying more attention to 'ethnic' music.

In the Rotterdam Conservatory, the degree courses (HBO opleidingen) in flamenco, Indian music, and Latin-American music were combined in the Department of World Music, chaired by Joep Bor.

Conferences and symposia
The '11th European Conference on Modern South Asian Studies' was held in Amsterdam, 2-5 July, 1990. The panel on Performing Arts was chaired by Saskia Kersenboom and Joep Bor. There were many contributions to this interesting panel, including seven Dutch ones.

On 23-24 November, 1990, the Centrum voor Niet-Westerse Studies, Clara Brakel and Wim van Zanten organized a symposium on Asian Performing Arts in the Anthropological Museum, Leiden. This symposium took place during the International Puppet Festival, and included a performance of a south-Indian Yakshagana puppet theatre. Further, there were demonstrations of Chinese handpuppets and of south-Indian street theatre.

On 19-20 April, 1991, the Nederlandse Vereniging voor Etnomusicologie 'Arnold Bake' organized, together with the Rotterdam Conservatory (Department of World Music), a conference on Teaching World Music. Especially interesting were the presentations by the teachers in the Rotterdam Conservatory (Joep Bor, Wim van der Meer), and the teachers in music schools (Huib Schippers, Bert Bouquet), who explained the problems facing the teachers of music 'outside the cultural context'. One of the outcomes of the conference was that the need for good teaching materials became very clear: a good introduction to world music, instruments, and methods, with audio-visual material, for the practical mastering of singing or playing an instrument. Especially in the music schools, the teachers may be good musicians, but lack the necessary teaching experience and teaching materials.

On 16 May, 1992, the Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis (Society for the History of Dutch Music) invited our society to present papers on its symposium in the Municipal Museum, The Hague. Three members of our society presented fieldwork results: Peter Banning (harp playing in Venezuela), Jan
IJzermans (developing Zambian music theory), and Henrice Vonck (gender wayang, Bali, Indonesia).

On 20 May, 1992, the society, together with the Department of Music, University of Amsterdam, organized a symposium, Theory and Practice in Ethnomusicology, in Amsterdam. The topics of the presentations covered a whole range. One of the problems discussed was the typical Dutch division between the theoretical work (without hardly any attention given to practical music training) at the universities, and the practical training for professional musicians (without much attention to research) at the Conservatories (Hogere Beroepsopleidingen). This is often counter-productive. Another topic addressed was the training in methods and techniques of fieldwork. It was felt that ethnomusicology students were often ill-prepared for their fieldwork outside Europe, and that this should be improved. In particular, the topic of musical participation was discussed, and how this could be used for theoretical work.

On 5-6 June, 1992, the VKV (Vereniging voor Kunstzinnige Vorming) organized a symposium on Teaching World Music. Some speakers from other countries had been invited, such as Trevor Wiggins (Dartington College of Arts, U.K.) and George Ruckert (Ali Akbar School of Music, California, U.S.A.). It was odd that members of the Department of World Music staff, Rotterdam were not listed as speakers on this occasion. Much of the points raised confirmed the findings of the 1991 symposium of our society: a lack of teaching materials, methods for teaching, etcetera, for world music.
ABOUT THE AUTHORS

CLARA BRAKEL-PAPENHUYZEN
took her Ph.D. on the bedhaya dances of the courts of central Java at the University of Leiden in 1988. She researches into the performing arts of Asia, with special emphasis on Indonesia and India. Her current research interest is in the theatrical developments in Indonesia during the 19th and 20th century. She leads two Javanese theatre-dance groups based in the Netherlands, and organizes Asian performance events. Dr. Clara Brakel may be contacted at Prins Bernhardlaan 133, 2274 HW Voorburg, The Netherlands.

HANNE M. DE BRUIN
has trained as an Indologist, with a specialization in Tamil language and civilization. At present she is preparing her Ph.D. dissertation, which has as a working title The flexibility of a south Indian theatre tradition. She helps to coordinate the activities of an (evening) theatre school, established in 1991 in Kanchipuram, south India, where children and youth are trained in the Kaṭṭaiikkūṭṭu tradition. The school is run by professional Kaṭṭaiikkūṭṭu actors and musicians who have united themselves into a foundation to support and promote the theatre. Drs. Hanne de Bruin may be contacted at Juffrouw Idastraat 12, 2513 BG Den Haag, The Netherlands.

SIMON COOK
studied music at the universities of Cambridge, Amsterdam, and London. He has lived in Indonesia for five years, learning to play Javanese music in Yogyakarta, and Sundanese music in Bandung. He is researching the relationship between the tembang Sunda and gamelan repertoires. He also teaches music at the Bandung International School. Simon Cook may be contacted at Jalan Jongjolong 51, Bandung 40262, Indonesia.

MARJOLIJN VAN ROON
is a musician, conservatory-teacher, and student in musicology. She became interested in the historical development of Ethnomusicology when working in the Archives of Jaap Kunst from 1989 until 1992. Marjolijn van Roon may be contacted at 1e Lindendwarsstraat 163, 1015 LG Amsterdam, The Netherlands.

BOUDEWIJN WALRAVEN
wrote his Ph.D. thesis on the interpretation of Korean shaman songs and is currently doing research into the history of Korean shamanism. Dr. Boudewijn Walraven may be contacted at the Department of Languages and Cultures of Japan and Korea, University of Leiden, Arsenaalstraat 1, 2311 CT Leiden, The Netherlands.
CNWS PUBLICATIONS


All prices are excluding postage (Dfl. 5 per order). Purchasers from abroad pay an additional sum of Dfl. 10 to cover bank fees. Books plus invoices will be sent upon receipt of order.